Editor’s Message

My sincere gratitude goes to the Intellectbase International Consortium (IIC) program committee for their hard work in producing Volume 6, Issue 17. In addition, I want to thank all of the Reviewers’ Task Panel (RTP), Executive Editorial Board (EEB), Senior Advisory Board (SAB), and the Contributing & Managing Editors (CME) for their efforts, which has made IJAISL a successful and indexed academic Journal. They work hard to review, comment and format the various research papers to fulfill accreditation standards. The articles in this issue offer intellectual contributions and focus on the broadening of academic resources, a continuous development and exchange of ideas among global research professionals.

The IJAISL is an intellectually reviewed Journal of present-day research in quantitative accounting, information science and qualitative leadership practices. Examinations of empirical work in Accounting, Economics and Finance, Information Processing and Leadership which are useful for the understanding of their respective behaviors at regional and international levels are the core of this Journal.

The goal of the Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership (IJAISL) is to provide significant research materials to the business, government, and academic communities by helping to promote the interdisciplinary exchange of ideas on a global scale. IJAISL seeks international input in all aspects of the Journal, including content, authorship of papers, readership, paper reviews, and Executive Editorial Board Membership. We continue to look for individuals interested in becoming a reviewer for Intellectbase conference proceedings and Journals. Potential reviewers should send a self-nomination to the editor at IJAISL@intellectbase.org. Reviewers may also be asked to be part of the Executive Editorial Board (EEB) after they have established a positive record of reviewing articles in their discipline.

A COMMITMENT TO ACADEMIC EXCELLENCE

Articles published in the International Journal of Accounting Information Science & Leadership (IJAISL) have undergone rigorous blind review.

Intellectbase is one of the world’s leading publishers of high-quality multi-disciplinary research in both Academia and Industry. Intellectbase International Consortium has an unwavering commitment to providing methodical Journal content and presenting it in a comprehensible format.

In the areas of integrity and journalism excellence, Intellectbase maintains a high editorial standard. Intellectbase publications are based on the most current research information available and are reviewed by members of the Executive Editorial Board (EEB) and Reviewers’ Task Panel (RTP). When there is lack of research competence on a topic (technical or exploratory), together the EEB and RTP provide extensive feedback (based on what is known and accurate) to author(s).

For upcoming Intellectbase International Consortium (IIC) conferences, please visit the IIC website at:

www.intellectbase.org
Reviewers Task Panel and Executive Editorial Board

Dr. David White  
Roosevelt University, USA

Dr. Danka Radulovic  
University of Belgrade, Serbia

Dr. Sloan T. Letman, III  
American Intercontinental University, USA

Dr. Jiri Strouhal  
University of Economics-Prague, Czech Republic

Dr. Joel Jolayemi  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Xuefeng Wang  
Taiyun Normal University, China

Dr. Jeanne Kuhler  
Auburn University, USA

Dr. Babalola J. Ogunkola  
Olabisi Onabanjo University, Nigeria

Dr. Debra Shiflett  
American Intercontinental University, USA

Dr. Cheaseth Seng  
RMIT University, Australia

Dr. R. Ivan Blanco  
Texas State University – San Marcos, USA

Dr. Tahir Husain  
Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada

Dr. Jifu Wang  
University of Houston Victoria, USA

Dr. Janet Forney  
Piedmont College, USA

Dr. Adnan Bahour  
Zagazig University, Egypt

Dr. Rodney Davis  
Troy University, USA

Dr. Mohsen Naser-Tavakolian  
San Francisco State University, USA

Dr. Dennis Taylor  
RMIT University, Australia

Dr. Harrison C. Hartman  
University of Georgia, USA

Dr. Sushil Misra  
Concordia University, Canada

Dr. Avis Smith  
New York City College of Technology, USA

Dr. Smaragda Papadopoulou  
University of Ioannina, Greece

Dr. Burnette Hamil  
Mississippi State University, USA

Dr. Alejandro Flores Castro  
Universidad de Pacifico, Peru

Dr. Robert Robertson  
Southern Utah University, USA

Dr. Sonal Chawla  
Panjab University, India

Dr. Jianjun Yin  
Jackson State University, USA

Dr. Shikha Vyas-Doorgapersad  
North-West University, South Africa

Dr. James D. Williams  
Kutztown University, USA

Dr. Tehmina Khan  
RMIT University, Australia

Dr. Werner Heyns  
Savell Bird & Axon, UK

Dr. Mike Thomas  
Humboldt State University, USA

Dr. William Ebomoyi  
Chicago State University, USA

Dr. Joselina Cheng  
University of Central Oklahoma, USA
Reviewers Task Panel and Executive Editorial Board (Continued)

Dr. Mumbi Kariuki  
Nipissing University, Canada

Dr. Rafiuddin Ahmed  
James Cook University, Australia

Dr. Regina Schaefer  
University of La Verne, USA

Dr. Ademola Olatoye  
Olabisi Onabanjo University, Nigeria

Dr. Dana Tesone  
University of Central Florida, USA

Dr. Farhad Simyar  
Chicago State University, USA

Dr. John O'Shaughnessy  
San Francisco State University, USA

Dr. Stephen Kariuki  
Nipissing University, Canada

Dr. Rose Mary Newton  
University of Alabama, USA

Dr. Mahmoud Al-Dalahmeh  
University of Wollongong, Australia

Dr. Shahnawaz Muhammed  
Fayetteville State University, USA

Dr. Brett Sims  
Borough of Manhattan Community College, USA

Dr. Frank Tsui  
Southern Polytechnic State University, USA

Dr. John Tures  
LaGrange College, USA

Dr. Mary Montgomery  
Jacksonville State University, USA

Dr. Frank Cheng  
Central Michigan University, USA

Dr. Vera Lim Mei-Lin  
The University of Sydney, Australia

Dr. Khalid Alrawi  
Al-Ain University of Science and Technology, UAE

Dr. Natalie Housel  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Nitya Karmakar  
University of Western Sydney, Australia

Dr. Anita King  
University of South Alabama, USA

Dr. Lloyd V. Dempster  
Texas A & M University - Kingsville, USA

Dr. Bijesh Tolia  
Chicago State University, USA

Dr. John Elson  
National University, USA

Dr. Demi Chung  
University of Sydney, Australia

Dr. James (Jim) Robbins  
Trinity Washington University, USA

Dr. Jeffrey (Jeff) Kim  
University of Washington, USA

Dr. Dorothea Gaulden  
Sensible Solutions, USA

Dr. Gerald Marquis  
Tennessee State University, USA

Ms. Katherine Leslie  
American Intercontinental University, USA

Dr. David Davis  
The University of West Florida, USA

Dr. Peter Ross  
Mercer University, USA

Dr. Van Reidhead  
University of Texas-Pan American, USA

Dr. Denise Richardson  
Bluefield State College, USA
Reviewers Task Panel and Executive Editorial Board (Continued)

Dr. Robin Latimer  
Lamar University, USA

Ms. Alison Duggins  
American Intercontinental University, USA

Dr. Michael Alexander  
University of Arkansas at Monticello, USA

Dr. Kehinde Alebiosu  
Olabisi Onabanjo University, Nigeria

Dr. Gina Pipoli de Azambuja  
Universidad de Pacifico, Peru

Dr. Andy Ju An Wang  
Southern Polytechnic State University, USA

Dr. Edilberto Raynes  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Dobrivoje Radovanovic  
University of Belgrade, Serbia

Dr. George Romeo  
Rowan University, USA

Dr. William Root  
Augusta State University, USA

Dr. Natalie Weathers  
Philadelphia University, USA

Dr. Linwei Niu  
Clafin University, USA

Dr. Nesa L’Abbe Wu  
Eastern Michigan University, USA

Dr. Rena Elzey  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Kathleen Quinn  
Louisiana State University, USA

Dr. Josephine Ebomoyi  
Northwestern Memorial Hospital, USA

Dr. Douglas Main  
Eastern New Mexico University, USA

Dr. Reza Vaghefi  
University of North Florida, USA

Dr. Jeffrey Siekpe  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Greg Gibbs  
St. Bonaventure University, USA

Dr. Mike Rippy  
Troy University, USA

Dr. Steven Watts  
Pepperdine University, USA

Dr. Ada Anyamene  
Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Nigeria

Dr. Nancy Miller  
Governors State University, USA

Dr. David F. Summers  
University of Houston-Victoria, USA

Dr. Robert Kitahara  
Troy University – Southeast Region, USA

Dr. Brandon Hamilton  
Hamilton's Solutions, USA

Dr. William Cheng  
Troy University, USA

Dr. Taida Kelly  
Governors State University, USA

Dr. Denise de la Rosa  
Grand Valley State University, USA

Dr. Kimberly Johnson  
Auburn University Montgomery, USA

Dr. Sameer Vaidya  
Texas Wesleyan University, USA

Dr. Pamela Guimond  
Governors State University, USA

Dr. Vivian Kirby  
Kennesaw State University, USA
Reviewers Task Panel and Executive Editorial Board (Continued)

Dr. Sonya Webb  
Montgomery Public Schools, USA

Dr. Angela Williams  
Alabama A&M University, USA

Dr. Carolyn Spillers Jewell  
Fayetteville State University, USA

Dr. Kingsley Harbor  
Jacksonville State University, USA

Dr. Joan Popkin  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Chris Myers  
Texas A & M University – Commerce, USA

Dr. Kevin Barksdale  
Union University, USA

Dr. Michael Campbell  
Florida A&M University, USA

Dr. Thomas Griffin  
Nova Southeastern University, USA

Dr. James N. Holm  
University of Houston-Victoria, USA

Dr. Richard Dane Holt  
Veterans' Administration, USA

Dr. Rhonda Holt  
New Mexico Christian Children's Home, USA

Dr. Yu-Wen Huang  
Spalding University, USA

Dr. Christian V. Fugar  
Dillard University, USA

Dr. John M. Kagochi  
University of Houston-Victoria, USA

Dr. Yong-Gyo Lee  
University of Houston-Victoria, USA

Dr. George Mansour  
DeVry College of NY, USA

Dr. Randall Allen  
Southern Utah University, USA

Dr. Claudine Jaenichen  
Chapman University, USA

Dr. Richard Dane Holt  
Eastern New Mexico University, USA

Dr. Barbara-Leigh Tonelli  
Coastline Community College, USA

Dr. William J. Carnes  
Metropolitan State College of Denver, USA

Dr. Faith Anyachebelu  
Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Nigeria

Dr. Donna Cooner  
Colorado State University, USA

Dr. Kenton Fleming  
Southern Polytechnic State University, USA

Dr. Zoran Ilic  
University of Belgrade, Serbia

Dr. Edilberto A. Raynes  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Cerissa Stevenson  
Colorado State University, USA

Dr. Donna Stringer  
University of Houston-Victoria, USA

Dr. Lesley M. Mace  
Auburn University Montgomery, USA

Dr. Cynthia Summers  
University of Houston-Victoria, USA

Dr. Barbara-Leigh Tonelli  
Coastline Community College, USA

Dr. Rehana Whatley  
Oakwood University, USA

Dr. Venugopal Majur Shetty  
Multimedia University, Malaysia
Reviewers Task Panel and Executive Editorial Board (Continued)

Dr. Peter Miller  
Indiana Wesleyan University, USA

Dr. Ted Mitchell  
University of Nevada, USA

Dr. Alma Mintu-Wimsatt  
Texas A & M University – Commerce, USA

Dr. Liz Mulig  
University of Houston-Victoria, USA

Dr. Robert R. O'Connell Jr.  
JSA Healthcare Corporation, USA

Dr. P.N. Okorji  
Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Nigeria

Dr. James Elzy  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Padmini Banerjee  
Delaware State University, USA

Dr. Aditi Mitra  
University of Colorado, USA

Dr. Myna German  
Delaware State University, USA

Dr. Robin Oatis-Ballew  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Dirk C. Gibson  
University of New Mexico, USA

Dr. Susan McGrath-Champ  
University of Sydney, Australia

Dr. Bruce Thomas  
Athens State University, USA

Dr. William Seffens  
Clark Atlanta University, USA

Dr. Kathy Weldon  
Lamar University, USA

Dr. Shahram Amiri  
Stetson University, USA

Dr. Carolyn S. Payne  
Nova Southeastern University, USA

Dr. Veronica Paz  
Nova Southeastern University, USA

Dr. Terence Perkins  
Veterans’ Administration, USA

Dr. Sue-Jen Lin  
I-Shou University, China

Dr. Kong-Cheng Wong  
Governors State University, USA

Dr. Azene Zenebe  
Bowie State University, USA

Dr. Donn Bergman  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Yvonne Ellis  
Columbus State University, USA

Dr. Elizabeth Kunnu  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Brian A. Griffith  
Vanderbilt University, USA

Mr. Corey Teague  
Middle Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Joseph K. Mintah  
Azusa Pacific University, USA

Dr. Raymond R. Fletcher  
Virginia State University, USA

Dr. Yvette Bolen  
Athens State University, USA

Dr. Svetlana Peltsverger  
Southern Polytechnic State University, USA

Dr. Caroline Howard  
TUI University, USA

Dr. Philip H. Siegel  
Augusta State University, USA
Dr. Virgil Freeman  
Northwest Missouri State University, USA

Dr. Larry K. Bright  
University of South Dakota, USA

Dr. Barbara Mescher  
University of Sydney, Australia

Dr. Jennifer G. Bailey  
Bowie State University, USA

Dr. Julia Williams  
University of Minnesota Duluth, USA

Mr. Prawet Ueatrongchit  
University of the Thai Chamber of Commerce, Thailand

Dr. Stephen Szygenda  
Southern Methodist University, USA

Dr. Kiattisak Phongkusolchit  
University of Tennessee at Martin, USA

Dr. Reza Varjavand  
Saint Xavier University, USA

Dr. Stephynie C. Perkins  
University of North Florida, USA

Dr. Robert Robertson  
Saint Leo University, USA

Dr. Kim Riordan  
University of Minnesota Duluth, USA

Mrs. Patcharee Chantanabubpha  
University of the Thai Chamber of Commerce, Thailand

Dr. Neslon C. Modeste  
Tennessee State University, USA

Mr. Wayne Brown  
Florida Institute of Technology, USA

Dr. Tina Y. Cardenas  
Paine College, USA

Dr. Ramprasad Unni  
Portland State University, USA

Dr. William A. Brown  
Jackson State University, USA

Dr. M. N. Tripathi  
Xavier Institute of Management, India

Dr. Ronald De Vera Barredo  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Samir T. Ishak  
Grand Valley State University, USA

Dr. Stacie E. Putman-Yoquelet  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Curtis C. Howell  
Georgia Southwestern University, USA

Dr. E. Kevin Buell  
Augustana College, USA

Dr. Simon S. Mak  
Southern Methodist University, USA

Dr. Jay Sexton  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Katherine Smith  
Texas A&M University, USA

Dr. Michael D. Jones  
Kirkwood Community College, USA

Dr. Eileen J. Colon  
Western Carolina University, USA

Mr. Jeff Eyanson  
Azusa Pacific University, USA

Dr. Eleni Coukos Elder  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Brian Heshizer  
Georgia Southwestern University, USA

Dr. Thomas K. Vogel  
Stetson University, USA

Dr. Hisham M. Haddad  
Kennesaw State University, USA
Reviewers Task Panel and Executive Editorial Board (Continued)

Dr. Dev Prasad  
University of Massachusetts Lowell, USA

Dr. Murphy Smith  
Texas A&M University, USA

Dr. Jasmin Hyunju Kwon  
Middle Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Nan Chuan Chen  
Meiho Institute of Technology, China

Dr. Zufni Yehiya  
Tree Foundation - London, USA

Dr. Sandra Davis  
The University of West Florida, USA

Mrs. Donnette Bagot-Allen  
Judy Piece – Montserrat, USA

Dr. Ya You  
University of Central Florida, USA

Dr. Christopher Brown  
University of North Florida, USA

Dr. Yajni Warnapala  
Roger Williams University, USA

Dr. Brad Dobner  
Tennessee State University, USA

Dr. Ibrahim Kargbo  
Coppin State University, USA

The International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership (IJAISL) is published semi-annually by Intellectbase International Consortium (IIC). IJAISL provides a forum for academics, practitioners and decision-makers to advance their presumptions in diverse disciplines that have an international orientation. Articles emerging in this Journal do not necessarily represent the opinion of Intellectbase International Consortium (IIC) or any of the editors or reviewers. IJAISL is listed in Cabell’s Directory of Publishing Opportunities in Accounting, ProQuest, Ulrich’s Directory, ABDC and JournalSeek. In addition, IJAISL is in the process to be listed in the following databases: ABI Inform, CINAHL, EconLit new books, ACADEMIC JOURNALS DATABASE.
# TABLE OF CONTENT

**Empirical Study on Effects of Enterprise Governance on Organizational Performance**
Schehar Bano, Hasan Afzal and Naveed Akhtar ................................................................. 1

**Systematic Framework: Constructing a Causal Model of Job Fit, Affective Commitment, Employee Engagement, and Organizational Performance**
Kijpokin Kasemsap .................................................................................................................. 12

**Legal Awareness and Perceived Ethical Leadership of Educational Administrators in State Universities and Colleges (SUCs) in Region 3**
Robert P. Pena .......................................................................................................................... 24

**Leadership in HR-, Lean Implementation-, and Supply Chain Management Drove Cost Down During the “The Great Recession” of 2008**
Deborah Jablonski and Nesa L’abbé Wu .............................................................................. 36

**International Banking Industry and Corporate Social Responsibility**
Firuza S Madrakhimova ......................................................................................................... 45

**Whose Culture Has Leadership? Suggesting Leadership Capital to Yosso’s Model of Community Cultural Wealth**
JeeHae Helen Lee .................................................................................................................... 55

**An Alternative Approach for Those Who Despise Sales Role Playing**
David Allbright .......................................................................................................................... 89

**The Interplay Between Competitive Drivers, Outsourcing And Supply Chain Performance: The Case of Middle East Supply Chains**
Mario Ferrer V., Ricardo Santa. and Sara Ahmed Almadani .................................................. 107
EMPIRICAL STUDY ON EFFECTS OF ENTERPRISE GOVERNANCE ON ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE

Schehar Bano¹, Hasan Afzal² and Naveed Akhtar³
Preston University Islamabad¹, Pakistan, China², and UMT, Pakistan³

ABSTRACT

This study examined the effect of enterprise governance on the performance of companies. The systems offered by the world managing idea and practice demonstrate the apprehension for discovering solutions tailored to the lasting changes developing in the exterior environment or inside organizations. This paper examines the execution of enterprise governance concepts in growing economic system and its impact on the performance of organization. The purpose of the study is to confirm the responsiveness of significance of enterprise governance concepts in international market, especially in companies of adjusting financial systems where competition in modern international economy is more difficult. Data is collected from the corporate sector and sample is sorted through the random stratified sampling technique. The sample consists of the top management of corporate sector of Islamabad, Pakistan. Results show the strongly positive significant impact of enterprise governance on the organizational performance.

Keywords: Governance, Organizational Performance, Capacity, Corporate Governance

INTRODUCTION

Efficient enterprise governance has been determined to be critical to all economic dealings especially in growing and conversion financial systems (Dharwardkar et al., 2000). However, at different levels of organization relationships, market institutional conditions that reduce informative blemishes and assist in effective tracking of providers impinge on the overall performance of investment. Likewise, enterprise governance has believed the center stage for improved enterprise overall performance. Enterprise Governance is an appealing idea which is really a structure that protects both the enterprise governance and the control factors of enterprise governance of an enterprise. Enterprise governance views the whole picture to ensure that ideal objectives are arranged and good control is obtained. However, this is a large task as well as a large opportunity.
Much work has been carried out lately on enterprise governance. But the performance factors of governance have not obtained so much concentration. Enterprise governance that is connected tactically with performance analytics will enable companies to focus all their efforts and using their inner strong points on the key individuals that move their enterprise forward. There are some generally approved key concepts or elements of good governance that are appropriate to both the public and private areas. The three most common are: responsibility both inner and external; transparency/openness; and identification of stakeholder/shareholder privileges. Often to these are added: performance, reliability, stewardship, authority, and focus on performance as well as conformity, and stakeholder contribution or comprehensiveness.

At diverse times and in diverse organizations, different components will be given focus and it is always a matter of managing them. Indeed, there is unavoidable stress in trying to practice excellent governance rules. Illustrations of stress include between inner and exterior responsibility, responsibility and visibility, as well as performance and inclusiveness. More generally, stress are created between those who regulate and those who handle and part disputes will come into play - especially in the public industry, when members wear more than one hat. The advantages of focused possession are that it delivers more effective tracking of management and helps to get over organization problems. Enterprise governance has an actual effect on performance of an organization and growth. Therefore, one of the main difficulties experiencing policy creators is how to create a excellent enterprise governance structure which can protect the advantages associated with managing investors performing as direct watches, while at the same time, guaranteeing that they do not expropriate extreme leases at the price of other stakeholders. The scientific proof to date seems to recommend that this is indeed a problem and that protection of community investors is crucial to the growth of value marketplaces.

Therefore, policy makers in core systems require paying scrupulous attention to developing enterprise governance frameworks that will not prevent the development of active value markets. Enterprise governance covers the whole of governance such as the structure and relationships which manages, guides, or manages the performance of an enterprise, tasks, domain portfolios, facilities, procedures and aiming it with enterprise goals. The main purpose of the study is to ensure the optimization, responsiveness, variety and traceability through continuous tracking and modification for the process or step-by-step performance in the enterprise by guaranteeing the determinations to be made on conformance, performance and performance. Being intimately related apprehensions, governance, risk and conformity activities are increasingly being inenterprised and arranged to some extent to avoid disputes, inefficient overlaps and breaks.

While considered in a different way in various companies, it typically involves activities such as enterprise governance, enterprise danger management and enterprise conformity with appropriate rules. Responsiveness–leading and lagging signs allow for predictive and non-predictive research (supports Performance Based Logistics). Adaptability–indicators allow actions to be taken to modify responsively to changing requirements. Traceability–indicators
and value allow determinations to be made on conformance, performance as well as. Optimization–indicators allow continuous tracking and modification for process performance. "GRC is a, natural approach to organization-wide governance, danger and conformity guaranteeing that an organization functions legally correct and according to its danger appetite, internal policies and external rules through the positioning of plan, procedures, technology and people, thus improving effectiveness and performance”.

According to performance, enterprise governance rules establish obligations, discovery and visibility as one of the main concepts. Highlight is put on appropriate and accurate disclosure about financial circumstances, performance, possession and governance of the company. According to liability first and foremost governance of organizations shows interests of investors. In addition, enterprise governance concepts support the role of stakeholders too. This is in compliance to public liability behavior but organizations are still not ready enough to engage in culturally accountable policies. Companies should be accountable for its broader impact to society. Although, enterprise governance structure identifies the rights of stakeholders, there is still not frustrating evidence that an enterprise's stock price is affected by participation of public liability. One key factor of enhancing microeconomic performance is enterprise governance. Enterprise governance impacts the development and performing of capital markets and puts a strong impact on resource allowance. It effects upon the behavior as well as of companies, impressive activity, and enterprise. Enterprise governance which is previously seen as the base for good company performance has obtained lack-lustre attention from the enterprise bodies worldwide for a significant time period (Ejiofor, 2009).

This mind-set which outlined on ignore of enterprise strategies may have eventually led to the recent international well-known enterprise breakdowns. Bies (2004) asserts that the actual range of scams, embezzlement and graft seen in some of these unsuccessful governance enterprises has brought into question the stability and performance of present-day operational and conformity control procedure and financial confirming generally. Sheifer and Vishny (1997) claim that enterprise governance covenant with the ways in which providers of finance to organizations guarantee themselves of getting a return on the investment.

It is apprehensive with advertising enterprise equity, responsibility and visibility. Despite the fact that there are managing systems and organizations established to manage enterprise governance in company and ensure conformity with set down guidelines, yet the enterprise breakdowns have increased. The relationship between overall performance and enterprise governance shows the concern (however old) for pregnancy a system for managing the managing activities in order to allow the servicing, the protection or the building up of the shareholders’ passions. There are several situations when the administrator selects complicated techniques for the company, techniques that only he/ she is able to apply or he/she makes choices of investment strategies, the overall performance of which relies on his/ her existence. Considering all these factors, the enterprise governance allows the investors to perform an exigent control and to make the professionals search for ways of activities that are not likely to be approved.
LITERATURE REVIEW

Enterprise governance is an important factor in enhancing financial performance and development as well as enhancing trader assurance. Good enterprise governance must offer appropriate rewards for the entrepreneurs and management to engage in goals that are in the passions of enterprise. Its increases when energy of management tends to be a risk for entrepreneurs. Enterprise governance is a system by which enterprise organizations are instructed and controlled”, or as “all the enterprise systems, which have the impact of bounding the energy and of impacting the options of the professionals. In order terms, the systems “govern” their actions and determine their optional space” (Charreaux, 1997). More generally with respect to community, we could determine enterprise governance as a connection of an organization to community.

After so many scams in previous few years, enterprise governance began to be a device for finding intelligent from foolish options, i.e. “it is the framework that is designed to create sure that the right concerns get requested and that constraints are in place to create sure that the solutions indicate what is best for the development of long- phrase, maintainable value (Monks and Minow, 2004). Consequently, the possible disputes of passions between patrimony of the entrepreneurs and other stakeholders could appear. For that reason enterprise governance requirements deal with a number of architectural and actions components such as responsibility, investors and stakeholder privileges, disclosure and visibility, inner management and review.

Efficient enterprise governance is particularly essential during times of reorientation, i.e. in the early conversion interval. New owners and management has to decide upon a strategy of an enterprise. In conversion nations that means grand change in enterprise components, products solutions, behavior in handling. Thus reorientation has due to path-dependency long-term significances for the market and its competition (Klaus.E.Meyer, 2003). A great enhancement is recognized through some analysis in difference between code suggestions and enterprise governance requirements in practice. Most analysis has focused on a few key signs, particularly to freedom of administrators, board, review panel and visibility of payment. In general, enterprise’s governance framework is progressively considered very essential not only from the investors and stakeholders’ side but also from the public, ecological and moral factors, especially after so many scams in previous few years.

Although there are respectively growing literary works connecting enterprise governance and enterprises performance, there is also a variety of results which could be described by variations in analysis nearing to some crucial factors, i.e. characteristics of enterprise, performance dimension development, technique, framework of forums etc. Despite that, common results suggest that enterprise governance has an oblique effect on enterprises’ performance. (Zahra and Pearce, 1989; Maassen,1999). There are many factors, inner and exterior, which have impact on enterprise performance. The exterior consult type of market, regulation, financial and bookkeeping system develop of capital market, stakeholders,
governance view and from the factors of adjusting nations, some public history from the past interval.

The inner consult company handling issues, kind of boards- two ore one levels, framework of forums, their knowledge, implemented guidelines, and from viewpoint of conversion country and enterprise performance they are many privatization’s omissions which has impact on behavior of administrators, freedom of Managing and Supervisory Panel, etc. Studies done by Dalton and Daily (1999) determine that there is no clear proof of a purposeful relationship between board structure and financial performance, regardless of the kind of performance signs, the size of the company or the manner in which board framework is calculated. Performance dimension is connected with enterprise governance and is the product of a given community, as Pesqueux (2004) says it is a “production of a public game which has to be understood”. Performance dimension and assessment systems are being modified similar at the same time with modern improvements of market economic system. In such conditions experienced with the concepts of new public era of capitalism growing nations have to modify their mind-set and behavior.

Osisioma and Osisioma (2002) determine a well –governed organization as one that had mostly outside administrators, who had no control connections, started official assessment of its administrators, and was aware of investor’s needs for information on governance problems. Ile (2002) claimed that organizations with more independent boards do not perform better than other organizations. It is unlikely that panel structure has a direct impact on firm performance. Tricker (1994) classified the part of the administrators into two main functions: the performance and conformance features. In the performance function, the administrators focus on strategic and policy problems for the future.

This involves establishing enterprise route and causing the ongoing performance of the enterprise. In the conformance part, the panel manages senior control, guaranteeing that the organization stick to the pre-specified guidelines, procedures, plans or budgets and is achieving the performance required, as well as indicating proper responsibility for the enterprise’s activities. The potency of any panel is shown on how well the panel performs its performance and conformance part (Rweggasira, 2003). He also listed the responsibilities of the panel as establishing enterprise strategy – overall route, vision and mission, hiring and shooting the boss and top control, controlling, tracking, managing control and protecting shareholders’ interests. Okeahalam and Akinboade (2003) claimed that the panel of administrators provides rules, guidelines and route for the company's personnel. They see the home or an organization as a handler and trustee of the enterprise’s sources and property. The board as a control procedure performs an important part in enterprise governance, particularly in tracking and guiding management for the accomplishment of enterprise objectives which usually contains promoting growth through ideal plan effort, including value to shareholding, profit maximization, aiming the passions of stakeholders, increasing enterprise etc. In doing this, they direct the matters of the company by establishing the factors and guaranteeing the company is well run. However, in practice, the forums differ significantly in the focus they place.
on different elements of their governance part. While some play big part in strategy development and plan making, others leave the liability to us president and focus on tracking and managing the professional.

Ugo (2010) claimed that the issue of inadequate enterprise governance standard in Nigeria can be found in inadequate administration. Eroke (2007) mentioned the Investments and Exchange Percentage study report (2003), which exposed that enterprise governance, was at general stage with only 40 percent of estimated companies having code of enterprise governance in place. (1) There is a relationship between enterprise governance and the performance of enterprise governance regulating organizations. The connotation is that the regulating organizations are performing well. Thus the issue can be found on the recalcitrant nature of the management of the governance enterprises who fight stick to the lay down rules. If at the end of the day, enterprise governance has no impact on performance, then it is not clear why policy creators should concern themselves with this subject. There are a number of potential programs of impact through which governance can impact performance. For example, these variations are associated not only with the degree of tracking and management which owners exercise, but also with the rewards they provide for investment, advancement, and enterprise activity.

Enterprise governance does impact performance and is thus an important structure condition for the commercial competition. It is widely recommended that good enterprise governance increases a company's performance. Despite the generally approved idea that effective enterprise governance increases company performance, other studies have revealed negative connection between enterprise governance and company performance (Bathala and Rao, 1995; Hutchinson, 2002) or have not found any connection. To address some of these problems, it is suggested that a look at enterprise governance and its connection with company performance should take a multivariate approach. The present research contributes to the literary works by employing both market centered and bookkeeping centered performance measures such as return on resources and Tobin’s q and test the connection between them and selected governance factors. In addition to panel features, we also include panel activity strength as well as review panel methods and features and institutional shareholding as an extended arm of governance. We merge study and openly available governance data to extend the opportunity of governance factors. More attractive emphasize of both country and industry specific size of governance as well as in the research.
H1: Enterprise governance has positive impact on organizational performance

**RESEARCH FRAMEWORK**

**IV**

**ENTERPRISE GOVERNANCE**

**H1**

**ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE**
- RESOURCE UTILIZATION
- VALUE CREATION

**H2**

**ORGANIZATIONAL CAPACITY**
- LEADERSHIP
- RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT

**MODERATOR**

**CORPORATE GOVERNANCE**
- ACCOUNTABILITY
- ASSURANCE

**BUSINESS GOVERNANCE**
- RESOURCE UTILIZATION
- VALUE CREATION

**METHODODOLOGY**

**Research Design**

The method adopted for this study is in relation to the factors which are contributory and plays their role in maintaining the governance. Research design of this study consists of the details about the targeted population, sample and measuring scale. The statistical tools and techniques used to analyze the data from the selected sample represent the relationship among the variables and trends of variation in them.

**Population, Sample & Respondents**

The targeted population is of major corporate sector of Pakistan. Sample selected from the population consists of 250 respondents. Sample consists of top line personnel at managerial positions. The respondents are in the age range from 40 to 55 years and minimum qualification is Masters with work experience not less than 15 year.

**Instrument & Measure**

Data collection is done through the structured questionnaire which is comprised of two sections. The first section is about the personal information and second section consists of details related to variables under study and their sub constructs. Questionnaire is adapted and taken from the studies of previous researchers. Some of the elements are adjusted according to the requirement. Items of questionnaire are measured against 5 point Likert scale. The questionnaire used for data collection is self-explanatory. Data collected from the respondents is analyzed through the SPSS.
RESULTS AND FINDINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paths</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>C.R.</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>Label</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OC &lt;--- EG</td>
<td>.845</td>
<td>.057</td>
<td>21.412</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BG &lt;--- EG</td>
<td>.934</td>
<td>.021</td>
<td>19.241</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CG &lt;--- EG</td>
<td>.998</td>
<td>.038</td>
<td>34.600</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OP &lt;--- OC</td>
<td>.816</td>
<td>.028</td>
<td>22.416</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results in the above table demonstrate the relationship among the variables stated above in the table. The variables include enterprise governance, enterprise governance, enterprise governance, organizational capacity, and organizational performance. The relationships are explained in terms of different tests.

The above table depicts that the beta estimates of OC and EG are .845 which shows that there is relationship exists in the two variables. It is clear from the table if there is one degree change in organizational capacity there would be 84.5% change in enterprise governance. The beta results explain that there is relationship exists. The p-value of explain that relationship is significant as the p-value is P<.05.

The table further illustrates that there is positive relationship between enterprise governance and enterprise governance. The relationship between the two variables shows the relationship with beta estimates of .934. The results portray that if there is one degree change in enterprise governance there would be 93.4% change in enterprise governance.

The beta results of enterprise governance and enterprise governance are .998 which shows that there is relationship exists between the two variables. The results indicate that if there is change in enterprise governance there will be some change in enterprise governance. The results in the table demonstrate that if there is one degree change in enterprise governance there would be 99.8% change in enterprise governance. The p-value of the two variables explains that the relationship is significant.

The above table further represents that the beta estimates of organizational performance and organizational capacity are .816 which shows that there is relationship exists in the two variables. It is obvious from the table if there is one degree change in organizational performance there would be 81.6% change in organizational capacity. The beta results explain that there is relationship exists. The p-value of explain that relationship is significant as the p-value is P<.05.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chi</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig</th>
<th>Chi/Df</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>AGFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>NFI</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>50.8527</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>90.170</td>
<td>.931</td>
<td>.921</td>
<td>.901</td>
<td>.915</td>
<td>.0436</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results in the above table demonstrate the model fitness index. It is used for the acceptability of model. The significant value of is (P<.05) indicates that there are discrepancies
in the model as it does not fulfill the minimum requirement for p value. The related chi-Square value is also greater than 2 as recommended by (Tabachnick and Fidell, 2007) to as low as 2.0 (Wheaton et al, 1977) as high as 5.0. Another model fitness measure is goodness of Fit index is also acceptable. The minimum acceptance level for goodness of Fit index is equal to or greater .90 is acceptable (Schumacker and Lomax, 2004). This criteria fulfill the minimum acceptance level of Model Fit (GFI>.90) and AGFI is alternative of goodness of fit which adjusted goodness of Fit index for degree of independence. The recommended value for NFI and CFI is equal or greater .90 Hooper et al (2008). RMSEA (Root Mean Square error of approximation) informed about optimally selected constraints would fit the population co-variance Matrix (Byrne, 1998). According to MacCallum et al., 1996) RMSEA value under .08 show good fit of the model.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Discussing about the concept and the exercise in the field of the enterprise governance was targeted at featuring an essential feature for the enterprise management and for the financial performance. On the basis of the findings authorized by now, the fact that we will not be able to talk is obvious, at least not for years, about a worldwide program that could assist in the excellent performance of the enterprise. Provided that the capital goes to various geographical areas, the governance techniques will adjust according to the local rules and they will probably be less connected to the social aspect. Within companies, enterprise governance enforces a framework on stake-holder connections that has the potential to task the ability and desire of professionals and workers to fully make themselves to each other and to the company and its goals.

There is no single model of excellent enterprise governance, and both core and outsider techniques have their strong points, flaws, and different financial significances. Furthermore, the potency of different enterprise governance techniques is affected by variations in countries’ legal and regulating frameworks, and traditional and social factors, in addition to the framework of product and aspect markets. Enterprise governance systems and their efficiency also differ
based on industry areas and type of effective activity. For example, in areas classified by great resource uniqueness (such as many high-tech industries), tracking is more challenging and different systems may be required in order to improve firm performance. Determining what comprises excellent enterprise governance exercise, and under what conditions, is a trial. The task, therefore, is not only to recognize the pros and cons in each individual program or group of techniques, but also to recognize what are the actual conditions upon which these pros and cons rely.

Enterprise governance performs a key role in a recent time and is a subject of a number of many studies because of responsibility which enterprises have to take to their stakeholders. This paper focus on the increased importance governance issues have accomplished around the world. The restored focus on governance symbolizes a new task to policymakers and enterprise management in growing marketplaces and conversion economical systems. Hence, this document provides a systematic perspective for understanding how enterprise governance is applied and how can company performance impact economic growth in conversion country. It is to be mentioned that globalization of marketplaces has brought some participation to managing of requirements that industry encourage, and therefore reduce variations in perspective of governance execution which exist among advanced and growing industry economical systems.

However, sociological and social variations in growing economical systems, moreover to many others (economy development, knowledge) are still restricting factors in extensive approach, especially when compared to developed economical systems. Companies, which have applied enterprise governance concepts, have successful performance. It is hard to measure the level to which board and other enterprise signs play a role in performance of each company. In inclusion, quantitative effects of some other factors to be considered are significant. Through economical signs, which show increasing propensity in enterprises which apply governance concepts is verified a positive impact of enterprise governance to company's performance? The value of enterprise governance cannot be over-emphasized since it comprises the enterprise environment for the inner activities of a company. Enterprise governance brings new perspective and increases a company's enterprise competition.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

Policy suggestions should attempt to account for the relationships between enterprise governance and the institutional structure in the particular country. The search for sound practice should be based on an recognition of what works in described nations, to identify what wide concepts can be resulting from these encounters, and to analyze the circumstances for transferability of these methods to other nations. Governance should sanction any governance organization that isn't able to stick to the enterprise government requirements in power. Such sanction could include refusal of finance, short-term close down, lay off of defaulting authorities and concealing of incomes of defaulting authorities. Full independence should be permitted to governance enterprises so that they could perform better. Enterprise governance regulating
organizations should release their responsibilities without worry or benefit. They should avoid all types of gratifications and provide a purpose review on enterprise governance

REFERENCES

Denise Vu Broady, Holly A. Roland, “The ABCs of GRC” *SAP GRC For Dummies*, http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=1Vi35vE6c1IC&pg=PA9
SYSTEMATIC FRAMEWORK: CONSTRUCTING A CAUSAL MODEL OF JOB FIT, AFFECTIVE COMMITMENT, EMPLOYEE ENGAGEMENT, AND ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE

Kijpokin Kasemsap
Suan Sunandha Rajabhat University, Thailand

ABSTRACT

Research objectives were to determine the systematic framework and to construct the causal model of job fit, affective commitment, employee engagement, and organizational performance of plastic plant employees in Thailand. The study reported the responses of 625 operational employees from 157 plastic plants operating in different parts of Thailand. Data were analyzed with descriptive statistics using SPSS (version 11.5) and assessed with confirmatory factor analysis to confirm the heterogeneity of all constructs and path analysis to test the cause and effect relationships among main constructs of the study using LISREL (version 8) on a structured questionnaire containing standard scales of job fit, affective commitment, employee engagement, and organizational performance to determine the relationships of job fit, affective commitment, employee engagement, and organizational performance, besides some demographic details like age, education, and tenure with the organization. Job fit was assessed using the Person-Organization Fit Scale (POFS) developed by Resick, Baltes, and Shantz (2007). Affective commitment was measured using the Affective Commitment Scale (ACS) developed by Allen and Meyer (1990). Employee engagement was measured using Utrecht Work Engagement Scale (UWES 9) developed by Schaufeli, Bakker, and Van Rhenen (2006). Organizational performance was assessed using the questionnaire developed by Delaney and Huselid (1996). Research findings indicated that dimensions of job fit, affective commitment, and employee engagement have moderated the positive effects on organizational performance. Furthermore, employee engagement fully mediates the relationships between job fit and organizational performance and between affective commitment and organizational performance.

Keywords: Affective Commitment, Causal Model, Employee Engagement, Job Fit, Organizational Performance.
INTRODUCTION

Organizations are focusing on employee engagement as a promising strategy to increase retention and improve productivity (Lockwood, 2007). When employees are effectively engaged in their job duties and tasks, they help the organization to achieve the higher order effectiveness and performance (Golparvar & Javadian, in press). Employee engagement is inclusive of long-term emotional involvement and is an antecedent to more temporary generalities of employee sentiment, such as job satisfaction and commitment (Wagner & Harter, 2006). Engaged employees come to work every day feeling a connection to their organization, have a high level of enthusiasm for their work (Buckingham & Coffman, 1999), and consistently produce at high levels (Meere, 2005). Having a higher proportion of engaged employees in an organization has been shown to have a positive relationship with a company’s profit margin (Fleming & Asplund, 2007; Ketter, 2008; Wagner & Harter, 2006). Organizations recognize the need for employees who are proactive, work well with others, and work toward the success of their organizations (Bakker & Schaufeli, 2008). Organizations need engaged employees (Bakker & Schaufeli, 2008) and they are looking for ways to develop such a workforce. Engagement is defined as positive work-related state of mind that is characterized by vigor, dedication, and absorption (Bakker & Demerouti, 2009; Schaufeli & Salanova, 2007). Bakker and Leiter (2010) proposed that the crossover of engagement among members of a work team could enhance performance. Thus, focusing on the drivers of employee engagement can provide the practitioners with the tool to cultivate engaged employees for better team and organizational performance (Bakker & Leiter, 2010). Schaufeli, Salanova, Gonzalez-Roma, and Bakker (2002) defined work engagement as a positive, fulfilling, work related state of mind that is characterized by vigor, dedication, and absorption. Rather than a momentary and specific state, engagement refers to a more persistent and pervasive affective cognitive state that is not focused on any particular object, event, individual, or behavior.

According to Schaufeli et al. (2002), employee engagement has three dimensions, namely vigor, dedication, and absorption. Vigor is characterized by high levels of energy and mental resilience while working, the willingness to invest effort in one’s work, and persistence even in the face of difficulties. Dedication refers to being strongly involved in one’s work and experiencing a sense of significance, enthusiasm, inspiration, pride, and challenge. Absorption is characterized by being fully concentrated and happily engrossed in one’s work, whereby time passes quickly and one has difficulties with detaching oneself from work (Schaufeli et al., 2002). Job fit is defined as the degree to which a person feels their personality and values fit with their current job (Resick, Baltes, & Shantz, 2007). Good job fit has been shown to promote a sense of belonging resulting in professional alignment with interests and values (Kahn, 1990; Saks, 2006) and is shown to significantly affect the development of job-related attitudes such as employee engagement (Resick et al., 2007). Affective commitment is defined as a sense of belonging and emotional connection with one’s job, organization, or (Rhoades, Eisenberger, & Armeli, 2001). Such an emotional connection is thought to be a prior condition for the development of employee engagement (Kahn, 1992; Saks, 2006). An employee’s interpretation of their work is thought to be related to the development of employee engagement (Macey & Schneider, 2008; Saks, 2006). Job fit and affective commitment has
implications for organizational competitiveness and productivity (Brown & Leigh, 1996; Kahn, 1990; Pfeffer, 1998). Job fit has been shown to be related to employee attitudes and behaviors and is strongly related to job satisfaction and organizational commitment (Resick et al., 2007). Employees who have good job fit feel strongly that they belong and as a result experience professional congruence with their organization. For example, an employee with high levels of job fit would agree that the demand of his or her job (i.e., stress levels, autonomy in decision making, and professional ethics) allows them to work within a level of emotional and physical comfort and that his or her personal values match those of the job role. This fit influences employees to derive a sense of psychological meaningfulness from their work (Kahn, 1992).

Resick et al. (2007) suggested psychological characteristics of the job, such as job fit, are salient cues used when an employee is developing job-related attitudes that ultimately affect performance. One such job-related attitude is employee engagement. Researchers who study job fit (Hoffman & Woehr, 2006; Resick et al., 2007; Verquer, Beehr, & Wagner, 2003) suggested good job fit provides opportunities for employees to be involved in individually meaningful work (Cartwright & Holmes, 2006; Kahn, 1990). Meaningful work effects the development of work-related attitudes (Hoffman and Woehr, 2006; Resick et al., 2007; Verquer et al, 2003). Based on their work experiences, employees develop job-related attitudes based on their job fit, which in turn effect commitment, performance, and intention to turnover (Cable & Judge, 1996; Caplan, 1987; Judge & Cable, 1997; Verquer et al, 2003). Research has further shown task demands of the job are salient cues used in the development of job-related attitudes (Resick et al., 2007). Good job fit provides the cognitive stimulus for employees to engage in behavior toward organizational outcomes (Hoffman & Woehr, 2006). Employees who experience good job fit derive a degree of psychological meaningfulness from their work (Kahn, 1990; Resick et al., 2007). Employees who experience job fit within their work roles are more likely to perform their jobs with enthusiasm and energy and be engaged in their work. Expectations about an employee’s individual perception of his or her fit are more likely to effect individual reactions and work-related attitudes such as his or her engagement levels (Cable & Judge, 1996; Caplan, 1987; Judge & Cable, 1997; Verquer et al, 2003). The important role job fit plays in the development of job-related attitudes such as employee engagement. Job fit is an important facet to many important organizational outcomes (Kristof-Brown, Zimmerman, & Johnson, 2005) and provides a context for understanding how the work environment influences various aspects of employee attitudes and behaviors. According to the results of their study, job fit is an important antecedent in the development of overall workplace-related attitudes and behaviors (Kristof-Brown et al., 2005) and lack of proper job fit can result in employees disengaging from work based on diminishing levels of meaningfulness, safety, and/or availability as originally conceptualized by Kahn (1990).

Similar to other studies of job fit (Hoffman & Woehr, 2006; Kristof-Brown et al., 2005; Verquer et al., 2003), results indicate an employee’s perception of fit is an important determinant in the development of work-related attitudes (Resick et al., 2007), ultimately effecting productivity and turnover. Poor job fit results in decreased productivity (Hoffman & Woehr, 2006; Kristof-Brown et al., 2005; Verquer et al., 2003), decreased satisfaction (Kristof-Brown et al., 2005) and
increased levels of turnover (Kristof-Brown et al., 2005; Resick et al., 2007; Verquer et al., 2003). Good job fit provides opportunities for meaningful work to develop as well as the creation of environments where employees feel psychologically and emotionally safe and available (Kahn, 1990; May, Gilson, & Harter, 2004) and, is connected to the development of employee engagement (Kahn, 1992). An employee’s emotional bond with his or her organization has been considered an important determinant of commitment and loyalty (Rhoades et al., 2001). Employees who are affectively committed increase their involvement in the organization’s activities (Rhoades et al., 2001). Affectively committed employees derive a sense of importance (Kahn, 1990) from their work and feel emotionally and psychologically safe to engage in work (Kahn, 1990; Rhoades et al., 2001). Consequently, affectively committed employees have been shown to be more productive, less physically absent, and less likely to turnover (Mathieu & Zajac, 1990; Meyer & Allen, 1997). Affective commitment has been conceptualized as having a strong relation to employee engagement (Robinson, Perryman, & Hayday, 2004). An employee’s affective bond with their organization has been considered an important determination of dedication, loyalty, and satisfaction (Rhoades et al., 2001).

Effective commitment emphasizes the emotional connection and closely parallels the emotive qualities of engagement (Macey & Schneider 2008; Saks, 2006), including such conditions as meaningfulness and safety (Kahn, 1990). Research has suggested a relationship between affective commitment and work-oriented antecedent variables such as rewards and recognition, procedural justice, and supervisor support (Rhoades et al., 2001; Saks, 2006), as well as outcome variables such as absenteeism, performance, and turnover (Mathieu & Zajac, 1990; Meyer & Allen, 1997; Mowday, Porter, & Steers, 1982; Rhoades et al., 2001). Such qualities can motivate employees to willingly engage in extra-in role behavior toward desired organizational outcomes that emphasize the emotional fulfillment that employees experience as a result of being engaged (Fredrickson, 1998; Kahn, 1990). Employees who are affectively committed feel a greater sense of belonging, increasing willingness to pursue organizational goals and be involved in discretionary effort (Allen & Meyer, 1990; Mowday et al., 1982; Rhoades et al., 2001). The perception of support, such as the type of support an employee might find in a positive psychological climate or in a supervisor they enjoy working with, affects an employee’s overall experience of work (Brown & Leigh, 1996) and that an employee’s interpretation of their work experience mediated by levels of affective commitment has the important consequences for outcomes in the workplace such as an employee’s intention to turnover (Rhoades et al., 2001). Further, results suggested affective commitment is an important facet of an employee’s experience and interpretation of their work directly related to meaningfulness, safety, and availability (Kahn 1990; May et al., 2004) as well as to the development of work-related attitudes and behaviors (Rhoades et al., 2001) such as an employee’s level of engagement.

**METHODOLOGY**

Data of this study were collected from 625 operational employees from 69,102 operational employees working in the 157 plastic plants in Thailand by using Yamane’s formula (Yamane,
1970) for a 96% confidence level with a 4% margin of error by the proportional random sampling method. Data were analyzed with descriptive statistics using SPSS (version 11.5) and assessed with confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) to confirm the heterogeneity of all constructs and path analysis (Joreskog & Sorbom, 1993) to detect the cause-effect relationships among various dimensions of main constructs of the study using LISREL (version 8) on a structured questionnaire containing standard scales of job fit, affective commitment, employee engagement, and organizational performance, besides some demographic details like age, education, and tenure with the organization. Job fit was assessed using the Person-Organization Fit Scale (POFS) developed by Resick, Baltes, and Shantz (2007). The POFS was a five-item scale where participants responded along a five-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (strongly agree) to 5 (strongly disagree). The POFS measures the degree to which a person feels his or her personality and values fit with his or her current organization. Affective commitment was measured using the Affective Commitment Scale (ACS) developed by Allen and Meyer (1990) using a seven-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (strongly disagree) to 7 (strongly agree). Employee engagement was measured using a nine-item scale of Utrecht Work Engagement Scale (UWES 9) developed by Schaufeli, Bakker, and Van Rhenen (2006) comprising of three dimensions, namely vigor (three items:, i.e., “At my work, I feel bursting with energy”), dedication (three items:, i.e., “I am enthusiastic about my job”) and absorption (three items:, i.e., “I am immersed in my work”) using a seven-point Likert scale ranging from 0 (never) to 6 (always/everyday). Organizational performance was assessed using the questionnaire using a seven-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (strongly disagree) to 7 (strongly agree) developed by Delaney and Huselid (1996) with 25 items of measuring seven elements of product or service quality, product or service innovation, employee attraction, employee retention, customer satisfaction, management and employee relation, and employee relations.

RESEARCH RESULTS

Systematic framework and causal model were constructed. Research findings indicated that dimensions of job fit, affective commitment, and employee engagement have moderated the positive effects on organizational performance. Furthermore, employee engagement fully mediates the relationships between job fit and organizational performance and between affective commitment and organizational performance.
Figure 1: Systematic Framework

Key JF = Job Fit, AC = Affective Commitment, EE = Employee Engagement, OP = Organizational Performance, PSQ = Product or Service Quality, PSI = Product or Service Innovation, EAT = Employee Attraction, ERT = Employee Retention, CSF = Customer Satisfaction, MER = Management and Employee Relation, ERL = Employee Relations

ANALYSIS & DISCUSSION

Regarding the systematic framework, there are lots of researchers studying about the relationships of job fit, affective commitment, employee engagement, and organizational performance in a wide variety of fields. The systematic framework was positively compatible with the following research findings. Job fit, affective commitment, and employee engagement are closely linked to organizational performance. Organizations recognize the need for employees who are proactive, work well with others, and work toward the success of their organizations (Bakker & Schaufeli, 2008). Organizations need engaged employees (Bakker & Schaufeli, 2008) and they are looking for ways to develop such a workforce. Employees who experienced a high degree of job fit were more likely to be engaged. This finding is consistent with previous research on job fit and its relation to the development of employee attitudes and behaviors (Bakker & Demerouti, 2008; Resick et al., 2007). When employees experience poor job fit, the physical, emotional, and social discomfort resulting from poor fit can be overwhelming for employees (Bakker & Demerouti, 2008). When overwhelmed by their experiences of work, employees perceive their job as less meaningful, safe, and lacking the resources for the completion of work (Kahn, 1992). Consequently, employee engagement is less likely to develop. Saks (2006) suggested that good job fit provides incentive for employees to bring more of themselves into their work, which leads to higher levels of engagement. This finding is consistent with Macey, Schneider, Barbera, and Young (2009) who further suggested that for engagement to develop, employees must have the capacity in their role to engage.
Capacity is developed from feeling competent and autonomous, understanding one’s job role, and having a high degree of fit between an employee and their specific job responsibilities (Macey et al., 2009). The perceived fit of one’s job role, the balance of work-role demands, and the development of employee behavior share a significant relation to the development of employee engagement (Resick et al., 2007). Employees who had a high degree of affective commitment to the organization at which they work were more likely to be engaged. This finding is consistent with previous studies (Mathieu & Zajac, 1990; Meyer & Allen, 1997; Rhoades et al., 2007) on affective commitment and the development of employee sentiment and behavior. Recent models of employee engagement (Macey & Schneider, 2008; Macey et al., 2009; Zigarmi, Nimon, Houson, Witt, & Diehl, 2009) have discussed the affective component of employee engagement in some details. An employee’s affective bond with their workplace fulfills a belonging and acceptance need that leads to displays of engaging behaviors (Macey & Schneider, 2008; Macey et al., 2009). Fulfilling these needs parallels the condition of meaningfulness (Kahn, 1990). Employee engagement is a reciprocal process based on social norms, not motivated by an emotive state (Macey et al., 2009). Saks (2006) acknowledged the role emotions play in the development of engaging behaviors through his definition of the concept. Engagement in work is an act of reciprocity rather than a state of being (Saks, 2006).

**LIMITATIONS**

The author indicates some limitations in this study and suggests possible directions for future research. The low return rate of the survey is still noted as a potential limitation in this study. Future research can benefit from a larger sample to bring more statistical power and a higher degree of representation. This study was done by empirically investigating Thai firms. Potential cultural limitation should be noted and it is suggested that future research be done in different cultural contexts to generalize or modify the concepts. The results of this study suggest that employee engagement is a meaningful construct that is worthy of future research. There are several aspects to consider. One area would be to investigate other potential predictors of job and organization engagement. The present study included a number of factors associated with Kahn’s (1990, 1992). However, there are other variables that might also be important for both job and organization engagement. For example, human resource practices such as flexible work arrangements, training programs, and incentive compensation might also be important for engagement. Future research could include a broader range of predictors that are linked to particular types of role engagement. Future research might also consider individual difference variables that might predict employee engagement. Several personality variables including hardiness, self-esteem, and locus of control are related to burnout and might also be important for engagement (Maslach, Schaufeli, & Leiter, 2001). Self-efficacy has also been recognized as an important factor in burnout and engagement (Maslach et al., 2001). There is also some evidence that individuals with a strong exchange ideology are more likely to feel obliged to reciprocate a benefit (Cropanzano & Mitchell, 2005).

Thus, the relationship between antecedents and engagement might be stronger for individuals with a strong exchange ideology. Future research might test the moderating effects of
exchange ideology for the relationship between antecedents and engagement. Furthermore, this study mainly concerns the effects of job fit and affective commitment on employee engagement and organizational performance. Other variables, such as leadership behavior and learning orientation, may potentially affect employee engagement and organizational performance as well. Future research may work on examining their impacts on employee engagement and organizational performance. A final area for future research is to study the potential effect of experimental interventions on employee engagement. There is some evidence that exchange-inducing interventions can invoke a sense of obligation on the part of individuals who feel obliged to reciprocate (Ganzach, Pacy, Ohayun, & Brainin, 2002). Thus, future research might investigate the extent to which interventions can create a sense of obligation that leads individuals to reciprocate with higher levels of engagement. For example, training managers to be more supportive might be effective for improving perceptions of organizational support and caring. Job design interventions that provide employees with more autonomy and variety in their work as well as career management interventions might also be effective. This is likely to be a fruitful area for future research given the increasing interest on the part of organizations to improve employee engagement and organizational performance.

CONCLUSION & SUGGESTIONS

The purposes of this study were to determine the systematic framework and to construct the causal model of job fit, affective commitment, employee engagement, and organizational performance for plastic plant employees in Thailand. The findings showed that the job fit, affective commitment, and employee engagement have strengths to moderate positive effects on organizational performance. In relation of the systematic framework, this result was the extent to which job fit, affective commitment, and employee engagement have moderated the positive effects on organizational performance. Furthermore, employee engagement fully mediates the relationships between job fit and organizational performance and between affective commitment and organizational performance. Organizations looking to increase performance should focus on developing employee engagement as an organizational strategic leverage point. This study provides support for utilizing each of the variables examined in this study in the development of specific and objective work-oriented interventions around employee engagement. Human resource practitioners can take an important role in designing and implementing interventions in ways that increase employee engagement and impact organizational outcome variables. For example, in this study, job fit and affective commitment were identified as leverage points for practitioners looking to enhance employee engagement and performance. Considering which leverage point to start with would depend on the unique needs of each organization; suggesting a “one size fits all” approach would be inappropriate and out of context for this study. Evidence however has suggested that creating opportunities for employees to work in roles in which their knowledge, skills, and abilities fit with their job responsibilities, creating and then providing opportunities for employees to affectively bond with their organization are conditions that support a relation with employee engagement (Kahn, 1990; Macey et al., 2009). Thus, these variables should be considered as starting points for conversation and intervention. Human Resource Development (HRD) practitioners should capitalize on this new knowledge by creating carefully constructed and integrated interventions.
that focus clearly on incorporating current management practices, organizational structure, job design, and culture building (Joo, 2010).

Further, Human Resource Development practitioners should encourage the development of employee engagement by training leaders, managers, and supervisors about the conditions that have a relation with employee engagement. An employee’s manager strongly influences levels of employee engagement and performance (Arakawa & Greenberg, 2007; Harter, Schmidt, & Hayes, 2002; Kroth & Keeler, 2009; Lloyd, 2008). Interventions for leaders, managers, and supervisors can take the form of formal development and coaching programs that focus on talent management practices (Lockwood, 2007). Research suggests that interventions designed to influence employee engagement should provide opportunities for self-awareness, self-reflection, and real-time feedback (Hamel, 2007; Maccoby, 2007). It is imperative that organizations looking to increase performance focus on how work gets accomplished, not just how much. To recruit, maintain, and motivate employees in an increasingly competitive environment (Beck, 2003), human resource practices must be innovative and compelling, benefiting both the organization and the employee (Joo, 2010). It is essential that human resource programs balance the good of the organization with the good of the employee; sustainability of organizational performance alongside any intervention or program must be considered.

Using results from this study to better understand employee engagement as both an organizational and individual level performance variable (Macey & Schneider, 2008), can serve as a structure for implementing compelling, focused, and effective Human Resource Development interventions. For example, innovative practices can include taking an entire work group to serve in a community-wide service project for the day, encouraging managers to have weekly meetings with new team members during the first four weeks of a new job, or encouraging an entire human resource department to redesign their recruitment and selection processes to maximize and maintain the talents of their team. As evidenced by the findings of this study, employee engagement has powerful implications for organizations; consequently those who lead these organizations must work to create the conditions for employee engagement to develop. As the field of Human Resource Development evolves, employee engagement provides Human Resource Development professionals a way to help ever-specialized employees in ever-specialized jobs (Beck, 2003) successfully operate within the inner workings of a complex, and ever-changing organization. Developing high levels of employee engagement in any organization is a work in progress. However, thinking differently about work and how each employee experiences work, is the first step in an innovative direction.

REFERENCES


LEGAL AWARENESS AND PERCEIVED ETHICAL LEADERSHIP OF EDUCATIONAL ADMINISTRATORS IN STATE UNIVERSITIES AND COLLEGES (SUCS) IN REGION 3

Robert P. Pena
Pampanga Agricultural College, Philippines

ABSTRACT

This study determined the ethical leadership behavior and legal knowledge of administrators in State Universities and Colleges in Region III. A correlation of the respondents’ profile (i.e., age, educational attainment, academic rank, and years in position) was established with their ethical leadership behavior and legal knowledge. A descriptive type of research was utilized to correlate respondents’ ethical leadership behavior (ELB), legal knowledge, and demographic profile. An ELB scale was drawn from the studies of Brown, Trevino, and Harrison (2005) and a legal knowledge test (LKT) was constructed by the researcher. The content of the LKT are cases drawn from the decisions of the Supreme Court (Criminal Law, 1987 Philippine Constitution, Civil Code of the Philippines, Sexual Harassment Act, Education Act of the Philippines, and Government Service Insurance Act). Pearson correlation, Chi-square, frequency, and percentage were the statistical instruments used to analyze the collected data. Major findings in terms of demographic profile revealed that there were 143 administrators who were mostly holding office for more than 10 years, have high academic ranks, and are holders of Doctorates. In terms of the respondents’ ethical leadership behavior (ELB), most of the respondents strongly agreed with the statements found in the ELB. The result showed that respondents strongly value professional code of ethics in matters of legal decisions. In terms of the respondents’ legal knowledge, respondents were described as Competent in all topics in the legal application test. However, the respondents had poor legal knowledge on some details such as legal terms, procedural laws and legal processes. It was further established that the correlation established between demographic profile and ethical leadership behavior was not significant. On the other hand, the correlation established between ethical leadership behavior and legal knowledge was slight in particular with Criminal Law and Education Act of the Philippines. In summary, the findings in the legal knowledge test suggested that administrators should strengthened their knowledge such as laws relative to state policies, academic freedom, duties and responsibilities, administrative rules, and administrative sanctions. In addition, findings in the ethical leadership behavior of the
respondents suggest that SUC administrators should reevaluate their legal discernment or judgmental powers towards issues or concerns that they might encounter.

Keywords: Ethical Leadership, Legal Awareness, Administrators

INTRODUCTION/BACKGROUND/OBJECTIVE

In any organization, conflicts or disputes arise between subordinates and supervisors from a myriad of reasons. Administrators usually rely on their managerial experiences, interpersonal skills, and professional judgment to settle disputes. Moreover, other demographic (e.g. gender) and social factors (e.g., personality, leadership styles) relatively influence settlements, decisions and moral reasoning of an administrator.

Ethical leadership is a demonstration of normatively appropriate conduct through personal actions, interpersonal relationship, and the promotion of such conduct to followers through two-way communication reinforcement, and decision-making (Brown & Trevino, 2006). In this view, leadership is rooted on human aspects of supervision (Bago, 2010) or reflective supervision (Blase & Blase, 1998; Osterman, 1990). According to Bago, leadership in this sense espouses reflection and transformation rather than inspection and control (p.27). The type of leadership that any administrator should espouse will highly be crucial to the settlement/unsettlement of any organizational disputes.

Bazerman and Messick (1996) posit that there is a need to identify and confront tendencies of poor decision-making to improve ethical quality of decisions among executives. In their views, there are three types of theories that executives use in making decisions; – theories about the world, other people, and ourselves. These theories underscore reasons for any decision – culture, organized beliefs, and perceived knowledge or capacity. In other words, decision-making is influenced by personal values and beliefs and consequently greatly affecting others. Actions by school officials are likely to be strongly influenced by personal values and professional code of ethics built on the values and experiences (Shapiro & Stefkovich, 2005).

The premise of ethical leadership underscores empowerment and transformation of followers while grounding decisions in morals and values (Copper, 1993). This view is in consonance with the multiple paradigms posited by Shapiro & Stefkovich (2005). The paradigm view ethics of justice, ethics of care, and professional ethics (Shapiro & Stefkovich, 2005) as very important framework in decision-making. It is crucial to decision-making because it serves the best interests of student. In addition, obligations of educational leaders are said to be fulfilled. Research on ethics and leadership has becoming more interesting and significant to educational leaders. It has only been in the past decade that ethical leadership has been systematically explored (Brown & Trevino, 2006). Ethical decision-making models sensitize decision-makers to a variety of moral issues. They become more conscious on how their decisions could affect others; the reasons for their decisions; and how they could rectify wrong decisions; and even avoid possible dangerous situations. However, researchers on ethics and ethical leadership are equivocal in the view that theoretical frameworks developed as research
models for ethics training have several limitations (e.g., Elenkov, D., Kuntz, J.P. & Kuntz, J.R.C., 2011). First, models and measurement tools are designated to cater to a specific professional group such as counselors, accountants, and marketing professionals. This means that tools to gauge ethical leadership seemed to be scarce in some professions such as in education. In addition, authentic measurement tools are imperative to obtain valid results. Second, individual moral orientation is overlooked in dilemma identification and ethical reasoning. These variables were investigated in relation with educational leaders’ perceived leadership behaviors - personal values, ideals, culture, demographic profile, managerial experience, education, personality are some of the factors which have been found to influence professional judgment and ethical leadership of educational administrators (e.g., Elenkov et al., 2011).

This study investigated legal knowledge of administrators on education-related laws (i.e., basic state policies, academic freedom, duties and responsibilities, administrative rules, penalty and administrative sanctions). In addition, their ethical leadership behaviors were examined.

Specifically, the following research questions were addressed:

What is the demographic profile of the respondents?
How can the respondents’ ethical leadership behaviors be described?
How can the respondents’ legal knowledge (or ethical reasoning) on ethical dilemmas be described in terms of:

Criminal Law
1987 Philippine Constitution
Civil Code of the Philippines
Education Act of the Philippines
Sexual Harassment
Government Service Insurance Act

Is there a significant relationship between respondents’ demographic profile and ethical leadership behaviors?
Is there a significant relationship between respondents’ ethical leadership behaviors and their legal knowledge?

METHODOLOGY, FINDINGS, ANALYSIS & DISCUSSION

This study utilized descriptive type of research. Ethical leadership behaviors of the respondents were determined and results were correlated with their legal knowledge and demographic profile. Respondents of this study were key policy makers from State Universities and Colleges in Region 3. Respondents have similarities in terms of their administrative positions. This means that all of the respondents in the selected SUCs are key players of government-run educational institutions, policy/decision makers, and school officials. Furthermore, they hold administrative and supervisory functions, and have judgmental powers.
The study determined the perceived ethical leadership behaviours and legal knowledge of educational administrators from State Universities and Colleges in Region III. When the researcher has obtained the exact number of respondents per selected SUC, letter of invitation and request was personally delivered by the researcher. Then, when a schedule was arranged, the researcher administered the following:

- Ethical Leadership Scale
- Legal Knowledge Test
- Evaluative Test

RESULTS

The grand mean score of all the statements in the ELB scale was 4.6 which means that the respondents strongly agreed with the ethical behaviors. In terms of ranking, number six (6) statements “Sets an example of how to do things the right way in terms of ethics” was ranked first (or highest). This means that respondents strongly value professional code of ethics in their execution of any legal decision. On the other hand, Statement 2, “Having the best interest of employees in mind” was ranked tenth (10th). This finding agrees with the ethical frameworks postulated by Elenkov, Kuntz,JP, Kuntz, JRC (2011). Educational leaders tended to be more conscious on how their decisions could affect others.
**Table 2:** Mean scores of respondents’ Ethical Leadership Behavior (ELB)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Statements in the ELB</th>
<th>Mean Score</th>
<th>Descriptive Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Listens to what employees have to say.</td>
<td>4.44</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Has the best interest of employees in mind.</td>
<td>4.42</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Makes fair and balanced decisions.</td>
<td>4.64</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Can be trusted.</td>
<td>4.59</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Discuss business ethics or values with employees.</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Sets an example of how to do things the right way in terms of ethics.</td>
<td>4.76</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Disciplines employees who violate ethical standards.</td>
<td>4.55</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Defines success not just by results but also the way that they are obtained.</td>
<td>4.66</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>When making decisions, asks, “What is the right thing to do?”</td>
<td>4.60</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Conducts his/her personal life in an ethical manner.</td>
<td>4.62</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Grand Mean</strong></td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Relationship Between Respondents’ Demographic Profile and Ethical Leadership Behavior

Table 4 shows the relationship between the respondents’ age and ethical leadership behavior. Results revealed the p value, .129 which is greater than the critical value .05. This means that there is no significant relationship between the age of the respondents and ethical leadership behavior. The results suggest that the age of the respondents was not an indicator of their ethical leadership behaviors.

The Table also shows the relationship between respondents’ years in position and ethical leadership behavior. Results revealed the p value, .250 which is greater than the critical value.
of .05. This means that the respondents' number of years in position is not significantly related to their ethical leadership behavior.

The relationship between the respondents' educational attainment and ethical leadership behavior showed that the p value .082 is greater than the critical level of .05. This means that there is no significant relationship between the respondents' educational attainment and their ethical leadership behavior. The result suggests that the degree earned by the respondents does not affect their responses in the ethical leadership behavior scale.

The relationship between the respondents' academic rank and ethical leadership behaviors revealed that the p value .676 is greater than the critical value .05. This means that there is no significant relationship between the respondents' academic rank and ethical leadership behaviors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Value (sig. 2 tailed)</th>
<th>Remark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>.129</td>
<td>Not significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of years vs Ethical Leadership Behavior</td>
<td>.250</td>
<td>Not significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational attainment vs Ethical Leadership Behavior</td>
<td>.082</td>
<td>Not significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic rank vs Ethical Leadership Behavior</td>
<td>.676</td>
<td>Not significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4: Chi-Square test on respondents' age and Ethical Leadership Behavior**

Relationship Between Respondents’ Ethical Leadership Behavior and Legal Knowledge

The relationship between the respondents' Ethical Leadership Behavior (ELB) and legal knowledge in Criminal Law showed the r value, .325** which means that there is a low or slight correlation between respondents’ ELB and their legal knowledge in Criminal Law. The result suggests that the respondents’ legal competence in Criminal Law is associated with their ethical leadership behavior. In other words, as the respondents agreed with the ELB, there is a slight possibility of getting higher scores in the legal application test in Criminal Law.

It also shows the relationship between the respondents’ Ethical Leadership Behavior (ELB) and legal knowledge in the 1987 Philippine Constitution. Results revealed the r value, -.104, which means that there is a negligible correlation between respondents’ ELB and legal application in the 1987 Philippine Constitution. The result suggests that the respondents’ legal knowledge (in the 1987 Philippine Constitution) was not significantly related to the
respondents’ ethical leadership behaviors. In other words, even if the respondents strongly agreed with the statements in the ELB scale, their scores in the 1987 Philippine Constitution were not high enough to be statistically significant.

The relationship between the respondents’ Ethical Leadership Behavior (ELB) and Legal Knowledge in Civil Code of the Philippines revealed that the r value is .008, which means that there is a negligible correlation between the respondents’ ELB and their legal knowledge in Civil Code of the Philippines. The result suggests that the respondents’ legal knowledge in Civil Code of the Philippines was not significantly related to their ethical leadership behaviors. In other words, the respondents may have higher/lower scores in the legal knowledge test but may disagree/agree with the statements found in the ELB.

The Table also shows the relationship between the respondents’ Ethical Leadership Behavior (ELB) and Legal Knowledge in Education Act of the Philippines. Results revealed the r value, .222* which means that there is a low or slight correlation between the respondents’ ELB and their legal knowledge in Education Act of the Philippines. The results suggest that there is a significant relationship with the respondents' legal knowledge in Education Act of the Philippines and their ethical leadership behaviors. In other words, the more that respondents agreed with the statements found in the ELB scale, the higher their scores in the legal knowledge test in Education Act of the Philippines.

The relationship between the respondents’ Ethical Leadership Behavior (ELB) and their legal knowledge in Sexual Harassment Act revealed that the r value is -.077, which means that there is a negligible correlation between the respondents’ ELB and their legal knowledge in Sexual Harassment Act. Result suggests that there was no significant relationship between respondents' ethical leadership behaviors and their legal knowledge in Sexual Harassment Act. In other words, the respondents' ethical leadership behavior was not an indicator of higher scores in the legal knowledge test in Sexual Harassment.

Lastly, the relationship between the respondents’ Ethical Leadership Behavior (ELB) and their legal knowledge test in Government Service Act revealed that the r value is .080, which means that there was no significant correlation between the respondents’ ELB and their legal knowledge in Government Service Insurance Act. The result suggests that the respondents’ legal knowledge in Government Service Insurance Act was not significantly related to their ethical leadership behavior. In other words, even as the respondents strongly agreed with the statements found in the ELB scale, it was not an indication of higher or lower yield of scores in Government Service Insurance Act.

**CONCLUSION, LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. There were a total of 143 respondents from 11 SUCs. In terms of demographic profile, the following are summarized:
   a. 61 or 42.7% belong to the 40 year-old and above group while 1 or .7% belong to the 20-30 year-old group of respondents;
b. 65 or 45.5% of the respondents have been in the public service for one to 10 years;

c. Fifty-three or 37.1% of the respondents were Directors, 21 or 14.7% were Deans, 2 or 1.4% were Vice Presidents, and one or .7% was a Principal;

d. Eighteen or 12.5% of the respondents were Professor 5. There were only two or 1.4% who were Instructor 2; and

e. Forty-seven or 32.9% of the respondents were Doctorates or Ph.D. holders. There was only one or .7% who was an MBM or Masters in Business Management.

2. In terms of the respondents’ ethical leadership behavior, the following were the significant findings:

a. The grand mean score of all the statements in the ELB scale was 4.6 which means that the respondents strongly agreed with the ethical behaviors. Ranking of the statements showed that respondents strongly valued the statement “Sets example of how to do things the right way in terms of ethics”;

b. The grand mean score of the respondents in the Legal Knowledge Test was 47.9.

3. In terms of the respondents’ legal knowledge to ethical dilemmas, the following were the significant findings:

a. The statement which most respondents answered correctly in Criminal Law was, “Ignorance of the law is a valid excuse from compliance with the rules”. There were 119 respondents who answered False;

b. On the other hand, the question which most respondents did not answer correctly was, "When a teacher who gave provocation was assaulted by a student, the latter is liable only for physical injuries and not for the crime of direct assault”. There were 58 respondents who answered False;

c. The question which most respondents answered correctly in the 1987 Philippine Constitution was, "Schools can refuse to admit student who failed to meet the retention policy. Students have no right to demand admission since the school, in the exercise of its academic freedom, has the power to promulgate reasonable rules for study, subject to fair, reasonable, and equitable requirements". There were 119 respondents who answered item B8 correctly;

d. On the contrary, the question which most respondents did not answer correctly was, “Due process requires that there be a trial. It cannot be done through pleadings.” There were 93 respondents who answered incorrectly;

e. The question which most respondents answered correctly in the Civil Code of the Philippines was, "The school exercises custodial and supervisory power over the enrolled students no matter what their ages are”. There were 125 respondents who answered True;

f. The statement which most respondents did not answer correctly was, “The power of the school over its students cease absolutely when they leave the school premises, their conduct outside of school houses cannot be subject to school discipline”. There were 86 respondents who answered incorrectly;
g. The statement which most respondents answered correctly in the 1982 Education Act of the Philippines was, "Married professors may be charged with immorality if he carries on an affair with a female student even if the affair is carried on outside the schools". There were 122 respondents who answered the item correctly;

h. Most respondents did not answer the question correctly was, "Expelling a student is vested solely on the Secretary of Education". There were 109 respondents who answered incorrectly;

i. The question which most respondents answered correctly in Sexual Harassment Act was,"Respondent may appear before the Committee on the case of sexual harassment with the aid of a counsel". There were 111 respondents who answered correctly;

j. The statement which most respondents did not answer correctly was, "The complaint on sexual harassment may be prosecuted even if it does not conform with the standard procedure in handling a case, due to the unusual nature of the sexual harassment act. A mere letter may be sufficient to prosecute the case". There were 52 respondents who answered incorrectly;

k. Respondents answered the question correctly in GSIS Act was, “Contractual employees who have no employer-employee relationship with the agencies they serve are excluded from the coverage of the GSIS Act”. There were 96 respondents who answered correctly;

l. The statement which most respondents did not answer correctly was, "Retirement shall be compulsory for an employee at sixty-five (65) years of age with at least fifteen (15) years of service. If he has less than fifteen (15) years of service, he shall be allowed to complete the fifteen (15) years". There were 53 respondents who answered incorrectly; and

m. Respondents were rated Competent in all the topics in the Legal Knowledge Test.

4. In terms of the relationship between respondents’ ethical leadership behavior and demographic profile, the following were the significant findings:

a. There is no significant relationship between the age of the respondents and ethical leadership behavior.

b. Respondents’ number of years in position, educational attainment, academic rank were not significantly related to their ethical leadership behavior.

5. In terms of the relationship between the respondents' ethical leadership behavior and legal knowledge, the following are the significant findings:

a. Respondents’ legal knowledge in Criminal Law and Education Act of the Philippines was slightly significant to the respondents’ ethical leadership behavior; and

b. Respondents’ legal knowledge in the 1987 Philippine Constitution, Civil Code of the Philippines, Government Service Insurance Act, and Sexual Harassment Act were not significantly related to respondents’ ethical leadership behavior.
CONCLUSIONS

Based on the findings of this study, the researcher posits the following insights:

The respondents of this study were mostly 40 years old above and have served State Universities and Colleges in Region III on the average of 10 years. In addition, respondents belong to higher academic ranks and educational attainment. Most respondents hold offices that require judgmental powers in terms of policy-making and rule-implementation;

Respondents strongly agreed with the statements found in the Ethical Leadership Behavior scale. Respondents particularly valued or strongly agreed with setting an example to subordinates. In other words, respondents are sensitive with how their decisions affect others;

Respondents were Competent in their legal knowledge test in Criminal Law, Education Act, Sexual Harassment Act, Civil Code of the Philippines, Government Service Insurance Act, and 1987 Philippine Constitution. However, respondents had poor legal knowledge in:

   a. issues concerning liabilities and possible litigations that a teacher may face after physical altercation with students;
   b. legal terms such as pleadings;
   c. views on extent of supervisory and administrative powers over students who committed offenses outside school premises;
   d. processes encompassed in delivering sanctions and directing expulsion/dismissal case to appropriate officials;
   e. following procedures in prosecuting sexual harassment cases;
   f. views that concern retirement rules;

Respondents' demographic profile such as age, educational attainment, years in position, and academic rank was not significantly related to their ethical leadership behavior. It could be implied from the findings that ethical leadership behavior of the respondents may or may not be affected by their profile. Meaning, whether they were young or old and had higher ranks; or have held positions in a very long time, their ethical leadership behaviors would still be ideal or favorable; and

There was a slight correlation between respondents' ELB and their legal knowledge in Criminal Law and Education Act. Respondents' scores in these two topics have statistical value. Perhaps, the scores were higher because most respondents have encountered similar situational cases in their respective institutions. Thus, they were legally competent in their judgmental powers.
RECOMMENDATIONS

Administrators or SUC officials requiring legal discernments in their offices be given adequate training. Costly litigations may be avoided if administrators and faculty members who impose policies, implement rules and author sanctions are properly guided and trained;

SUC Presidents may include a legal knowledge test in their screening and hiring process. In addition, the legal knowledge test may be used as a tool to promote or designate an aspiring dean or an administrator;

Faculty members should be properly oriented to laws concerning student’s rights and personal rights. A faculty manual should be made available to all SUC faculties. There is also a need for faculty members to reevaluate their legal discernments towards students, peers or colleagues, parents, supervisors or immediate heads;

Students who are majors of education, supervision, and administration should have core or elective subjects (both in the undergraduate and graduate programs) that challenges their decision-making abilities and tap or enhance their legal knowledge; and

Studies that investigate and encourage programs on legal training planned by SUC Administrators themselves are possible areas that other researchers can consider.

REFERENCES


LEADERSHIP IN HR-, LEAN IMPLEMENTATION-, AND SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT DROVE COST DOWN DURING THE “THE GREAT RECESSION” OF 2008

Deborah Jablonski and Nesa L’abbé Wu
Eastern Michigan University, USA

ABSTRACT

This paper examines what successful companies set out to do to remain competitive in a volatile economic climate, when the stock market took a downturn and many companies found that they had a loss in revenue and could not pay their outstanding debt. Research that offers tools for surviving such a great recession, especially in the automotive industry, is the focus of this paper. These tools include, but may not be limited to, human resource management tools and operational and supply chain tools. The key to surviving was to become “leaner” in all aspects of the firm. Parallel to this research we report on a mid-western company that successfully implemented many of these proposed techniques, and who came out of the “economic storm” stronger than it ever had been.

Keywords: Organizational Redesign, Lean Initiatives, Human Efficiency, Operational and Supply Chain Tools, Organizational Decision Making Approach, Bureaucratic Organization, Learning Organization, Extended Value Stream Mapping, Supply Chain Redesign, Project Management, Supplier Relationship Management.

INTRODUCTION

Almost overnight the automotive industry and its suppliers found that massive cost reductions were necessary to survive and stay in business in 2008 and 2009. For this industry it was a test if ever there was one to measure how past decisions and future decisions would make or break a business.

Automotive industry sales in the U.S. were down 40% in February 2009 compared with the year before. Domestic carmakers saw sales fall 49% in that time. More than 40 automotive suppliers declared bankruptcy in 2008 and dozens more faced the same situation as a result of the economic crisis (Bensinger, 2009).

In the past, many companies had huge war chests to pull resources from in case some catastrophic event should happen and day to day operating decisions were made without...
having a huge negative impact on the company's bottom line. That all changed when the stock market took a down turn and many companies found that they had a loss in revenue and could not pay their outstanding debt. It was going to take major cost reductions and changing the way these companies operate if they were going to remain competitive in this volatile economic climate.

Companies who thought they had prepared for a rainy day realized that the financial resources they had set aside were not going to be enough to push through this crisis. Consequently, companies adjusted their orders and scheduled shut downs so customers could analyze how to make the required adjustments to their own operations. These changes in orders and company shutdowns had a profound effect on the supply chain. This trickledown effect lasted for several weeks until all of the changes in the supply chain pipeline were made.

It was obvious to the industry that day to day operations in every department, at every level, had to change drastically and quickly if companies were to weather the crisis. At that time though, the impact of this crisis was not known and it was very difficult to forecast how long it would last. Everyone had to be on their toes to wait for direction from upper management and be ready to put out fires as they manifested themselves.

Companies who ended surviving the storm realized that major cost reductions were necessary. They started by having Human Resource Management reduce cost; followed by improving and re-engineering operations and processes of the business while implementing change using learning organizations; and finally by improving the supply chain.

**TOOLS USED FOR SURVIVING THE GREAT RECESSION IN THE AUTOMOTIVE INDUSTRY**

In an effort to drastically reduce cost human resource, operational and supply chain tools must all be considered and implemented in order to survive the storm of our great recession. Additionally the supply chain itself may need to be redesigned for additional cost savings. Let us examine each of these in light of what surviving companies achieved.

**Human Resource Management Tools:**

Many such companies started asking their employees to pay more towards their health care coverage and some even expected the employees to pay for their entire healthcare package.

Next, they cut staff across the board in each department of the firm. This often resulted in needed training of the remaining employees to fill the gap left by the ones that were let go. Human Resources became the key component in working towards lean initiatives as many processes were re-engineered to run more efficiently with fewer resources.

Initially layoff decisions were often made with a great deal of uncertainty, until they were given the blessing from upper management. People were not capable of adjusting to new methods
and many times the right people were not at the right jobs. So, due to lack of understanding of existing processes human inefficiencies manifested themselves, counter acting cost reduction initiatives. This could only be resolved through human resource training.

Through organizational redesign we can improve the processes of an organization and facilitate efficient work flow (Lean Supermarket, 2009). The first step in the redesign process is to remove obstacles that keep people from achieving success. The next step is to use good people that can adapt and institute positive improvements to processes without hesitation. This will lead towards human efficiency. Any organization must support such change and improvement (Lean Supermarket, 2009).

**Operational and Supply Chain Tools:**

These cost reduction tools involve looking at operations to determine changes that need to be made in the supply chain, supplier relationships, demand management, and e-business technology.

Companies can best approach such cost reductions by using a rational or organizational decision making approach. A rational approach can be used by monitoring the decision environment, defining the decision problem, specifying the decision problem, specifying the decision objectives, diagnosing the problem, developing alternative solutions, evaluating alternatives, choosing the best alternative, and implementing the chosen alternative (Daft, p. 445 and 455). Companies skilled in organizational decision making were in a better position to make tough cost reduction decisions than companies that did not approach decision making based on evidence-based management.

Most organizations in order to be successful in cost reduction had to be redesigned from a bureaucratic organization to a learning organization. A learning organization promotes communication and collaboration so that everyone is engaged in identifying and solving problems. This enables the organization to continuously experiment, improve, and increase its capability (Daft, 2010, p. 618).

Now, companies have to think outside the box and develop innovative and sensible changes to meet new customer requirements. They have to examine the way they manage resources as incoming orders come to a screeching halt. The entire supply chain needs to take a step back to figure out what materials are currently in the pipeline and how to adjust future orders throughout the supply chain. As orders are renegotiated companies experience a major bull-whip effect. The bull-whip effect is an extreme change in the supply position upstream in the supply chain that is generated by a small change in the demand downstream in the supply chain (APICS, p. 15).

The operations of a company can become lean when it looks within itself and at customer/supplier relationships, to determine how things are currently done. It can then work out solutions to make them more effective and efficient using lean principles and tools. All aspects
of supply chain activities can become the best-in-class as they work together becoming lean. Cost reductions that allow organizations to hold a competitive advantage in the market place are achieved by using lean principles and tools. A most powerful tool leading towards cost reduction is extended value stream mapping. Additionally Darren Dolcemascolo (2006) explains in his book, Improving the Extended Value Stream, that many companies also gain better quality by using techniques that include extended value stream mapping. Activities such as process Kaizen, outsourcing strategies, supplier evaluation, and supplier integration activities as they relate to the supply chain are indeed areas of opportunity to improve operations and cut costs of doing business (Dolcenasco, D., 2006). A well-managed supply chain is a business practice that gives companies and customers an opportunity to work together to achieve sustainability by incorporating “Lean” practices. Here “Lean” is defined as the elimination of muda or waste (Lian, Y., and Van Landeghem, H., n.d.). The main goal here is to evaluate current processes, identify waste in the processes, and then redesign these processes to make them less complex and more efficient.

Ultimate cost savings are achieved when every area of the business looks for ways to run more efficiently. Thus the entire supply chain can achieve the greatest benefit as a whole when all parties work together to evaluate all areas of the supply chain as they attempt to reduce cost by implementing efficient business practices. As one party realizes a cost saving, everyone in the entire chain will realize that cost saving.

Organizations must look at value from the customer perspective by identifying value streams and flows, pulling resources as needed and striving for perfection. Such perspective will result in cost reductions. Manufacturing companies are no strangers to this concept of lean manufacturing, as they took notice of this type of strategy when they saw the success achieved by Toyota Motor Company.

Indeed, every change comes with a price tag, however implementing the lean value stream mapping tool can change an organization to a leaner organization (an organization with less waste) with minimal transition cost (Lian, and Van Landeghem, n.d). However, education and training of workers and management is a critical part of moving forward toward adopting lean initiatives.

Finally, no lean transformation happens overnight. It is best to look for current performance, the next level of performance, and finally, the entitlement vision of performance (Gleditsch, D., 2007, pp. 13-17).

Supply Chain Redesign:
Maximizing value and generating additional cost savings are achieved through supply chain evaluation. Proper evaluation tools must result in supply chain redesign with the objective of improving operational strategies in forecasting accuracy and order performance, resulting in lowering the supply chain costs and eliminating waste and inefficiencies. All members of the
supply chain must work together to achieve the primary goal to get the right product to the right place at the right time (Handfield, R., and Nichols, E., 2002).

Kevin Mixer, Research Director for AMR Research, has compiled research that identifies The Next Generation Supply Chain. Mixer writes: “The speed of product introduction will only increase as quality becomes a commodity and new, innovative product features become the only means to differentiate brand. What this means to the automotive industry is that, the supply chain will be profitable when brand owners improve demand management, suppliers improve manufacturing efficiencies and everyone works together” (Mixer, K., 2005, p. 19). The key strategy to this success is to produce what customers want, create the perception of a unique product for each customer, speed up new product development, identify what is expected from the supply base, improve supplier relationships, build strong relationships to facilitate new demands and expectations, transform the industry by shrinking cycle times, implement product standardization, adopt lean manufacturing principles and tools, rapidly develop and introduce new effective products, invest in future trends, and focus on core strengths.

Project management as a tool can be used in the redesign of the supply chain as lean management concepts are applied to current management processes and operations. This will enable common forces to move organizations towards success in finding problems and opportunities that need to be addressed.

Cost savings are achieved when a cooperative effort is made by all parties in the supply chain to be efficient and effective. Efficiency and effectiveness often require change in corporate culture. Corporate entities (from workers to upper management) must work together achieving efficiency, reducing lead times, incorporating efficient production schedules, increasing inventory turns, and keeping the correct amount of safety stock in inventory. These actions no doubt will significantly reduce the cost of the supply chain. According to Atkinson the challenge in the supply chain is to address the issues that impact the ‘middlemen’ when they need to react quickly to changes in requirements (Atkinson, W., 2007). The primary goal of a successful supply chain is to get the right material to the right location in the right quantity on time. This can become a challenge when the supply chain is unable to keep an ideal amount of inventory to meet the needs of unexpected, ever changing demand levels.

In an effort to reduce cost, top level interaction supplier relationship management is key to producing positive results and gain management attention. This cross-company strategic process has shown to enhance value between customers and suppliers. A major study conducted by Supply Chain Management Review confirms its savings. Its respondents identified an additional 23 percent of value available from concentrating on supplier relationships. This equates to an average of more than one billion dollars for each respondent. It exceeds the average annual cost reduction of 5.5 percent. Supplier integration is the key component to achieving such a strategic and successful supplier relationship.
Supply chain redesign often requires the redesign of the e-business. New trends in e-business applications in demand fulfillment, online purchasing, and design collaboration must be considered to increase the level of penetration within the supply chain internally.

Finally, electronic data interchange (EDI) must be fully implemented throughout the supply chain. EDI is a vehicle used to send orders out to suppliers to save time and processing costs. This electronic transaction processing system offers a secure and reliable method to process orders, shipping notifications, invoices and payments. Here cost savings are achieved due to increased productivity, improved accuracy and staff reductions.

All the above enhances a well-organized relationship within the supply chain, which is, according to Bonnet, the primary element used to achieve common goals and objectives (Bonnet, K., 2000).

**CASE IMPLEMENTATION: THE ABC AUTOMOTIVE SUPPLY COMPANY**

ABC Company is one of seven successful automotive parts manufacturing companies studied in this research. Like so many companies, this medium size company located in the Midwest was faced with massive cost reductions in 2008 to stay in business. For the purpose of anonymity we will refer to the company as the ABC Company as we report on the actions they took to survive the economic storm.

As a measure to curb the cost of increasing health care insurance this company for the first time in history asked their employees to pay for their health care cost. However, in order to generate cost savings in employee health cost they created an on-site clinic. The idea behind this program was to provide wellness education and make it easy for employees and insured family members to seek medical attention early before they encountered major or complicated health problems. Early diagnosis and preventive care was projected to save the ABC Company and its insured a lot of money in medical expenses long term.

The staff reduction came as a complete surprise to the employees. This was indeed the first layoff in company history! The problem with reducing the staff by 10% in every department is that management did not fully comprehend what these people did for the firm. In many instances the people with the “know-how” went out the door. It became clear very quickly that many managers were not able to perform the day to day activities in their area. As a result, those managers were also let go. To remedy this problem, managers that once covered one location now had to cover two. For example, a plant controller, or a materials manager can cover more than one location. Additionally, ABC established a policy to not replace workers when they left the company due to attrition. The company realized that changes need to be made if the replacement employees are going to succeed. So, they re-evaluated these areas affected with the reduction in employees and accommodated training process changes. They removed obstacles that kept people from achieving success and concentrated on using good people that could adapt and institute positive improvements to processes without hesitation.
Looking at operations and determine changes that ought to be made was challenging for the ABC company. Initially, the company did not have time to thoroughly analyze problems and work to achieve the best solutions. As a result, they operated quickly by the seat of their pants and made decisions that were not necessarily in the best interest for the company for the long run.

To be successful it was soon determined that the organization had to be redesigned from a bureaucratic organization into a learning organization. The CEO1 at ABC Company, made this connection when discussing his management style in an interview on September 14, 2009. Smith said that his biggest challenge, when taking over a group is not to change out the people with people that think like he does, but rather, coach and mentor the people already on board. He believed that most people are enlightened and welcome the opportunity to do a good job and become engaged in their contribution to the organization. Smith said, “Give them room to fail and learn from their mistakes. His biggest satisfaction is to create new management teams, have those managers teach their people and in return see job satisfaction because they are part of the decision making process.”

The CEO was on the job for two years but found it challenging to implement his plan as management needed to be instructed as to how learning organizations actually worked. His managers were overwhelmed by the magnitude and impact of the crisis and were faced with the challenge of instituting new policies and programs as a result of the economic down turn.

ABC Company took a look at how operations were managed and implemented ways to reduce cost. They did this by redesigning the supply chain, implementing lean initiatives, supplier relationship management, demand management, and e-business technology. The goal was to look at all ways their organizations could address waste reductions and become more cost efficient. The supply chain had to work as a team in order to achieve a common goal. All parties worked to produce the highest quality products within their area of expertise. Common goals and objectives were shared within the supply chain as success was achieved using communication technology and cooperative management approaches. Education was a critical part for moving the company towards adopting lean initiatives.

All members of the ABC supply chain worked together to redesign the supply chain. The company analyzed and redesigned its supply chain to allow for improved operational strategies in forecast accuracy, order performance, lower supply chain cost, and reduction in waste and inefficiencies. Opportunities and improvements surfaced in areas of quality, and inventory control and optimization strategies, as old and inefficient strategies were eliminated.

ABC Company implemented and enhanced new trends in e-business applications in demand fulfillment, on line purchasing, and design collaboration. It was anticipated that this would increase in the level of penetration within the supply chain internally. Benefits were seen as applications were implemented that directly affected inter-company, customers, immediate

---

1 The Chief Executive Officer agreed to be quoted, but wished to stay anonymous.
suppliers, as well as the extended supply chain. Customer compliance, reduction in inventory, and improved quality of products had become part of value proposition at ABC Company.

Finally, ABC Company realized that cost savings, increased productivity, accuracy, and staff reduction positively impact the company due to e-business, as EDI was enhancements for order processing.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Using some of the old ideas that ABC ingrained into the business from the very beginning have paid off since it began over 50 years ago. During a recent interview with the Chief Executive Officer of ABC Company explained the new direction of original equipment manufacturers (OEMs) and how technology and innovation will be based on the same ideas as the production and design methods used to be, back in the early 1900’s. According to him, companies are able to create a global DNA that will encompass a standardization of every vehicle platform. This will enable the entire global supply chain to work in harmony to deliver their best core products to the global market.

Technology and innovation have made this a reality as all aspects of production and supply chain operations are enhanced by the gains American auto makers and their suppliers made over the past decade. Together the entire supply chain is able to work together as a lean organization providing state of the art technology that allows communication around the world. The end result is that everything they are doing is flexible. The concept takes advantage of enterprise supply chain management systems and gives partners the ability to communicate electronically as never before. This new dynamic has allowed ABC Company to become a leaner more efficient automotive manufacturer as well as a leader in global supply chain innovation and technology.

The entire global supply chain is benefitting from a century of lessons learned and good leadership. One thing is certain, ABC Company is indeed a company that continues to embrace technology, continuously implements lean principles, and uses innovation to achieve success. Market share has expanded allowing the creation of global alliances in India, China, and several regions in Europe. This expansion has posed greater challenges for ABC to maintain lean principles and continuous improvements. This allows the overall corporate strategies to move forward and take hold as the company continues to grow. It is fair to say the company is out of the woods and they are seeing the rewards of hard work, austerity, and strong organizational leadership. The business model put in place and used today will take ABC Company into the next chapter and the next 50 years of successful business.

**REFERENCES**


Onica, T., The Results Are In, Actionline, November 2002, pp.28 – 30
INTERNATIONAL BANKING INDUSTRY AND CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY

Firuza S Madrakhimova
University of North America, USA

ABSTRACT

This paper provides an overview of international banking and corporate social responsibility. The concept of CSR is underpinned by the idea that banks can no longer act as isolated economic entities operating in detachment from broader society and historical aspects of different countries are very important as well as the financial condition of banking systems. This study determines the specific characteristics of international banks in different countries, and it has been determined at the conclusion that the most popular and easy to implement model is American model of CSR.

Keywords: Corporate Social Responsibility, International Banking, Banks, Stakeholders.

INTRODUCTION

Ever since the dawn of the industrial age, debate has raged over whether or not companies carry a responsibility solely to make profit, or whether they have a responsibility to the society from which they generate a profit. Today, social responsible banking has become a well-established notion in the financial services industry.

There are two basic approaches to the management of CSR. First, when the company determines the extent of their contribution to society, and the second involves the production of state and society, binding or declarative requirements to business. In the context of this dilemma, see the difference between formed in the United States and Europe models of CSR. Depending on the version of its solution model is "Delivering open" (in the U.S.) and "hidden", over-regulated (in Europe). The openness of the American model of the nature of CSR must entrepreneurship in the U.S., based on the maximum freedom and self-limiting nature of the subjects of many spheres of public life.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The banking industry is considered the engine of an economy. It provides necessity in nature to the society and whose policies and decisions can largely affect public interest (Miles, 1987).
Banks manage financial risks, monitor borrowers and organize payment system (Greenbaum and Thakor, 2007), which helps to improve market efficiency. Numerous studies have assessed how banks affect the economy. Levine (2004) and Scholtens (2006) suggest that the banking system is playing an important role in economics and sustainable development.

The role of banks makes them highly influential to the society. Socially responsible bank behavior is becoming a well-established notion in financial service (Scholtens, 2008). Investors raised their awareness towards the importance of transparency of banks, as well as the threat of environmental and social risk. Instead of merely focus on maximizing the benefit of stakeholders, banks are expected to care the well being of the whole society when they make their decisions, as impact of a wrong decision can be disastrous to the society.

CSR disclosure has been the subject of substantial academic research; however, relatively little has been undertaken focusing on CSR disclosure by banks (e.g. Branco and Rodrigues, 2008; Douglas et al., 2004; Tarna, 1999). Banking is considered as one of the major contributing sectors behind economic stability and growth, and it is highly visible to public evaluation. It has a wide spectrum of stakeholders, which include owners, borrowers, depositors, regulators, and managers (Yamak and Suer, 2005).

The main aim of the article is to analyze concept of CSR in different country's banking industry.

**METHODOLOGY**

There has been important phenomenological research conducted to understand the experience of banks about corporate social responsibility and to discover the essence of other types CSR experience.

Creswell mention that researchers designing qualitative studies need clear criteria in mind and need to provide rationales for their decisions.

Qualitative researcher examined the typology of 16 strategies for purposeful sampling advanced by Miles and Huberman (1994). In this research, researcher use maximum variation, criterion and convenience.

According to Creswell, “it is essential that all participants experience the phenomenon being studies in phenomenological study. “Criterion” sampling works well when all individuals studied represent people who have experienced the phenomenon. All individuals meet the criterion”

According to McCracken, for a phenomenological study, the process of collecting information involves primarily in-depth interviews with as many as 10 individuals.
KEY FINDINGS

Historically, banks have often been the object of dissatisfaction, distress and critique, especially by customers in economically challenging circumstances. Today, however, banks have risen to be advocates for environmentally and socially responsible practices. In addition to funding ethical causes, banks have begun to carry responsibility in denying funding for questionable projects. By rejecting some contracts, banks can obtain more business from highly regarded customers, who are conscious of the gained good reputation. An increasing amount of customers are choosing their banking institutions according to which actions the banks do not partake in.

Banks have, in general, many industry specific responsibilities. As a number of offered products and services are largely mere promises at the time of agreement, there is a great deal of responsibility in conveying all relevant information and advice available. Customer orientation leads to responsibility also in knowing specific customers’ needs, wants, etc. in order to be aware of the full financial situation of and best policies for said customer. Knowing the customer has also a legislative implication in unacceptable business transactions (e.g. money laundering). Regulation for consumer protection is characteristic in the financial area. Strict regulation aspires to minimize imperfections and provide optimal competitive conditions. (Decker 2004, 715-716).

We have found main peculiarities in Anglo-Saxon (USA, Australia), Asian (China, Japan), European countries (Germany), and in emerging markets (Russia).

USA

In the U.S., charity is not limited to the sphere of art and culture, but also of science, university education and health care, which is not the European countries, where high taxes have led to the transfer of responsibility for the funding of these areas of the State. The European model of CSR involves setting the state of more or less stringent legal standards require companies to strictly follow the principles of social responsibility, i.e. CSR in Europe is mandatory. Relevant laws exist in Sweden, Holland, France, etc.

Regardless of the types of CSR model in one country or another, all are developed by state law. In the U.S., the ethical codes of corporate governance, federal and local acts, standards and guidelines are designed to encourage socially responsible behavior by banks and companies. In 1977, the U.S. Congress passed a law on municipal reinvestment - CRA (Community Reinvestment Act), directing U.S. banks to invest in companies located in the area where the banking transactions. CRA is the main tool to promote social inclusion of banks at the local level. And although the law does not provide for any sanctions, the mechanisms of the document are very effective.

Separate laws specifically addressed TNC Act Foreign Corrupt Practices (Foreign Corrupt Practices Act - FCPA); Law Civil Rights (The Alien Tort Claims Act), which gives foreign
nationals the right of complainants to the federal courts in the United States U.S. subsidiaries for acts committed in violation of U.S. law and international law.

In 2002, the US joined the Law of the Sarbanes-Oxley Act, obliging public companies whose shares are traded in the United States, to follow the advanced standards of corporate reporting, which now include the non-financial aspects of risk management. Another instrument of regulation of corporate responsibility at the international level is the "Private Investment Corporation" (OPIC - Overseas Private Investment Corporation), one of whose functions - insurance investment by U.S. companies from financial and political risks in more than 150 countries. OPIC requires work to get insurance companies contributed to the development of home countries of foreign production, environmental protection, respect for international labor law and human rights. These requirements are set out in the contracts, and OPIC and requires compliance by subcontractors. Social orientation has a mechanism of public tenders, which commits the company adhere to the "highest standards" of U.S. businesses abroad.

AUSTRALIA

Banks in Australia, as in most developed countries, have suffered badly in reputational terms over recent years. There is a perception, particularly among regional Australians, that banks don't want their business or, at the very least, take them for granted. Branch closures in regional Australia remain a sensitive issue. And of course, the people who suffer most from this negative feedback are the front-line bank personnel who deals with customers.

Despite the obvious public disquiet, and even hostility, with the behavior of banks, you will still find senior people in this industry, who quietly believe that short-term shareholder value is all that counts. And in some areas, attention paid to the challenge of corporate social responsibility is done reluctantly, inadequately and without the conviction required to make any real difference to corporate culture or behavior.

CHINA

China, as a developing country, continuously fosters the idea of social responsibility, which is critical to harmonious society and scientific development. The corporate social responsibility (CSR) is not only in line with the expectation of society, but is also helping to enhance the management, competitiveness and the brand image. In general, it will promote sustainable development, an important tag in the new round of market competition.

In recent years, China's banking institutions have established and improved their CSR management system, as well as made innovations and explorations in many fields in relation to the CSR. Many banks formulate relevant strategic plans, which identify the pivotal issues, make commitments, translate them into practice, and take the initiative in accepting public oversight. The banking institutions accumulate experiences during the process and some good experience and practices are shared with foreign banks. The efforts made by China's banking
sector won the affirmation at home and abroad, which help to shape the responsible image of Chinese banking sector and foster the coordinated social and financial development.

The China Banking regulatory Commission (CBRC) is established to supervise the banking institutions to mitigate the risks, transform growth pattern, serve the real economy and fully honor social responsibility.

First, to serve the real economy. The CBRC encouraged banks to channel more credit resources to the national key areas and strategic emerging industries, and the financially weak areas like agriculture and small-and micro-enterprises, restrain the credit input in the highly polluting, energy intensive and over-capacity sectors.

Second, to develop green credit. The banking institutions are guided to formulate the policies and procedures for green credit, integrating the green credit with CSR requirement, environmental and social risk control and credit restructuring, to deliver the win-win outcome between shareholder value and public welfare.

Third, to promote financial inclusion. The banking institutions should put people’s interests first when fulfilling social responsibility; enhance the basic financial service in rural branches, ensure customers in the remote rural areas have access to the basic financial services and share the fruits of the reform and development of the banking sector.

Fourth, to protect the customer interests. The banking institutions are guided to improve the customer complaints handling mechanism, ensuring fair, timely and proper treatment of customers’ complaints. The financial service to the disabled should be improved, fully respect and protect their legal rights and fair access to financial service. Banks, with their professional knowledge and information, should take initiative in educating financial customers, so as to enhance their customers’ ability in identifying and managing financial risks.

Under the guidance of CBRC, China’s Banking Association, with its self-disciplinary and coordination function, actively promotes the banking institutions to fulfill their CSR and guide its members towards a professional and systematic approach. In recent years, the establishment of College on China’s Banking Sector Social Responsibility clearly upholds the philosophy of “responsible banks promoting harmonious development”. The annual report on the social responsibility was released in four consecutive years and a comprehensive index-based assessment framework has been set up. All the efforts have fostered effective and continuous commitments in carrying out the social responsibility and won the applause and trust from the entire society, which is helpful in promoting the sustainable and healthy development of the banking industry.

2012 is the second year of the 12th year plan. The CBRC will continuously urge the banking institutions to serve the real economy, satisfy consumers' various financial needs, fulfill the
social responsibility, and engage actively with economy, society and environment, making bigger contribution to the steady and smooth economic development

JAPAN

CSR can be complex and difficult to understand because it comprises a variety of perspectives and also means different things to different people at different times. However, by tracing their origins, we find that several different approaches merged simultaneously to form CSR in contemporary Japan. Japan uses following approaches in CSR in banking system:

1. Corporate Ethics Approach

As explained above, when corporate scandals led to bankruptcies and poor performance after 2000, it raised alarms and raised the imperative of establishing better corporate ethics. As long as companies exist, corporate ethics will always be an issue affecting not only risk management, but compliance and corporate governance.

Focusing on corporate sustainability, this approach puts corporate ethics at the center of CSR, and seeks effective strategy formulation and implementation. Corporate ethics, of course, includes the problem Japanese companies are notorious for—concealment and secrecy.

2. Stakeholder Approach

In Japan’s company-centered economy and society, companies were able to coerce stakeholders to put the company’s interests first and foremost. Companies thus largely neglected investor relations, and did little to fill the information gap with consumers. Large companies offered long-term employment, and in return demanded loyalty from employees. They also held suppliers and contractors captive in the pyramid-shaped keiretsu structure.

3. Sustainability Approach

Sustainability at the global level addresses two issues—the global environment and ecology, and global community. Indeed, the term sustainability itself derives from the biological sciences. As the limits of the earth’s capacity become clear, the CSR debate has transcended individual societies and focused on how companies should act with respect to the global environment and ecology.

Finally, the implementation issues of Japan’s CSR can be divided into a global agenda and local agenda. The global agenda primarily involves issues to ensure sustainability of the global environment and ecology and global community, as described above.
GERMANY

Talking about CSR and banking in Germany a huge attention is paid to the education issues. So in recommendations Report of the National CSR Forum to the German Government it is mentioned that the education system should be encouraged to incorporate the subject of socially responsible investment into its instruction in general and into initial and continuing training in the banking sector in particular. Socially responsible investment should therefore be a topic covered in secondary school and university and in vocational training for banking-related occupations.

In socially responsible investment terms Germany is a contradiction. The country is considered by many as one of the pioneers of post war environmentalism and social reform. Yet German financial institutions are amongst the European laggards in adopting environmentally and socially informed approaches to investment.

It worth to mention, that ethical banking is booming in Germany. Financial institutions such as GLS Bank, Umwelt Bank and EthikBank are luring customers with a social and ecologically sound approach, insuring that their money won’t be used to fund nuclear energy, genetic engineering, child labor or arms companies.

The most important trigger to increase CSR activities of banks in Germany is the investment sector that more and more demands from companies to set in place CSR strategies.

RUSSIA

CSR conception in banks of Russia got its extension not due to foreign corporations in financial sector, but as a result of necessity of national enterprises and banks extension and implementation of activity beyond the country borders.

There is also dependence between the size of the business and the CSR level: the highest positions are taken by corporations with the biggest asset values, and they are presented not only in every region of Russia, but also abroad. Thereby, the financial service market of Ukraine is open for VTB Bank, Sberbank of Russia, BM Bank, Alfa Bank; this indicates their aggressive policy in the realm and constant improvement of social standards in order to go to new markets.

Predominance of agents with big values of assets in this rating is explained by the fact that most banks on such a huge territory of the country are regional, and the values of their activity do not let bear costs on financing of social projects of a state level, which automatically leads to exclusion of such agents out of the list of the most socially responsible ones. This makes difference in understanding of the CSR concept: in Russia it is identified with charity and social activity, in developed countries – with a continual process of social dialogue that results in profits for not only interacting subjects, but also the bank itself despite the size of its business.
Russian banks adopt in their practice mostly the American model of CSR; they realize their social activity through help to children, public health and environmental protection. Despite the growth of the general number of projects, their average value within the post-crisis period has considerably decreased (figure 10), which emphasizes one of the main peculiarities of the model of CSR given: financing of the social sphere is accomplished on the assumption of how effective the bank worked within a certain time period.

CONCLUSION

The banking sector is in a leading position in discharging Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) in the country and the CSR practices by banks have become an integral part of their business in recent years. CSR ensures trade-off between economic and social goals of the efficient utilization of scarce resources. The banking sector can, in the course of their intermediation role, contribute a lot in this regard. CSR practices by banks not only improve their own standards but also catalyze the socially responsible behavior of other businesses. Banking industry itself can also be benefited from the positive effects of CSR on the society as a whole, particularly on its clients. So, the role of banks for pursuing appropriate CSR practices in the society, especially in a developing country like ours, need to be duly emphasized.

In developed countries, there are various incentives and regulatory bindings to promote socially responsible behavior of business and a good number of financial institutions are responding positively towards the society through philanthropy, community investment, employee empowerment, equitable social practice, safeguarding environment and doing social and environmental reporting. However, the status of CSR has not been satisfactory in many developing and least developed countries, largely due to lack of awareness, poor enforcement of existing laws and inadequate pressure from civil society and interest groups.

CSR, also known as corporate responsibility, corporate citizenship, responsible business, sustainable responsible business (SRB), or corporate social performance, is all but a form of corporate self-regulation integrated into a business model where companies manage the business processes to produce an overall positive impact on society. CSR has been defined in various ways in different countries, of about being the capacity building for sustainable livelihoods from Ghana to about giving back to society from Philippines.

Conventionally, in the United States, CSR has been presented in a philanthropic model whereby companies make profits and then they donate a certain share of the profits to charitable causes. It is seen as tainting the act for the company to receive any benefit from the giving. As such, according to Caroll (2003), "The social responsibility of business encompasses the economic, legal, ethical and discretionary (philanthropic) expectations that society has of organizations at a given point in time."

The European model is much more focused on operating the core business in a socially responsible way, complemented by investment in communities for solid business case reasons and voluntary interaction with the stakeholders. Ideally and broadly, the concept of CSR is a
built-in, self-regulating mechanism whereby business would monitor and ensure its support to law, ethical standards, and international norms.

REFERENCES


WHOSE CULTURE HAS LEADERSHIP? SUGGESTING LEADERSHIP CAPITAL TO YOSSO’S MODEL OF COMMUNITY CULTURAL WEALTH

JeeHae Helen Lee
Troy University Dothan Campus, USA

ABSTRACT

Reflecting upon the researcher’s prior teaching experience as an immigrant teacher, this study poses questions about the leadership of culturally marginalized people in the U.S. public schools and how their leadership is perceived by the mainstream culture. Leadership can be one of the strengths that immigrant teachers may possess. There are enough number of findings describing the skills and abilities of immigrant teachers. Interestingly, however, these research findings have not recognized one of the essential characteristics of immigrant teachers: leadership. Have we been consistent in our effort to keep critical perspective in assessing the qualities and strengths of the culturally marginalized? What about their leadership? The existing knowledge about immigrant teachers focuses on immigrant teachers’ assets but still pin them down at the level of followers under the mainstream culture. Can we take a step further and attempt to view them as ‘leaders’ rather than simple followers of the discourses of the mainstream culture? Drawing on this concern and building on Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth (aspirational capital, familial capital, linguistic capital, navigational capital, resistant capital, and social capital), this phenomenological study of three immigrant teachers focuses on their strengths with an emphasis on their leadership. I propose here a leadership capital that immigrant teachers bring with them to the U.S. public schools. This leadership capital hopefully serves as the seventh form of community cultural wealth and compliments Yosso’s theory. I begin by examining two concepts: first, Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth that have been articulated in the literature on critical race theory aimed at recognizing prejudice against the culturally marginalized and promoting social justice; second, leadership that is defined by Biddle (2012) in her book, The Three Rs of Leadership (e.g., relationship, reciprocal learning, and reflection). I then discuss the findings from this phenomenological study of three immigrant teachers. I apply Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth when I describe the strengths of immigrant teachers. In addition to the six forms of community cultural wealth of these three immigrant teachers, I add one more common quality observed from the three participants, that is, leadership. Leadership is one of the most distinctive strengths displayed by these participants. Then the limitations of Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth are discussed. In this examination, I specifically point out that there is no room for the discussion of
the aspects of leadership in Yosso’s community cultural wealth. Next I discuss the examples of leadership demonstrated by the immigrant teachers. In this discussion, the examples of leadership are discussed in terms of Biddle’s three Rs of leadership: relationship, reciprocal learning, and reflection. In conclusion, I bring these visions together to put forward the possibilities of suggesting and adding Leadership Capital as a new additional form of the community cultural wealth in the hope of complimenting Yosso’s model of community cultural wealth. I also discuss the limitations of this work for its focus on only female immigrant teachers’ leadership without representing the leadership attribute of male immigrant teachers. I conclude this paper with implications of this study on the U.S. public schools and the teacher education.

Keywords: Leadership, Immigrant Teachers, Community Cultural Wealth, Cultural Capital, Internationally Educated Teachers, Bilingual Teachers, Minority Teachers

A STORY OF MY OWN

Let me begin with a story of my own. When I was working as an English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) teacher in an elementary school, I experienced something interesting that made me think about whose culture has leadership. When the school district where I worked changed the ESOL instructional model from pull-out (a traditional model in which ESOL students were pulled out of their classrooms to receive the ESOL instruction) to push-in (a collaborative teaching model in which ESOL teachers taught ESOL students in their classrooms collaboratively with their classroom teachers), many ESOL teachers and classroom teachers were struggling with how to work together. So I developed a Collaboration Focused School Model (CFS Model): a collaboration model that provided both ESOL and classroom teachers with tools to make their collaboration easy, effective, and enjoyable. It was working well for my school. The progress reports showed our ESOL students’ constantly increasing academic performances, and their standardized testing scores were going up like a thermometer in boiling water. I thought that since this model was working for my school, it might work for other schools as well. It seemed that this new model might be a good solution for the challenges that other ESOL teachers faced when they were working with classroom teachers. So I talked to the director of ESOL department in my school district about this collaboration model and asked her if I could share it with other schools. To my surprise, the director did not want me to and told me, “You are just a teacher. I want you to do what we ask you to do.” I thought about other ESOL teachers who often shared their instructional strategies with other schools in the past with the permission of this same director. It made me think, “Wait a minute…although this ESOL director allowed other ESOL teachers to share their knowledge, why does she say that I cannot? What made this ESOL director think that I am not qualified to share my knowledge and should do only what I am told to do?” It seemed that this ESOL director viewed me as an immigrant with a little bit of Korean accent who still has a lot to learn about mainstream American culture no matter how long I have been living in the United States. Perhaps it is even out of the question for this ESOL director that I teach American teachers about a great way to collaborate with each other. I thought to myself, ‘Well, I may have a little bit of Korean accent when I speak English. But I am a teacher with Ph.D. degree and many
international teaching and learning experiences. I have a lot to offer to this school district and want to share my experiences and abilities with others because I want to contribute to the improvement of the quality of children's learning here. Most importantly, I am not just a follower. I am a leader as well. Being an immigrant teacher does not mean that I should only learn and follow the norms of the mainstream culture. I have leadership skills and shall be given a chance to exercise it! With this resolution, I contacted the Director of Curriculum and Instruction Department about this collaboration model. Fortunately, she gave me thirty minutes to present this model at the board of education. To make things interesting, this director invited to the presentation my ESOL director, who initially rejected my offer to share this collaboration model with other teachers. The presentation went well and this collaboration model was extremely well accepted by the Director of the Curriculum and Instruction Department. She not only complimented me on the collaboration model that I developed but also asked me to train other school teachers with this model during the upcoming professional development day. Interestingly the ESOL director had to agree with her decision. And three years after that event, this collaboration model has been well accepted by the schools in the Southeast region of the United States. And I have received invitations from several conferences to present this collaboration model and have inspired many teachers to be advocates of a collaborative teaching. Well...who said that I can't lead? And whose culture owns leadership?

Moment of Reflection

Why did the director of the ESOL department reject my initial offer to share the collaboration model with other schools? Part of the reason is because I was an immigrant teacher. Being an immigrant teacher in the U.S. public school system means that often times I am expected to passively learn and follow the norms of mainstream culture as an outsider. Pierre Bourdieu (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977) debated that the knowledge of the upper and middle classes are counted as capital that is valuable to a hierarchical society. Yosso (2005) argued that “if one is not born into a family whose knowledge is already deemed valuable,” one could then be assumed to “lack the social and cultural capital required for social mobility” (p. 70). Applying Bourdieu’s and Yosso’s arguments to my story shared above, an immigrant teacher like me is often perceived as marginalized due to the assumed lack of cultural capital that is most likely to be possessed by American teachers from the mainstream culture. As a result, schools often work from this assumption in perceiving immigrant teachers and expect them to be learners and followers of the mainstream culture. The schools are not likely to portray these culturally marginalized teachers as someone who can educate or lead other teachers of the mainstream culture. In other words, the schools often fail to recognize the immigrant teachers as competent professionals who possess leadership.

This anecdote led me to think about the leadership of culturally marginalized people and how their leadership is perceived by the mainstream culture. Leadership can be one of the strengths that immigrant teachers may possess. As I have searched for research studies about the strengths that immigrant teachers bring with them to the U.S. public schools, I have noticed an interesting phenomenon: there are enough findings about the skills and abilities of immigrant teachers but there is little discussion about their leadership skills. For example, the
existing research studies listed a number of strengths that the immigrant teachers possessed, such as serving as role models for students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds (Clewell & Villegas, 2001), providing more culturally relevant instruction (Ladson-Billings, 1995), helping to bridge differences between these students' home cultures and schools (Clewell & Villegas, 2001; Genzuk & Baca, 1998) as their "cultural translators" (Irvine, 1990, p. 51), and "enriching the school environment and the curriculum" (Nieto, 1999, p. 330) by providing alternate perspectives on appropriate and effective practices for all students (Banks, 1993). Like the aforementioned researchers illuminated the strengths of the culturally marginalized, which often go unrecognized in the U.S. schools, Yosso also empowered the culturally marginalized by outlining six forms of community cultural wealth which are unrecognized assets that culturally marginalized people bring with them to schools. Yosso made a significant contribution in shifting the research lens away from a deficit view of culturally marginalized communities and instead focused on the capital they possessed.

Interestingly, however, these research findings have not recognized one of the essential characteristics of immigrant teachers: leadership. Although the existing knowledge about immigrant teachers has successfully illuminated the capital that they bring with them to the U.S. public schools, I would like to carefully raise these questions: have we been consistent in our effort to keep critical perspective in assessing the qualities and strengths of the culturally marginalized? What about their leadership? The existing knowledge about immigrant teachers focuses on immigrant teachers' assets but still pin them down at the level of followers under the mainstream culture. Can we take a step further and empower them as "leaders" rather than simple followers of the discourses of the mainstream culture?

Drawing on this concern, building on Yosso's six forms of community cultural wealth, and this phenomenological study of three immigrant teachers with its focus on their strengths including their leadership, I propose here a leadership capital that immigrant teachers bring with them to the U.S. public schools. This leadership capital hopefully serves as the seventh form of community cultural wealth and complements Yosso's theory. I begin by examining two concepts: first, Yosso's community cultural wealth that has been articulated in the literature on critical race theory aimed at recognizing prejudice against the culturally marginalized and promoting social justice; second, leadership that is defined by Biddle (2012) in her book, The Three Rs of Leadership.

I then discuss the findings from this phenomenological study of three immigrant teachers. There are seven different strengths these immigrant teachers bring with them to the U.S. public schools. I will apply Yosso's six forms of community cultural wealth when I describe these strengths. Then the limitations of Yosso's six forms of community cultural wealth will be discussed. In this examination, I will specifically point out that there is no room for the discussion of the aspects of leadership in Yosso's community cultural wealth; how Yosso's model views these culturally marginalized teachers as followers of the mainstream culture, thus fails to recognize the immigrant teachers' strengths as potential leaders.
In conclusion, I bring these visions together to put forward the possibilities of suggesting and adding Leadership Capital as a new, additional form of the community cultural wealth. I also discuss the limitations of her work for its focus on only female immigrant teachers’ leadership without representing the leadership attribute of male immigrant teachers. I conclude this paper with implications of this study on the U.S. public schools and the teacher education.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Community Cultural Wealth

In order to discuss Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth, I need to briefly explain critical race theory in education. Critical race theory in education can be described as a framework that many scholars use in order to “theorize, examine and challenge the ways race and racism implicitly and explicitly impact on” (Yosso, 2005, p.70) social interactions, practices, and discourses in education. Since late 1980s, there has been collective scholarly effort to critique and challenge traditional interpretations of Bourdieuean cultural capital theory (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977). In Bourdieuean cultural capital theory, the knowledges of the middle upper classes are perceived as valuable in a dominant culture. Thus the dominant discourses negate any attempts to theorize the experiences that are influenced by cultures outside the mainstream such as histories of migration, cross-fertilization of knowledge and cross-cultural interactions (Subedi, 2008). This Bourdieuean cultural capital theory seems to privilege people from the mainstream culture and marginalize some immigrants or minorities for their lack of cultural capital.

Yosso (2005) challenged such dominant discourses that silenced these culturally marginalized by using critical race theory that attempted to center the marginalized in hierarchical society. She critiqued the assumption that socially and culturally marginalized people came to schools with cultural deficiencies. Yosso argued that the traditional view of cultural capital is not the only one that is considered valuable. She drew on the work of sociologists Melvin Oliver and Thomas Shapiro (1995) to better comprehend how cultural capital is in fact only one of the forms of many different aspects that might be deemed valuable. This view is well represented in Figure 1. The work of these critical race theory advocates centered the research lens on the experiences of marginalized groups and revealed accumulated assets and resources utilized in the histories and lives of marginalized groups. Through this lens, Yosso recognized that marginalized groups foster community cultural wealth through at least 6 forms of capital. Then she introduced these 6 forms of capital which she defined as “an array of knowledge, skills, abilities, and contacts possessed and utilized by communities of color to survive, and resist macro and micro-forms of oppression” (p. 77). The six forms of community cultural wealth are comprised of aspirational capital, familial capital, linguistic capital, navigational capital, resistant capital and social capital. The definitions of these six forms of capital are as follows:
Figure 1: A Model of Community Cultural Wealth. Adapted From: Oliver & Shapiro, 1995

1. Aspirational capital is described as “the ability to maintain hopes and dreams for the future, even in the face of real and perceived barriers (p.77)” Those who possess aspirational capital demonstrate a sense of resiliency in which they consistently motivate themselves to dream big beyond their current circumstances, frequently without the means to achieve their goals. Yosso drew this form of cultural wealth from the work of Patricia Gándara (1982, 1995) and others (Delgado-Gaitan, 1992, 1994; Solórzano, 1992; Auerbach, 2001) who have shown that Chicanas/os maintained consistently high expectations for their children’s future to break the links between parents’ current socioeconomic status and their children’s future academic attainment, even though their children experienced the lowest educational outcomes compared to every other group in the United States.

2. Familial capital is defined as “cultural knowledges nurtured among familia (kin) that carry a sense of community history, memory and cultural intuition (ibid.). Yosso expanded the concept of family in order to establish a more broad understanding of kinship. This concept of extended family includes ‘immediate family (living or long passed on), aunts, uncles, grandparents and friends who we might consider part of our familia (ibid.). This form of cultural wealth engages a commitment to community well-being and can be fostered within and between families, as well as through sports, school, religious gatherings and other social community settings. Experiencing similar sociocultural challenges, marginalized groups realize that they are not the only ones who deal with their problems, and model lessons of caring and coping among/for each other.

3. Linguistic capital refers to “the intellectual and social skills attained through communication experiences in more than one language and/or style” (ibid.) Yosso drew this form of cultural wealth from over 35 years of research about the value of bilingual education with its focus on the connections between racialized cultural history and language (Cummins, 1986; Anzaldúa, 1987; Darder, 1991; García & Baker, 1995; Macedo & Bartolomé, 1999; Gutierrez, 2002). Linguistic capital highlights that marginalized groups not only come to school with multiple language and communication skills but also possess more linguistic and cognitive abilities than
monolingual speakers from the mainstream culture. This result is because speaking more than one language means owning the knowledge of more than one social and cultural belief (Cook, 1999). Extending on this idea, Cook suggested a new term to address these marginalized people: multicompetent speakers instead of failed or deficient native speakers. In addition, Yosso (2005) pointed out that the marginalized communities often participated in “a storytelling tradition that may include listening to and recounting oral histories, parables, stories, and proverbs” (p. 79). These storytelling abilities are comprised of various skills such as “memorization, attention to detail, dramatic pauses, comedic timing, facial affect, vocal tone, volume, rhythm and rhyme” (ibid).

4. Navigational capital is described as “skills of maneuvering through social institutions,” more specifically, the ability to maneuver through institutions not designed with socioculturally marginalized groups in mind. For example, when immigrant students try to pursue educational degrees in higher education, they often navigate through university systems that are not so friendly to immigrants. However, they may demonstrate their navigational capital through their abilities to “sustain high levels of achievement, despite the presence of stressful events and conditions that place them at risk of doing poorly at school and, ultimately, dropping out of school” (Alva, 1991, p. 19).

5. Resistant capital means “knowledges and skills fostered through oppositional behavior that challenges inequalities” (Freire, 1970, 1973; Giroux, 1983; McLaren, 1994; Solórzano & Delgado Bernal, 2001). The idea of this capital drew on the legacy of resistance to subordination exhibited by marginalized communities (Deloria, 1969). Yosso reflected that maintaining and passing on various community cultural wealth is also part of resistant capital. Yosso also added that their motivation to work toward social justice when they recognize the structural nature of oppression (Freire, 1970) can transform such oppressive structures (Pizarro, 1998; Villenas & Deyhle, 1999).

6. Social capital refers to “networks of people and community resources” (Yosso, 2005, p. 79). Marginalized communities demonstrate this type of cultural wealth by providing each other with instrumental and emotional support. Yosso noted that historically, marginalized people have utilized their social capital to achieve education, legal justice, employment and health care. For example, immigrants to the United States could create and maintain their supportive social networks through mutualistas or mutual aid societies (Gómez-Quiñones, 1973, 1994; Gutman, 1976; Stevenson, 1996).

Yosso (2005) stated that these six forms of community cultural wealth were “not mutually exclusive or static, but rather are dynamic processes that build on one another as part of community cultural wealth” (p. 77). For example, aspirations are nurtured “within social and familial contexts, often through linguistic storytelling and advice that offer specific navigational goals to challenge (resist) oppressive conditions” (ibid.). Therefore, aspirational capital lies over “each of the other forms of capital [such as] familial, linguistic, navigational, resistant and social capital” (ibid.).
Yosso deemed deficit thinking as “one of the most prevalent forms of contemporary racism in the U.S. schools” (p. 75). Yosso’s notion of community cultural wealth challenged the deficit thinking and made a significant contribution in shifting research lens away from the deficit thinking and directing research focus to capital possessed by culturally marginalized people. But would the marginalized be perceived as “leaders” in the mainstream culture? As my story indicated in the beginning of this study, this idea may not be easily accepted by people from a mainstream culture, yet. Although advocates of critical race theory have had a significant contribution in increasing the awareness of capital possessed by the culturally marginalized, I still would like to pose these questions: can we do more to empower marginalized people? Is there a cultural wealth that these marginalized communities bring to the mainstream culture that was not recognized in Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth? The findings of this study about immigrant teachers positively respond to these questions with yes. Immigrant teachers may be easily perceived as competent teachers who act as accepted members of school who understand and successfully perform the duties and responsibilities set by the school. However, how often are immigrant teachers viewed as professionals with leadership skills proactively advising and guiding teachers from a mainstream culture? Before I start discussing the findings of immigrant teachers’ strengths, I would like to explore the concept of leadership in school. What is leadership? How is leadership viewed in school? The people’s perception of leadership in school may influence their attitudes and beliefs about who owns leadership and who are entitled to exercise leadership in school. I will discuss the leadership in school in the following section.

Leadership

Leadership can be defined as the capability of an individual to influence the thoughts, attitudes, and behavior of others (Leadership: Theory and Practice, 2008). The discussion of leadership in this study is influenced by Biddle’s (2012) concept of leadership, which emphasizes the aspect of human relationships. When it comes to leadership or leadership positions at school, many people think of only school principals, assistant principals, and instructional lead teachers. However, Biddle (2012) debunked that paradigm and claims that “leaders are not just those individuals with leadership degrees or leadership positions. They are teachers...of early childhood programs or elementary schools...”(p.3). Biddle’s claim critically reflects on two aspects: first, it is a misconception that leadership belongs to only school administrators; second, teachers in elementary schools are not just followers but leaders as well and can exercise leadership skills as school administrators do. Then why do many people perceive school administrators as leaders and teachers as followers? The answer is found in an explanation of the factory leadership model in education.

Since 1930s, the predominant definition of a leader for decades has been “the one who leads.” This idea of leadership is based on factory leadership model in which decisions are made from the top and passed down to the workers. This linear and bureaucratic view of leadership influenced the K-12 schools as well: leaders are usually school principals and teachers were instructed what to do, how to do it, and when to do it. There was a clear demarcation between
leader and follower. Biddle (2012) points out that this delineation of leaders apart from other members of school is problematic because it disseminates the factory leadership model and excludes “the building of a more collaborative, collegial, shared leadership model” (p.7).

However, since the social reforms of the 1960s and 1970s, initiated by Presidents John F. Kennedy and Lyndon B. Johnson (e.g., educational experimentation with open schools and values clarification), and the release of the landmark report A Nation at Risk: The Imperative for Educational Reform (1983), leadership thought in education has been shifted from the factory leadership model to “an influence relationship among leaders and followers who intend real changes that reflect their mutual purposes” (Rost, 1991, p.102). Although Rost used the word followers which sounds like a term consistent with top-down factory leadership model, he explained his use of the word this way: “In a postindustrial frame, leaders are not equated with managers, so followers are not equated with subordinates. Since leaders can be anyone, followers can be anyone” (p.108). He goes on to say,

Followers do not do followership, they do leadership. Both leaders and followers form one relationship that is leadership. They are in the leadership relationship together. They are the ones who intend real changes that reflect their mutual purposes. Followers and leaders develop a relationship wherein they influence one another as well as the organization and society, and that are leadership. (p.109)

Biddle (2012) noticed that the concept of educational leadership has changed corresponding with these major societal movements of the time. For example, the civil rights and women’s rights movements played significant roles in thinking about who might be a leader. Lambert (1998) redefined school leadership in her book, Building Leadership Capacity in Schools as follows:

…School leadership needs to be considered as a broad concept that is separated from person, role, and a discrete set of individual behaviors. It needs instead to be embedded in the school community as a whole... The key notion in this definition is that leadership is about learning together and constructing meaning and knowledge collectively and collaboratively (pp.5-6).

Lambert’s leadership suggests shared responsibilities for shared purposes of community, which contradict the factory leadership model. Her ideas are also informed by the constructivist position (Biddle, 2012). Leadership from a constructivist position is not about control or power, status, or position and is not tied to roles and responsibilities. Instead, leadership is tied to practice (Sergiovanni, 2007), to application of knowledge and to processes. Brownlee, et al. (2012) sum up leadership idea as follows:

effective leadership in elementary education and the roles of effective leaders...were (i) respect and valuing others, ...[having] a strong collaborative relationships, and
having a caring approach to leadership; (ii) effective use of resources; (iii) enabling others to participate…(p.25)

Reflecting upon leadership ideas of Biddle (2012), Lambert (1998), and Brownlee, et al. (2012), I can infer that anyone within the organization can exercise leadership by applying one’s knowledge for the common goal of community and by promoting a collaborative and caring relationship among community members.

Then what are the qualities of leadership? Biddle (2012) suggests the three Rs of leadership: Relationship, Reciprocal Learning, and Reflection.

1ST R: BEING IN RELATIONSHIP

Donaldson (2001) says the heartbeat of leadership is a relationship. He also suggests that good leadership is invitational. That implies that everyone is invited to be a leader. Leadership in elementary education can grow into a cooperative relationship where “individuals are both shapers of and shaped by one another” (Biddle, 2012, p.33). As major key ingredients of nurturing being in relationship, Biddle suggests, communication, time, the ability to handle conflict agreeably, trust, and respect. In other words, a leader who values being in a relationship in school, spends his/her time to be attentive to the needs of others, listening, caring, compassionate, and accepting. A leader is also committed to one another to support, nurture, and strengthen his/her relationship with one another and those in the school community (Gibbs, 2006)

2ND R: RECIPROCAL LEARNING

Reciprocal learning means “seeking professional growth for themselves, but also assume a sense of responsibility for the professional growth of their colleagues” (Biddle, 2012, p.46). The foundation of reciprocal learning at school is being in relationship with colleagues. According to Lambert (1998), leadership is about learning together and constructing meaning and knowledge collectively and collaboratively through peer observations, study groups, or examination of student data. Biddle (2012) interprets this kind of leadership as creating opportunities to inquire about and generating ideas together in collaborative work groups. That is, individuals can exercise leadership by seeking to critically reflect upon, and collectively make sense of their work in the light of shared beliefs about children and how they learn. Through this leadership exercise, these individuals can gain new insights and, thus, develop effective and intentional actions. Biddle (2002) emphasizes the importance of peer learning and entry-year mentoring in reciprocal learning.

Peer Learning. Examples of peer learning are peer observation and peer coaching. In peer observation, teachers observe other teachers who work with children of the same age or a different grade level. The teachers can meet to debrief their observations after the observation occurs. Biddle (2012) suggests that having a specific focus for these observations is so important. Peer coaching is an instrument that can be either formal or informal and established
among colleagues who are willing to advance their professional practice and learn with one another. Biddle emphasizes that the purpose of a peer observation or a peer coaching is not evaluation, but rather mutually improved practice on issues of specific concern to each of the participants.

Entry-year mentoring. In general, first-year teachers are often paired with more experienced teachers in a mentoring relationship. The purpose of this relationship is to support a new teacher to the field of education or to a school building, in learning the policies and procedures of school and in understanding “how we do things here.” The mentor usually gives a novice teacher support by answering questions, finding resources, and solving problems. Biddle (2012) suggests two key points to a mentoring relationship; first, the willingness of the mentor to assume additional responsibilities and, second, the openness of dialogue that results from this relationship. She suggests that good mentors provide the day-to-day feedback and coaching that can help the transition from novice to competent school leader. Importantly, Biddle also suggested that the mentor learn from the novice as well. This concept means that mentoring is not simply one way relationship but reciprocal relationship, mutually shaping beliefs about the organization and about students’ capabilities to learn. Thus, a well-working mentoring relationship enables both teachers to improve educational practices.

3RD R: REFLECTION: CRITICAL REFLECTION AND REFLECTIVE PRACTICE

Biddle (2012) identifies reflection in education as “being critically reflective about practice” and positions it as “an integral part of leadership thinking” (p.59). And she also adds that leadership thinking produces leadership actions and these acts impact teacher knowledge, student learning, and overall program effectiveness. Reflection allows teachers to take a moment to contemplate on what went well and what did not in their lessons and enable them to gain insight into what they can do to make those lessons better next time. Biddle suggests two concepts; critical reflection and reflective practice, and emphasizes the importance of understanding these terms, since reflection is not always critical and practice is not always reflective. Reflection becomes critical when it has two primary purposes: first, to understand how conditions of power or position can frame and distort interactions and educational processes and second, to question underlying assumptions, values, norms, and practices that are defined for us by others (Brookfield, 1995). Biddle explains this concept of critical reflection by using Rinaldi’s (2006) term re-cognition. This term implies that one can be aware again of what we know through rereading, discussing, and comparing our ideas with others. Biddle connects the meaning of this term to Lambert’s (1998) key notion of leadership, that is, learning together; constructing meaning and understanding collectively and collaboratively; discovering insights, standards, information, and suppositions; and using inquiry and reflection to produce new ideas, thus creating actions that grow out of these new understandings. And creating actions that grow out of those new understandings are the very idea of Biddle’s reflective practice. Biddle (2012) describes the relationship between critical reflection and reflective practice as follows: reflective practice is an outcome of critical reflection. Applying this notion into elementary education, reflective practices occur when teachers intentionally
use inquiry and reflection and change the existing educational system from schools of teaching to schools of learning (Rinaldi, 2006). Those teachers, who practice critical reflection and reflective practice, collaboratively use inquiry and various tools to engage multiple learning styles of all students and to respond to their interest and questions.

So who posses leadership in school? Certainly it is not just the school administrators. All teachers possess leadership and are invited to leadership roles in school as long as they are committed themselves in collaborative learning for the achievement of the common goal of their schools. These teachers posses the three Rs of leadership: relationship, reciprocal learning, and reflection. These leadership qualities are expressed through respectful, compassionate, and caring relationship with an effort to improve their teaching practices, using their critical reflection.

**METHOD**

The purpose of this study is to examine the qualities immigrant teachers bring with them to the U.S. public schools and ultimately to suggest a leadership capital as a new form of community cultural wealth. Specifically the focus was on the following research questions:

- Applying Yosso’s model to the qualities immigrant teachers bring with them to the U.S. schools, what are the forms of the community cultural wealth of immigrant teachers?
- What are the limitations of Yosso’s model in explaining the qualities of immigrant teachers?
- What suggestions can be made to strengthen the community cultural wealth model?
- What is the leadership capital?

To address these questions, a phenomenological research methodology was used as a philosophical approach. Open-ended interviews and bridling journal entries were used for data collection of the study. Phenomenological researchers such as Dahlberg, Dahlberg, and Nystrom (2008) suggested bridling as a necessary part of phenomenological study, which was defined as a process in which the researchers took an open stance, scrutinized his or her involvement with the phenomenon, and continually reflected upon how meanings “come to be” (p. 16) in the research. In an effort to constantly examine pre-understandings I might bring into this research and also to develop an understanding of the phenomenon of the study, I used bridling journal entries during the data collection and data analysis. These bridling journal entries served as a space to wonder, question, think, contradict or agree with theoretical frameworks and data of this study.

**PARTICIPANTS**

Three immigrant teachers were selected for this qualitative study. These participants have the following common traits:

- They were born outside the United States.
- They speak English as a second or foreign language.
They received formal education from K-12 in their mother countries.
They came to the United States as an adult.
They went through a credentialing process and are certified teachers in the United States.
They are currently working as full-time teachers in the U.S. public schools.

I made a conscious effort to select participants from different countries to help a larger number of immigrant teachers and people working with those teachers relate themselves to the findings of this study. One of the participants is from Singapore, another is from a European country; and the other is from the Republic of Colombia. Their names were referred to me as potential participants when I made an announcement about this study to the school district. The research proposal was approved by the Institutional Review Board of the University of Georgia and the consent form was sent out to, and signed by, the participants.

To protect the confidentiality of the participants, pseudonyms were used for their names as well as their school and school district names. Each participant picked her own pseudonym with which she felt most comfortable. The European participant chose “Annabel,” the Colombian participant chose “Mares,” and the Singaporean participant chose “Niang” as their names for this study. In terms of their home countries, one of the participants from a European country did not want to be identified by her country of origin. After a long discussion with the participant, we agreed to use simply “European” as her country of origin. However, two other participants felt comfortable to be identified by their countries of origin. Table 10 shows a brief summary of participants of this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 10: A Summary of Study Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annabel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angel Elementary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country of Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Teaching Position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Years in Teaching in the United States and the home country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of years in the U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Background</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DATA COLLECTION

The interview began in March, 2010. I met with each of the participants once a month, a total of five times between March and June, 2010. Approximately two to three hours were spent for each of these interviews. After the initial data analysis, between July and October, 2010, the follow-up interviews were conducted. The number of follow-up interviews varied depending on the participants. I had five follow up interviews with Annabel; six with Niang; and four with Mares.

As mentioned earlier, bridling journal entries were also collected as data. Bridling journal entries served as means to remain open to the phenomenon of investigation by actively practicing openness and humility throughout the data collection and data analysis. During the initial phase of the bridling journal entry, I wrote an initial bridling statement in mid-January, 2010, before the data collection began in March, 2010. In this statement, I wrote as much as I could about my pre-understandings of the qualities that immigrant teachers might have. Later I revisited this initial bridling statement through the data collection and analysis and used it in order to write new statements in the bridling journal entries. As data were collected and analyzed from March to October, 2010, I created a system to bridle. For example, a bridling journal entry was written and dated after each data collection event. After each interview, I transcribed it and wrote my learning from the transcript. Then these new understandings were compared to, and contrasted with, the initial bridling statement that was written in January, 2010. By doing so, I was able to see the differences and similarities between these two documents and interrogate, or question, my assumptions and pre-understandings about the investigated phenomenon.

DATA ANALYSIS

I used the whole-part-whole analysis advocated by Dahlberg, Dahlberg, and Nystrom (2008), Vagle (2009) and Van Manen (1990). In the first phase, I read the whole data collected such as interview transcripts, the initial bridling statement, and bridling journal entries without any interpretive work. After the initial reading of the whole data, the data were re-read several times until I found statements or phrases particularly essential or revealing about the phenomenon under investigation (Van Manen, 1990). Then I highlighted those statements or phrases and put brief descriptions of them. Comments or questions were also put on the margin. After I read the entire data and completed the first highlighting approach, the margin notes were reviewed in order to generate questions for the follow-up interviews with the participant. After the follow-up interview, I wrote bridling journal entries and repeated the highlighting approach. Then I moved (by copying and pasting electronically) each highlighted statement (or segment) to a new document created separately for each participant. As I reread these new documents, I articulated my analytic thoughts about each segment. As I reread these new documents the third time, I looked for patterns. Once I began to see patterns, I gave each segment preliminary titles and categorized each segment by the same title. These themes were, once again, reorganized so that they belonged to larger patterns. Throughout this process, I not only added and deleted analytic thoughts, but also saw each segment in relation to the whole.
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

First, the qualities of the immigrant teachers will be discussed in terms of Yosso’s Community Cultural Wealth (CCW). After that process, I will point out how Yosso’s CCW model does not fully explain the immigrant teachers’ qualities such as leadership. In the last part of this section, I will carefully suggest Leadership Capital as the seventh form of Community Cultural Wealth.

SIX COMMUNITIES CULTURAL WEALTH POSSESSED BY THE IMMIGRANT TEACHERS

As a counter-theory against Bourdieu’s (1986) cultural capital which did not recognize resources and capital that cultural minorities such as immigrant teachers possess, Yosso (2005) introduced an alternative concept called “community cultural wealth” (p. 77) and examined some of the under-utilized assets that the culturally marginalized bring with them from their homes into the school. Yosso suggested six forms of capital that comprised community cultural wealth, including aspirational capital, familial capital, linguistic capital, navigational capital, resistant capital, and social capital. Yosso’s six forms of capital could well represent the key findings of strengths that the immigrant teachers possess in this study. The following is the application of the concept of Yosso’s community cultural wealth to some of the qualities of immigrant teachers found in this study.

Aspirational Capital

Aspirational capital in this study refers to the immigrant teachers’ capability to sustain high expectations and goals for the future in spite of the challenges they face. The participants in this study demonstrated aspirational capital and allowed themselves to “dream of possibilities beyond their present circumstances, often without the objective means to attain those goals” (Yosso, 2005, p. 78). Although the three immigrant teachers of this study faced barriers such as visa process, recredentialing process, language barriers, cultural shock, prejudices, and their lack of knowledge about the U.S. school culture and system, they preserved consistently high aspirations for their dream to be a teacher in the U.S. public school systems. For instance, Mares had 15 years of teaching experience in Colombia. When she came to the United States, she wanted to become a school teacher in a public school. The following excerpt shows what she went through in order to pursue her dream.

It was a challenge for me to have [the permanent residency card]. But after I got my residency card, I went to talk to [the public school that] I am a resident now [and] I can come to their school ... which has been ... my goal. When I got on the [air] plane [to come to the United States], I said [to myself that] I want to do anything to get to where I needed to go, you know, I wanted to be a teacher. But if I have to..., I will do [anything]... And I did: I was a baby sitter. I also cleaned houses. I also did nails.

But when Mares was offered a teaching position in Anderson County School District, another challenge was waiting for her. Although she had taught for 15 years in Colombia, none of her teaching experiences were deemed valid by her school district. That is, she had to start from the bottom with the salary of a first year teacher.

Me: You taught in Colombia for 15 years. Did Anderson County School District recognize the full 15 years of teaching in Colombia?
Mares: No, they didn’t recognize any…because those [15] years of teaching did not happen in Anderson County.
Me: What do you feel about it?
Mares: I don’t think it’s fair. But in life, not everything is fair. I had something that I was willing to have, which was working in Anderson County [School District]. That was my biggest goal. And I did it. So it’s okay, you know. Nobody is going to take away my knowledge. Nobody is going to take away my experience. Nobody is going to take away what I know. It does not matter. [Whether] they put it or not put it in there, I have it. And I feel proud of it. And that’s enough for me.

These excerpts show Mares’s Aspirational Capital. In spite of the challenges that she had, Mares aspired to pursue her dream with perseverance and tenacity. Mares’s story of resiliency “nurture[s] a culture of possibility as [she] represent[s] the creation of a history that would break the links between” (Gándara, 1995, p. 55) her status as an immigrant and her future occupational achievement.

Familial Capital

Familial capital in this study is defined as the cultural knowledge promoted by families of immigrant teachers that carries a sense of community history, memory, and cultural insight. According to Yosso (2005), this form of cultural wealth broadens the concept of family to include immediate family, in-laws, relatives, grandparents, and friends. Adding a global concept to Yosso’s description of family to this study, the immigrant teachers seem to possess familial capital from two different worlds including their home countries and the United States. Their families provided these teachers with emotional support for their education and career (Auerbach, 2001, 2004; Reese, 1992). From extended kinship ties that the immigrant teachers owned, they maintained “a healthy connection to their community” (Yosso, p. 79). For example, when Annabel first came to the United States, she said that she did not speak English fluently. When I asked her who helped her improve her English, she answered that her husband, who was a native English speaker and also the U.S. citizen, helped her a lot with her English.

Me: What or who helped you to improve your English?
Annabel: It was my husband who really helped me with challenges of English language. He always explained to me…if I didn’t understand [something in English]. And …he also took an
interest in learning Czech which is very difficult as a Slavic language. It's not even the same family. He had a Czech-English dictionary. If I didn’t understand some words in English, he found it for me and [helped] me to understand [it]. [Besides] I have to communicate with him in English. And then if I didn’t understand certain vocabulary word or meaning of the word, he explain[ed] it to me.

Annabel also received support from her husband’s parents. Because she married a U.S. citizen and moved to the United States, she had to leave all her biological families in her home country. However, it seems that Annabel could adjust to the U.S. mainstream culture well because she received support from her parents-in-law and maintained a good relationship with them.

It was very difficult for me [when I first came to the United States]. It took me four [to] five years to really get used to this culture and language, to assimilate to the main stream culture. It [wa]s difficult because I [was] by myself here [and] didn’t have any support. [But] I had a family support [in the United States] because I have [had] a very good relationship with his parents.

Interestingly Annabel said that her husband was a school teacher in the same school district with Annabel. It seems that Annabel’s husband provided support for her teaching as well.

He always supports me. I was very fortunate because he is a teacher. He also provided me with information [regarding teaching at school].

Me: Oh, he is a teacher too?
Annabel: He is also a teacher … and … gave me ideas and suggestions about effective strategies in reading and writing.

It seems that Annabel’s husband played a significant role as an emotional supporter, a cultural ambassador, an English language instructor, and an instructional coach. Although Annabel did not have the support from her European family in her home country, she utilized her familial capital (her husband and parents-in-law) and gained cultural knowledge of the United States. Interestingly, another participant of this study, Niang, received similar support from her husband who is also a U.S. citizen and a native English speaker.

I’m from Singapore. We use English as one of national languages but its English expression is different from [that of the United States]. Some of the things that I said, the [children] took it differently, you know. I remember … [when] I was teaching Kindergarten, they were playing and it was time to go home. So I said, “Go ahead and keep the toys. Keep the toys.” They looked at me like, ‘What? Keep the toys?” (We both laughed) And I said, “Yeah, keep the toys.” I meant ‘put it up.’ But to my students, I had to say “Put it up” [because] ‘keep’ means they get to keep it. And I did not understand why they kept looking at me [like that]. When I went home
and told my husband [about it], he said, “Why did you tell them that? ‘Keep the toys’ means they get to keep it. It’s theirs to keep forever.” So now I know [the difference].

Niang’s husband, who was born and raised in the United States, helped Niang with the different expressions of English between Singapore and the United States. Although English is used in Singapore, it is British English, not American English. Niang learned American way of expression in English from her husband. Niang said that people speak faster in Singapore and that her husband tried to help her slow down her speech so that Niang could be better understood by other Americans.

[My husband has been] definitely supportive. He told me [that] I talked too fast. So I need to slow down so people can understand me. Probably [I] still talk too fast. (Niang laughs.) When I get excited, you know, I just go on and on.

In addition, like Annabel, Niang received support from her parents-in-law as well.

My parents-in-law have been very good about [understanding me because] they’d lived in Singapore for two and a half years. So they knew where I was coming from and they were really appreciative [of my culture]. Sometimes [they are] too supportive. And I’m almost like, ‘Oh, just leave me alone.’ (Niang laughs.) … They visit us often …They miss their grandchildren very much. So they asked us to move to where they live. So they bought a piece of land right next to their house and wanted us to build [a house] but we didn’t [do that]… [Instead] we stayed in their house for three years. We were financially very comfortable at that time because we didn’t have a mortgage payment.

It seems that Niang has a strong familial capital. Niang’s parents-in-law not only accepted her as their daughter-in-law but also have an appreciation of her home culture because of their living experience in Singapore for two and a half years. In addition, they gave Niang financial support as well by offering their house to Niang’s family, which saved Niang and her husband the burden of mortgage payment.

Whether the spouse of immigrant teacher is a U.S. citizen or not, it is important to mention the role of the spouse as an immigrant teacher’s familial capital. None of the existing studies about immigrant teachers have mentioned the role of their spouses in the process of becoming or teaching as an immigrant teacher. It is important to examine the support given to the immigrant teachers by their spouses because, as the excerpts aforementioned show, their spouses play a significant role as immigrant teachers’ familial capital.

Not all immigrant teachers marry the native English speaking U.S. citizen and can receive this kind of support. Mares, for example, married a Colombian in Colombia. During the interview, Mares explained that her husband does not speak English well and does not know much about American culture. Thus Mares did not mention any English language support or cultural support from her Colombian husband such as Niang and Annabel received from their
American husbands. However, Mares had different kind of familial capital from her mother in Colombia. She spoke with her mother over the phone very often since coming to the United States. Mares shared with her mother the ups and downs of her teaching experience and her new life in a new country. And she was consoled by her mother's words of wisdom. The following excerpt shows what Mares’s mother told Mares when she tried to do all the work by herself in her classroom and felt overwhelmed in spite of the three supportive staff that she had in her class:

[My mom tells me,] “You need to be smart...You have three more people in your classroom. Don’t solve the problem [all by yourself] .You [already] have too many things that you have to solve in school every day.

Her caring heart and words of wisdom for her daughter have inspired Mares to be a strong and thoughtful teacher. Knowing her daughter’s work ethic, Mares’s mother tried to help her daughter understand the importance of working with the supportive personnel assigned to her classroom and sharing her responsibilities with them. Through the emotional support that Mares’s mother has given to her daughter, Mares learned how to cope with the challenges she faced at school.

There is another example of how Mares’s mother gave emotional support when Mares felt overwhelmed during her first year teaching in the U.S. public school;

I cried every day [during] my first year. I [went] home and just s[at] and cr[ied]. I just felt so tired, you know. And I call[ed] my mom in Colombia and said, “Mommy, I can’t stand this anymore.” My mom [said], “You need to calm down, please. You know [that] I don’t want to see you crying. [But] …this is getting worse...” And she said, “Quit! Quit the job! I have never told you to quit anything in your life, you know... but I can’t have you crying since August, September, October, November, December, [and] January. This is just too much! Quit that job! If you need money I will send you the money you need so that you cannot lose your house, you know. We will do whatever. Quit it!” (Mares sighs) And I said, “No, I cannot quit.” And she said, “You need to understand. It’s not that I want you to quit. I don’t want you to suffer any more. You are my daughter. It hurts me to hear you in this kind of pain, you know. Every time I talk to you, you cry and cry.”… I said, “Okay, maybe next year is going to be a great year.” And I did have a great year this year! I had a very good year.

Mares needed someone to share her emotions when she felt overwhelmed during her first year teaching. Mares’s mother listened to her and shared her daughter’s pain. During the interview, Mares told me that she never shared her emotions at work and that the only person she could trust to share her emotions is her mother in Colombia. By letting her steam out while she talked to her mother in Colombia, Mares seems to change her mood from frustration (e.g., “I can’t stand this anymore.”) to hope (“Maybe next year is going to be a great year.”). Being able to develop a hopeful attitude about her job is one way to have a healthy connection to the school.
From the above two excerpts, Mares’s familial capital was the emotional support from her mother and it helped Mares to have a healthy relationship with the community.

Through the familial capital, immigrant teachers’ isolation was reduced as their families helped them recognize that they were “not alone in dealing with their problems” (Delgado-Gaitan, 2001, p. 54).

Interestingly, two out of three participants (Niang and Annabel) of this study married U.S. citizens who are also native English speakers. Only Mares married a Colombian in her home country. I found a contrasting familial support between these two groups depending on their spouse’s nationality. When the immigrant teachers married American citizen who is also European American and native English speaker, they seemed to gain immediate access to the mainstream culture through their relationship with their American husband and parents-in-laws who gave them emotional/cultural support as well as financial support. The immigrant teacher whose husband was not U.S. citizen did not have this kind of support but possessed a very strong relationship with her immediate family in her home country.

Regardless of the nationality of immigrant teachers’ spouse, it is important to recognize the spouse’s support for immigrant teachers here. The existing studies about immigrant teachers have not mentioned the contribution of the spouses of immigrant teachers. However, this study claims that immigrant teachers’ spouses play a significant role as immigrant teachers’ familial capital and that it is meaningful to recognize their influence or contribution.

**Linguistic Capital**

Applying Yosso’s definition, linguistic capital in this study refers to the immigrant teachers’ “intellectual and social skills attained through communication experiences in more than one language” (2005, p. 78). The immigrant teachers in this study demonstrated significant linguistic capital as they worked with their students and parents at school. Especially one of the participants, Annabel, showed an outstanding linguistic capital and brought multiple language and communication skills to the U.S. public schools.

Annabel: I graduated with Spanish degree [in Czech]...I highly utilized the Spanish with my parents [in the U.S. school]... I voluntarily interpret for Latino families.
Me: Wonderful! What was your relationship with your students and their parents?
Annabel: I served less than 15 [ESOL] students in one of the two schools [that I taught] and really got to know the students and their families, especially [the ones who] speak Spanish because I served parent-teacher conferences as an interpreter. This way, I was able to connect with my parents most closely. [I interpreted] Spanish to English or English to Spanish... My relationship with those Spanish speaking students and their families...was really good because if the student had any problem or any difficulties at school, parents contacted me immediately and let me know.
Me: How did the master’s degree in Spanish when you were in Czech Republic help you to work with your students and their families in these schools?
Annabel: The Spanish degree definitely helped me tremendously with the parents to inform them what is going on in the classrooms and the regular routines. Most parents that I deal with do not have education in their [home] countries. Most of them may be completed first five years and coming to the United States has been very challenging for them to get to know the system. I can definitely provide more information to parents about what is expected from them, what we do, [and] our expectations to students... I usually cover during parent-teacher conferences that parents get the insight [of] how really American educational system works.

As the above excerpts show, Annabel utilized her multilingual ability to help linguistically diverse students and their families by translating for them and providing them with academic, social, and emotional support. The linguistic capital that is attained through the immigrant teacher’s multicultural experiences helped many ESOL students and their families to be connected to the U.S. school culture, thereby significantly improving their chances of success.

Navigational Capital

The immigrant teachers of this study exhibited navigational capital which refers to their ability to maneuver through social institutions and systems that are not created with immigrant teachers in mind (Yosso, 2005). Mares, in particular, showed an outstanding example of how she utilized the nexus of associates and other social networks through the host society’s institution and system.

The following excerpt shows how Mares used her navigational capital to maneuver through the U.S. immigration law system in order to become a permanent resident, which is a requirement to get a teaching position in the U.S. public school system.

[My sister] came with a tourist visa...changed it to a student visa...and then changed it to work visa. I was trying to change my [visa] status because I had a tourist visa, [too]...I went to [a nearby college and entered] ... American Language Program [ALP]. And they were able to change my status to student visa. Even though I knew English, I went over there because it was the only way that I could keep my [student visa] status. And then I needed a sponsor [for my work visa].

I had an interview with the owner of Twinkle Star Academy [and she was] willing to sponsor. I became a teacher of the Twinkle Star Academy for the Early Head Start classroom... And she said, “if you consider going to the pre-K classroom, I will [sign] you a residency paper.” Of course, I accepted it. And I renew[ed] my work visa for [ano] ther three years and then I did the process of the [permanent] residency.

Mares employed her educational resources (e.g., ALP), social networks (e.g., learning from how her sister obtained permanent residency), and personal strategies (e.g., finding a sponsor for a work visa) in order to change her visa status from a tourist visa (B-2) to a work visa (H-1B). It was very important for Mares to get a work visa or permanent residency because that
process was the only way to get a teaching position in the U.S. public school system which was not designed with immigrant teachers in mind. However, Mares navigated through the system and found a way to reach her goal.

Resistant Capital

Resistant capital in this study is defined as the immigrant teachers’ tenacity or their “knowledge and skills fostered through oppositional behavior that challenges inequalities” (Yosso, 2005, p. 80). The participants exhibited their resistance to the dominant discourses that attempted to negate their professional identity. Niang, for example, demonstrated a strong resistant capital during her student teaching in the United States. Niang’s mentor teacher wasn’t supportive and didn’t consider Niang as teacher material. However, Niang resisted such discouragement and used her tenacity to cope with her challenge. The following excerpt shows Niang’s resistant capital:

[My] student teaching [experience] was a nightmare. (Laugh) …I think it was just personal conflict with the [mentor] teacher. From that experience, I learned not to be that way to other student teachers now… Later I found [that] she told other student teacher that I’ve got too much on my plate that I shouldn’t be in the [teacher education] program. I am a straight A student and [she is] telling me this? She didn’t tell it to me on my face. [But] because I had only six months old [son], [she thought that I] shouldn’t be even here. But I was never late. I never missed a day. I stayed until six o’clock. But she won’t give me guidance… I asked her questions. [She said,] “Well, you just go plan it. And we will just see.” And my lesson plans were filled with white out because I had to change everything every time I gave it to her. So [she said], “you can’t do this. You can’t. I guess you are not ready for this”. … Why didn’t [she] tell me this when I asked [her] before I planned it? So that was not good. At the end of the semester, I went to my college professor’s house to see her privately with my son and my husband and I told her what happened. She said, “I wish you had told me this earlier.” And I said, “How could I? I’m under her supervision. She is going to end up failing me for insubordination and I wasn’t going to delay my graduation just because she felt like I’m not ready for it.” I [also] said, “How can she say that I’m not ready? I’ve done all the work! This is my last semester!” …It was so bad…If I saw her today, I would tell her, “Look, you tried to beat me down but look at what I have accomplished. I am not what you think, what you want, [or] want to make me.”

In spite of the mentor teacher’s discouragement (e.g., you can’t do this. You can’t. I guess you are not ready for this.), Niang resisted the subordination of such a negating discourse (e.g., you tried to beat me down but look what I have accomplished. I’m not what you think, what you want, [or] want to make me.). Niang asserted herself as “strong and worthy of respect to resist the barrage of societal messages devaluing” her professional identity (Yosso, 2005, p. 81).
Social Capital

The participating immigrant teachers utilized social capital to attain education, employment, and instructional support. The social capital in this study refers to “networks of people and community resources” (Yosso, 2005, p. 79) which provided the immigrant teachers with professional and emotional support to navigate through the U.S. social and educational systems. For example, Mares used her social network to get a job interview opportunity with Twinkle Star Academy:

[Someone said that] a lady from Twinkle Star Academy…had sponsored somebody from India that works in her day care center. And she said [that she] will call [me]. Well, [she] never called me. So I called the [Academy] one day. The lady [who answered the phone]…knew Spanish. [So I said in Spanish], “You need to help me. You need to help me.” And she said, “Do you have a time to interview…now?” And I said yes. So she took me to the Twinkle Star Academy and I had an interview with [the principal].

Utilizing the same linguistic (Spanish) and cultural (Latin culture) background, Mares could obtain a job interview opportunity with the principal. The use of this social capital was vital to Mares because that principal not only hired Mares as a teacher in her school but also sponsored her work visa (H-1B).

Annabel also utilized her social network when she was working in a challenging teaching environment.

There was [an] ESOL [teaching] position opened. And [the director] asked me about coming for the interview. I was really surprised because I didn’t …expect that… And then I was hired the next day…They needed somebody very quickly…for two schools. It was very challenging because it was combination [of] multiple grades in one class. [There] were…3rd, 4th, 5th [grades] in one class or Kindergarten, 1st, 2nd [grades in one class]. It was very challenging… It [required] a lot of differentiation and [I did] not [have] enough time to plan…

Luckily, I had the connections with other ESOL teachers outside of the two schools…who supported me and helped me…They provid[ed] material for me. They gave me instructions about ESOL curriculum and curriculum guide… I coped very well because I had people around [me] who definitely supported me in this matter.

When Annabel first became an ESOL teacher in the U.S. school, she had to teach ESOL students from multiple grade levels. The challenge that she faced was to provide a differentiated instruction with a limited amount of time. Annabel coped with her challenge by utilizing her relationship with other fellow ESOL teachers in other schools from whom she received instructional guidance and material support.

Similarly, when Niang taught her students, she too utilized her social network to teach her students multicultural education.
I took [my students] to [the nearby university] because I contacted the international school student association. And they had the international day. So the kids got to go there, trying different food and dances, heard different languages and saw the different [national] flags. It was really good for them. I wanted to instill in them curiosity and inquiry, ‘what’s out there?’ So I think, maybe years from now, I’ll hear that they love to travel because they were exposed in young age that there are more things out there that you don’t know about that you should go and find out.

Niang took her class to an international cultural event in a local university so that her students had a multicultural experience. Niang was a doctoral student in that university and that relationship is how she learned about the event. First, she utilized her student status in a local university to find out the information about the international cultural event. Second, she utilized this local knowledge to provide her class with multicultural experiences.

I have discussed six forms of community cultural wealth that immigrant teachers bring with them to the U.S. public schools. Yosso (2005) points out that these six forms of community cultural wealth are dynamically interwoven together and build on one another. For example, the immigrant teachers’ aspirations to be a school teacher in the U.S. school system were nurtured through their familial capital (e.g., husband’s support), which contributed to activating navigational (e.g., maneuvering through social system to change one’s tourist visa status to a valid working visa) and social capitals (e.g., relationship with other people or local knowledge). After achieving their aspirations, the teachers resisted accepting discriminating dominant discourses. They also helped students and their families at school by utilizing their linguistic capital (e.g., being bilingual and translating English to Spanish to Hispanic parents). Thus, these six forms of capital overlap with each other to create a dynamic community cultural wealth.

LIMITATION OF YOSSO’S COMMUNITY CULTURAL WEALTH

I applied Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth in the discussion of the strengths of immigrant teachers. Interestingly, I noticed that Yosso’s six community cultural wealth did not fully explain the strengths that I found in this study. In addition to the aforementioned six forms of community cultural wealth, I found one more quality from the three participants, that is, leadership. From all three immigrant teachers, leadership was one of the most distinctive strengths displayed by these participants. However, none of Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth seemed to explain the leadership of these immigrant teachers. If I use baking cupcakes as a metaphor, I can put it as follows: I made a nice batch of cupcake mix (data). And I know that I can make exactly seven cupcakes (seven themes or seven strengths of immigrant teachers). But the cupcake mold in my pantry (Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth) can bake only six cupcakes. I used that cupcake mold because it is the best tool that I have for baking cupcakes. But if this cupcake mold can bake one more cupcake to make it seven, it will become a better baking tool for me. Creating this tool is what I am trying to do here in this research study; that is, to suggest one more form of community cultural wealth.
wealth and add it to the Yosso’s six forms of community cultural wealth so that I can make it a better model to explain the various qualities of immigrant teachers.

Next I would like to discuss the leadership of immigrant teachers and then carefully suggest leadership capital as a new addition to the existing forms of community of cultural wealth.

**LEADERSHIP OF IMMIGRANT TEACHERS**

First, I will describe the examples of leadership demonstrated by the immigrant teachers. Then I will discuss these examples with regard to the concept of leadership aforementioned in Literature Review. After that discussion, I will carefully suggest the leadership capital as a new addition to the six forms of community cultural wealth in the hope of complementing Yosso’s model.

Earlier in this paper, I reflected upon leadership ideas of Biddle (2012), Lambert (1998), and Brownlee et al. (2012) and inferred that anyone within the organization can exercise leadership by applying one’s knowledge for the common goal of community and by promoting a collaborative and caring relationship among community members. In my explanation of the qualities of leadership, I used as an example Biddle’s (2012) suggested three Rs of leadership: Relationship, Reciprocal Learning, and Reflection. I would like to discuss the qualities of leadership of the three immigrant teachers in terms of the Biddle’s three Rs.

**RELATIONSHIP**

Donaldson (2001) says the heartbeat of leadership is a relationship. The immigrant teachers of this study demonstrated collaborative and caring relationships with other colleagues, students or their parents at school.

For example, Annabel showed compassion towards immigrant parents in her school.

> [Parents’] immigrant background definitely helps me to relate to their feelings [with regard] to their challenges, their strengths, and their weaknesses as immigrants [and] as foreigners coming from different linguistic [and] cultural background to American main culture ....[which are], different society with different ideas, different traditions, [and] different religions.

In the section on Linguistic Capital, I mentioned that Annabel volunteered as an interpreter for the immigrant parents during the teacher-parent conference at her school. The aforementioned excerpt well describes Annabel’s compassionate feeling towards immigrant parents. This compassion seemed to motivate Annabel to spend her time and energy to commit herself to helping the immigrant parents at school (e.g., volunteering at the teacher-parent conference as an interpreter). This kind of dedication shows Annabel’s caring relationship with immigrant parents in her school. And such caring relationship is a good indication of Annabel’s leadership.
When Mares started working in Anderson County School District, she collaborated with her coach to improve her instruction and develop a good relationship with her students and their parents. The next excerpt shows how important the collaborative relationship with her coach was for Mares.

I think that coaches are a great help...Every time I was frustrated because I didn’t understand things, she sat with me and would go step by step. And together we were able to move on. You can count on a person you can sit with and have the time to listen to you and to see, “okay, this is your problem. Let’s see how we can fix it.” I have learned so much about the culture, how to relate to kids, how to relate with the parents... And I already knew how to work with my students and [do] my lesson plans. I already knew how the State wanted me to develop my curriculum in my classroom. I also learned how to involve parents in my classroom; I invited them to do things, to read to my students or to come and do an activity... with their child in the classroom. And we were encouraging all the parents to come. So we had a very good attendance from parents at that point....And it was great! I learned a lot [from my coach.]

Earlier I mentioned that leadership in elementary education can grow into a collaborative relationship where “individuals are both shapers of and shaped by one another” (Biddle, 2012, p.33). The above excerpt shows how Mares invited her coach to collaborate with her and how such collaboration shaped Mares’s relationship with her students and their parents. Collaboration was not only at the center of the relationship with her coach (e.g., Together we were able to move on; Let’s see how we can fix it.) but also at the heart of the relationship with her students’ parents (e.g., I also learned how to involve parents in my classroom; I invited them to do things, to read to my students or to come and do an activity...with their child in the classroom.). Thus, Mares’s leadership for her students and parents was demonstrated through the collaborative relationship with her coach. And such a successful collaborative relationship is a sign of her leadership.

The next excerpt shows Niang’s leadership with her students, instilling in them the value of a caring and supportive relationship with one another.

I teach my students, “Why are you so upset that she got this and you didn’t get it? She did a good job. So she got it. Be happy for your friend because being jealous is going to .... eat you up... There is one child that I am thinking about. She has everything in the world. Her father is a neurosurgeon. She got two brothers. Her mother stays home and do[es] all sorts of thing. And still she is so jealous of this other girl who has so much less than her. [I said to her.] “You have no idea what you have. You don’t value it because you don’t realize [that] people have so much less than you. And you still want what she has, which is not even half of what you have.”

The above excerpt shows how much Niang cares about the relationship between two girls in her classroom. She tried to instill a caring relationship when one student felt jealous of another.
(e.g., Be happy for your friend because being jealous is going to …. eat you up.) By reminding
the girl of how blind she was about how much she has (e.g., You have no idea what you have.
You don’t value it because you don’t realize [that] people have so much less than you.), Niang
tried to help the student acknowledge and appreciate what she has. Instilling a caring
relationship in her students is a good indication of Niang’s leadership.

All three excerpts demonstrate one common trait: relationship in the heart of immigrant
teachers’ leadership. Gibbs (2006) believes that a leader who values being in a relationship in
school, spends his/her time to be attentive to the needs of others, listening, caring,
compassionate, and accepting. The aforementioned excerpts showed how immigrant teachers
were committed to support, nurture, and strengthen the relationship among students or with
other colleagues and parents in the school community.

**Reciprocal Learning**

Earlier I defined reciprocal learning as “seeking professional growth for themselves, but also
assuming a sense of responsibility for the professional growth of their colleagues” (Biddle,
2012, p.46). Leadership is about learning together and constructing knowledge collaboratively
through peer observations, study groups, or examination of student data (Lambert, 1998).
Biddle (2002) emphasized the importance of peer learning and entry-year mentoring in
reciprocal learning. The immigrant teachers in this study exhibited either peer learning (e.g.,
peer coaching) or entry-year mentoring as they created learning opportunities together with
their peers at school in collaborative work groups.

In the following excerpt, Annabel provided peer coaching to a collaborating classroom teacher.

I was collaborating with [a] third grade [teacher]…It was her second year. She had a
real difficulty with discipline and I definitely supported her. We both created behavior
plan for children to follow. I think it worked very well … in both sides.

When a collaborating third grade teacher was struggling with the behavior management,
Annabel’s leadership focused on mutually improving her colleague’s behavior management
skills and her own (e.g., we both created behavior plan, I think it worked very well … in both
sides.). This kind of leadership goes along with Biddle’s emphasis on the purpose of peer
coaching, that is, not evaluation, but rather mutually improved practice on issues of specific
concern to each of the participants.

Mares provided entry-year mentoring to a first-year teacher in her school.

This year in my school, we have a [new] teacher…She [never] had been working in
Pre-K with the curriculum that we were working. The second week [of school]… I went
to see her [in her] class and said, “Sandy, how are you feeling? Is everything okay? Is
there something I can do to help you?” And she started crying and said, “I feel so
overwhelmed. Mares, this is just too much work!” And I said, “It is. And I will help you.”
And ... through the whole year, I mentored her not because they pay me to mentor her or because they told me, [but] because I think that when a new person comes, what would you like to happen to you when you started? I would tell you: I would love to have somebody to help me, mentor me, guide me, and show me the way to do it or the way that were expected to do it... How did I feel helping this girl this year? I felt great. I think she felt more calm because every time she was so stressed, I [told] her, “No, don’t worry. This is the way they want you to do it but there is another way that you can do it also. And it’s okay.” So that would give her so much comfort. It will calm her down. She and I are going to share ... and be able to collab[orate with] each other a lot more. And she is so happy and I’m too because we made our friendship out of something that we never thought it was going to get us so close, you know. I helped her how to plan. I helped her a lot through the whole year. I feel happy. I feel happy for her. And I feel happy for me that I was able to help her move on.

Mares not only provided the new teacher with help but also established a supportive relationship. Earlier I mentioned that the foundation of reciprocal learning at school is being in relationships with colleagues. Through such a relationship, Mares comforted her, calmed her, and mentored her. The above excerpt shows Mares’s leadership that focused on guiding a new teacher to learn a new school work through a caring and collaborative relationship.

Niang set herself as a role model by showing other teachers how to teach multicultural education.

...I’m so into teaching my children about different cultures. That’s one of the things that my principal talked me about. She said, “You have opened up children’s world ... because you are bringing so many things and you talk about so many things.” She [also] said, “Some of the teachers here need to see that...You have really taught them how to do it. And you have taught them how to do it successfully.”

There is another example of Niang’s setting herself as an example to other teachers. When Niang’s principal wanted other teachers to loop with their class to the next grade level, they refused because they thought that it was too hard to do it. However, Niang took the challenge and showed other teachers that looping could be done successfully.

[My principal] said, “I couldn’t have been more pleased when you came back again after you looped with the first group and you came back with the second group and you said, ‘Okay, I want to loop again’...You showed them how successful it can be. And you did it again. The fact that you did it again, I think, it’s opening some people’s eyes because they are questioning, ‘Hm, maybe this is a good thing.’”

According to Niang’s principal, Niang took challenging tasks at school (e.g., multicultural education and looping). By completing these tasks with great success, Niang not only taught other teachers that they could be done but also motivated them to do it. Niang contributed to
the professional growth of her colleagues by setting herself up as a role model and taking the challenging tasks herself first. Leaders inspire others by their deeds and take on the most difficult tasks when team members are reluctant to take those tasks. That inspiration is the kind of leadership that Niang demonstrated in the excerpts above.

**Reflection**

The immigrant teachers in this study demonstrated critical reflection and reflective practice in their teaching. Critical reflection means that a teacher is aware again of what he/she knows through rereading, discussing, and comparing his/her ideas with others. As a result, the teacher is able to create actions that grow out of these new understandings, which is the very notion of reflective practice. Thus, reflective practice is an outcome of critical reflection (Biddle, 2012).

Mares and Niang showed this kind of reflection in their work with parents or students at school. Mares, for example, used critical reflection to be aware of the way she interacted with American parents and developed a new understanding about a more appropriate way to treat American parents.

> How [American teachers] treat parents is very different [from] how we treat parents in Colombia … In Colombia, I could talk about anything with parents without the fear of being sued … When I came here, something that was difficult for me was to learn how to communicate with parents because [I] had to be so careful to what [I] say it and how [I] say it because anything that [I] say can be against [me] or maybe they didn’t like the way [I] say it or how it sound[ed]. And having an accent when I speak was something that for some parents was shocking… I have a loud voice and sometimes they would think I would say things in a mean way… So that was something I had to learn and grow through the years to know how to treat the [American] parents I was serving…

In her reflection, Mares compared the way she interacted or communicated with parents in Colombia to the way with American parents. She was being critical about her Colombian way of teacher-parent communication and then created a reflective action (e.g., being more careful of what she says or how she says it with American parents) that grew out of her critical reflection.

Niang used critical reflection to improve her teaching.

> I got national board certification. I was really proud of that… It taught me how to be reflective in my teaching and it’s okay to criticize how I teach so that I can improve myself. So definitely that was a good experience.

Niang did not specify here what exactly she did to be reflective of her teaching. However, when I asked Niang later during the follow-up interview, she mentioned that she videotaped her own lesson and critiqued it with other teachers. Sharing her own lesson and discussing it with others is the very act of critical reflection. Through this critical reflection, Niang could
improve herself as a more competent teacher and obtained the national board certification, which is granted to only highly exceptional teachers in the United States.

So far I have discussed the examples of leadership demonstrated by the immigrant teachers in terms of Biddle’s (2012) three Rs of leadership: Relationship, Reciprocal Learning and Reflection. From this discussion, I believe that leadership quality of the immigrant teachers was exhibited with ample evidences. Thus it is worthwhile to argue that immigrant teachers do possess leadership and their leadership is one of the strengths they bring with them to the U.S. public education. In consequence, I would like to carefully suggest leadership capital as a new addition to the six forms of community cultural wealth with an intention of complementing Yosso’s (2005) model.

LEADERSHIP CAPITAL

Leadership capital is defined as demonstrating leadership by promoting a collaborative and caring relationship and reciprocal learning among community members through critical reflection and reflective practice for the common goal of community. This form of cultural wealth engages a commitment to community interests and suggests shared responsibilities for shared purposes of community. It also expands the scope of leadership positions, for example, from school administrators to individual teachers, especially those teachers from outside the mainstream culture. In other words, leadership capital reflects on two aspects: first, leadership belongs not only to school administrators but also to teachers, especially those from outside the mainstream culture; second, teachers from outside the mainstream culture are not just followers but leaders as well and can exercise leadership skills influencing the thoughts, attitudes, and behavior of others. Possessing leadership capital means to respect and value others, to have caring and collaborative relationships, to effectively use resources to help others improve their practice, and to instill a sense of leadership in people.

As Yosso’s six forms of cultural capital are dynamically interwoven together and build on one another, the leadership capital is also actively entwined with other forms of cultural capital. For example, leadership is fostered within social and familial context, often through inner aspiration and external linguistic communication that offer specific navigational goals to resist the negating dominant discourses. Therefore, leadership capital overlays each of the other forms of capital such as social, familial, aspirational, linguistic, navigational, and resistant capital.

LIMITATIONS

I note here two main potential limitations of this study, which are both related to the participants. First, because all of the participants are female, the present study does not reflect the perspectives and insights of male immigrant teachers. The reason why a male participant is missing in this study is because I have not been able to find male immigrant teachers who meet the criteria that I set for the participant selection. Considering that female is the dominant gender in the U.S. teaching force, as in many other nations, my participant selection represents the current dominant gender representation of the U.S. teaching force.
IMPLICATION

There are a number of implications that can be drawn from the findings and discussions of this study. First, for school administrators, teachers, and parents from the mainstream culture, I hope this study helps them to shift their views on immigrant teachers from deficit to positive perspective. It is important to view immigrant teachers as leaders or someone with abundant funds of knowledge to share with their community instead of submissive followers or learners of mainstream culture. The findings and discussion of this study may suggest school administrators give immigrant teachers a chance to take on a leadership role at school such as team leaders or facilitators of school events. It is essential that school administrators are not afraid of providing a work environment that nurtures immigrant teachers’ leadership. Teachers and parents from the mainstream culture can also be mindful of their presuppositions about teachers from outside their own culture and make an effort to see beyond their accents and different appearances. Such effort will help teachers and parents from the mainstream culture to recognize and appreciate the leadership qualities that immigrant teachers bring with them to their classrooms.

Second, for immigrant teachers, I hope the findings and discussion of this study encourage them to view themselves as a leader rather than a newcomer or an outsider of the mainstream culture. Learning new norms, beliefs, and practices of the mainstream culture is an integral part of their acculturation. However, it is important for immigrant teachers to remember that they also share the purposes of the community and have responsibilities and privileges of contributing to the community. In order for their leadership capacity to reach their full potential, the sense of leadership should take place from within.

Lastly, for the teacher education, the current teacher education programs need to provide curriculum that cultivates leadership of pre-service teachers from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds. Considering that these pre-service immigrant teachers bring more than one linguistic and cultural knowledge, it is essential for teacher education programs to recognize and value the qualities and strengths these teachers bring with them to schools. This effort provides a strong base for sharing their funds of knowledge with others. This practice of sharing knowledge can instill a strong sense of leadership in the pre-service immigrant teachers.

REFERENCES


AN ALTERNATIVE APPROACH FOR THOSE WHO DESPISE SALES ROLE PLAYING

David Allbright
Eastern Michigan University, USA

ABSTRACT

Novice sales trainees and undergraduate selling course participants often are required to participate in selling role plays. The role plays usually involve pairing-up participants and asking them to engage in a formal mock dialogue in an attempt to simulate a "realistic" professional selling conversation. One student plays the role of the "seller" who endeavors to converse with another student who is playing the role of a "buyer." The formal role play performances often take place in the front of the classroom while the performers' peers look on. Or, the role plays may be captured on video for later critical review by the instructor, or possibly, to provide an "instant replay" for audience members to review, discuss and critique the performance. The author has facilitated role play learning activities for 15 years. In recent years, we have noticed an increasing portion of participants have voiced a negative opinion about being required to perform selling role plays in front of their peers. And they are less receptive to having their performances critiqued in the classroom. So, we implemented an alternative pedagogical approach. Rather than perform stilted formal role plays at the front of the class, we instead invite audience members to engage in spontaneous role plays while staying in their seats. We have found that the "informal" approach entices students to participate voluntarily in classroom learning dialogues. Audience observers are encouraged to critique the dialogue "in-the-moment" so that participants receive immediate feedback and assistance from the facilitator along with their peers. Many students have noted that they consider the collaborative stay-in-your-seat approach to be less off-putting and more supportive. We contrast the two approaches to sales role playing and present a list of benefits and drawbacks for each.

Keywords: Selling, Role Play, Experiential Learning, Professional, Dialogue, Critique, Feedback, Training

GROWING NEED FOR SALES SKILLS

Selling occupations represent one of the largest portions of all employment positions in the world. There are millions of sales jobs in the United States and many millions more throughout
the globe. Furthermore, the US Bureau of Labor Statistics (2012) projects steady growth in the sales-related professions throughout the remainder of this decade.

A recent comprehensive survey of undergraduates (Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce, 2010) verified that a large portion of all undergraduates take their first jobs in some type of sales related position. Interestingly, the tendency for starting one's career by taking a job in sales was not limited to folks with business degrees, but also extends to many different disciplines and degree programs across the campus. For example, sales was listed as one of the top-five jobs first taken by graduates with majors in social sciences, natural sciences, physical sciences, liberal arts, communication and journalism. In addition, while sales was the highest portion of first-time positions accepted by business majors in marketing, it also ranked as either the second or third most frequent career starter position for majors in general business, economics, international business, finance, operations management, human resources and management information systems.

However, many employers lament that business school graduates often lack any formal education in the art and practice of face-to-face selling. Indeed, an overlooked reality of the current state of the business school curriculum is that the majority of business degrees do not require a selling course. So, many freshly-minted undergraduates enter the workplace with little exposure to professional selling concepts and behaviors. A quick look at the tens of thousands of selling positions currently listed as vacant on the employment website Monster.com provides additional anecdotal evidence of a dearth of qualified applicants who might possess the desired level of experience and knowledge of selling.

With the expanding number of entry-level openings for novice salespersons, there is a corresponding demand for professional sales education to accommodate these numerous newcomers. Traditionally, the most common avenue of sales education is the familiar "on-the-job training" approach. In larger organizations, sales management and human resource departments often join together to administer formal internal sales training activities that may last for days, weeks or even months. Or, the firm may contract with external sales training professionals to help indoctrinate and inspire an entry-level sales force. In smaller enterprises, new hires in sales positions may be asked to perform their new duties immediately with little more than a short, introductory training session lasting a few hours or a few days. Obviously, these organizations would desire a larger pool of recent university graduates who would bring at least a rudimentary exposure to sales theory and practice.

Academia appears to be responding (albeit slowly) to the growing need to supply graduates who may bring additional sales knowledge to their first jobs after college. A recent survey of trends in university-level selling curricula (DePaul University Center for Sales Leadership, 2011-2012) noted that 32 institutions of higher learning now offer a major, a minor or a degree concentration in sales. Unfortunately, these 32 institutions represent only a tiny percentage of the total number of universities offering business degrees in the US. Still, the majority of
universities do offer some type of elective introductory course in Selling. So, there are opportunities for interested students to obtain additional selling knowledge.

**EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING THROUGH SALES ROLE PLAYING**

Introductory selling courses typically combine a basic survey of relevant knowledge content along with additional experiential exercises. The experiential pedagogy endeavors to go beyond mere cognitive observation, recognition and memory recall to also add action-learning elements in which students integrate cognition with social behavior (Bandura, 1977, 1986). Such experiential pedagogies in sales courses often involve various incarnations of front-of-class selling presentations and face-to-face role playing. Selling presentation activities require students to display podium communication skills in which they attempt to engage an audience by verbally and visually communicating the value of a particular product, service or idea. On the other hand, role playing requires the student to practice a different set of communication skills... centered on a more interpersonal, face-to-face dialogue. Role plays usually involve pairing-up participants into a dyad to enact a mock dialogue in which the participants attempt to simulate a "realistic" professional selling conversation. One student plays the role of the "seller" who endeavors to converse with another student who is playing the role of a "buyer." The formal role play performance often takes place in the front of the classroom while an audience of peers looks on. Or, the role play may be captured on video for later critical review. Audience members and the instructor review, discuss and critique the role play performance either "live" or using the captured video for "instant replay" in order to supply feedback advisements to the performers. This type of formal sales role playing has long been a well-known staple of professional sales training outside of academia. Beginning in the 1980's, corresponding to a reduction in the cost of videotaping and video replay equipment, the role play pedagogy enjoyed a more widespread implementation within university-level courses in marketing and sales (Madden, 1983; Castleberry, 1989).

There are many benefits to sales role playing. Since personal selling is a complex social process (Bandura, 1986) that presents an overwhelming array of cognitive, emotional and behavioral elements, there is a need for a pedagogical approach that can help simplify and focus a learner's attention toward selected elements for success. Role plays offer a vicarious learning situation within a controlled, idealized and simplified social environment as opposed to an uncontrolled and complex "real world" interaction. Training facilitators and participants can create simulated business scenarios that allow students to focus on rehearsing targeted selling interactions and improving selected sets of skills. Audience observers together with the instructor can provide corrective feedback to help each performer consider ways to improve. So, role play participants receive an opportunity to practice and reflect upon selected personal selling behaviors within a controlled, safe environment. Simulation rehearsals and constructive critiques provide learning opportunities for sales novices while avoiding the potential added costs and stresses of attempting to learn new behaviors "under fire" during an actual selling event.

Sounds great. So, what is the problem?
While role play participants may recognize the benefits to be had from performing sales role plays, many still despise the actual role playing activity. Displeasures with role playing are often heard from participants in organizational HR training programs as well as university selling courses. This article will list several sources of their displeasures. And, we will later describe an alternative approach to role playing that promises to address many of the concerns of role play participants.

The author has facilitated sales role plays for more than fifteen years within university-level sales courses. In recent years, we have noticed an increasing portion of class participants are voicing a negative opinion (culled from our end-of-year course evaluations as well as informal classroom comments) about being required to perform formal, "front-of-the-class" selling role plays. Later, we review some of our student's concerns.

But first, we review comments posted on a Human Resources (HR) discussion blog in which audience members shared their candid opinions of traditional role playing exercises in HR training programs. We have found many of these same sentiments are similar to those being shared by students within our introductory selling courses.

**SOME ORGANIZATIONAL TRAINEES DESPISE SALES ROLE PLAYING**

Sharlyn Lauby (2010) is an author and consultant to Human Resources professionals who recently posted a webblog entry in which she proclaimed "no body likes role playing." She noted that participants in organizational training programs often are reluctant to raise their hands to volunteer for role playing exercises because:

"They don't want to play act in front of a group of their peers. Trust me on this one. Declare the role play passé and create a better way to achieve the same outcome. Your participants will thank you for it."

Several of her online audience members responded to share their reasons for disliking role plays. We list a few salient comments. For example, the following statement reflects on the discomfort of having their peers observe them attempting to perform a skill at the front of the room.

"I agree that everyone hates the idea of role-playing, but it’s not because they hate the acting part – they hate the BEING WATCHED BY ALL OF THEIR CO-WORKERS part"

While some role play participants merely suffer from nervous social anxiety:

"I think most people loathe these (role plays) and are too nervous to participate in front of others, so it kind of defeats the exercise in helping someone develop the skills and having others assesses them."
Others wish to avoid the feeling of having their performance judged in front of their peers or superiors:

"It's not just that people don't like them, it's that they do far more harm than good. First, they create a one-up and one-down relationship between the trainer who judges... and the trainee who's on trial."

Some simply want the chance to practice and develop some preliminary skills before being required to perform in front of the group to be judged by their peers:

"No one should ever be asked to try and demonstrate a newly learned skill in front the entire group of peers, without practicing it first... Only someone who has shown the ability to perform the skill should be asked to do so in front of everyone.

Still, others will remain cautious and reluctant toward being candid and open during their performance:

"I agree it can be valuable for participants to say some things in a safe environment. But I have found that it's becoming increasing difficult to convince participants to let their guard down and use training as a way to work through those matters."

Some participants express skepticism regarding the stilted and contrived nature of role play activities. They note that a student can be a great performer in the role play arena... because they can excel at memorizing simulated and controlled scenarios that are focused narrowly on a few selected behavioral elements. But, they may question whether their practice rehearsals and memorized scripts may be applicable later to a more complex, actual performance event.

"(Role plays) create the impression that if you can only say the right words, you'll be perceived as genuine. Not so. The right words combined with the wrong intent – indifference or malevolence for example – come across as manipulation. My favorite cartoon has two cows talking in a pasture. One cow says: If I understand you correctly, you're saying 'Moo.' [The other cow is thinking:] She must have just returned from a class in active listening."

"Just imagine you have a meeting with your colleagues and you are given a scripted, unrealistic uncreative directive to 'pretend' that you are editing a story article. The marketing department writes the script and you have to follow it usually word for word. A pretend colleague has to pose an objection and you have a scripted response: "Well Joe, if I understand your question correctly... (Insert topic here)... does that answer your question?" Now I ask everyone, why would anybody hate role playing?"

In addition, some fear that over-reaching judgments can be extrapolated from observations of a role play. Notice how an employer / manager could make a rather large leap in reasoning
regarding the projected talents of an employee who displays a "positive attitude" toward role playing:

"Many do not participate, as they should, in this type of activity because they consider them immature and a waste of time... However, employees with a positive attitude about (role) playing are more creative and have better teamwork, problem solving and social skills. Likewise, they handle stress much better. For a company, these (role play) activities are a great opportunity to spot these employees."

Some training participants fear these types of cavalier judgments of their role playing performances. Worries over how one's performance is being judged by peers and prospective superiors can inhibit the learning process.

SOME ACADEMIC STUDENTS DESPISE SALES ROLE PLAYING

Students within our introductory selling courses express similar concerns within end-of-year course evaluations. For example, anxiety over being judged by an audience appears to be one of the most compelling underlying reasons that many students dislike front-of-the-class selling role plays:

"I should not be required to perform role plays in front of everyone."

"I do not want to be criticized in front of other students."

"I don't appreciate the American Idol style of feedback."

The formative years of many current US undergraduate students coincide with a pop-culture phenomenon "American Idol", which is a "live" TV show that involves a panel of 3 to 4 seated judges who observe and comment on various individual singing acts. Upon completion of each song, each singer is subjected to an extended public judgment discussion in which the performer receives critical feedback from each individual judge. This show has been one of the most popular TV shows for many years during the formative years of our current US college-age population. And, this judging format has been copied by dozens of other TV shows. Therefore, many of our current, traditional-aged students are quite familiar with this judging format.

We have used a similar approach to "open feedback" in our sales classroom for years. Previously, most students seemed to be up to the challenge... with the majority receptive to constructive feedback from their peers and the instructor. We always have been careful to emphasize positive aspects of selling role play performances while attempting to soften commentary on any behaviors that appear to be subpar. In particular, we have been particularly sensitive to avoiding any "guillotine effect" (Tanner and Chonko, 1991) where a student receives immediate corrective feedback upon completing a role play performance. We
carefully mitigate negative feedback that may inhibit helpful listening and positive learning processes.

Still, in recent years, we have noted that a greater number of students are openly expressing a strong aversion to what some refer to as the "American Idol" approach to providing immediate performance feedback in the classroom. Some have become quite vocal about not wishing to be judged nor corrected in front of their peers. In particular, many students consider the practice of constructive criticism and the use of questions to prod student thinking to be "rude." The following statement is a reoccurring theme in course evaluations:

"The instructor is often rude... He interrupts presentations with questions... He makes comments about people's performances... He wants things done in a certain way."

In order to avoid student resistance to an overly instructor-centric feedback process, we enlist the help of the entire audience to participate in the performance feedback process. For example, we have asked audience members to evaluate role play performances using formal scoresheets which focus attention on evaluating a few key observable selling behaviors and communications elements. We believe that including the audience in the feedback loop provides a good opportunity to keep the audience attending to the role play, while also encouraging them to engage in deeper reflection on the effectiveness of the performer. But alas, in recent years, we began to receive more push back from students who increasingly are disenchanted with the inclusion of the classroom audience in the feedback process. Note the following comments:

"I am uncomfortable with being judged by other students"

"I do not feel it is fair to be judged by other students who don't know anything about sales"

Fewer audience members are willing to candidly engage in shared critiques of their peers. Since class members know "they are next" on the stage, many will demure and avoid sharing any in-depth analysis and corrective criticism:

"The audience feedback is a bunch of bull... because nobody wants to say anything bad about anyone else"

"Everyone just says that was a great job... They don't really say what they are thinking... because they are next"

"Don't want to give feedback... don't feel qualified to give feedback... I prefer to watch and learn"

When an entire audience demures during a feedback dialogue, the instructor may be required to provide the lion's share of the corrective feedback. Unfortunately, when the instructor takes
on the roles of performance judge and correctional advisor, then some students may react by taking an adversarial stance.

"The professor thinks he knows everything... he picks on people"

It takes merely one or a few vocal students to create much consternation in the classroom. If students consider an instructor to be an adversary... then peers may join together to take an "us versus him" approach and come to the rescue of a performer who is perceived to be "under attack" by an instructor's criticisms. The performer and audience peers can collaborate to argue each point of constructive criticism that is offered by the instructor. Students may become particularly argumentative during feedback discussions if they believe that their grade may be lowered...

"Every time I hear the professor say I missed a step... or when he asks the class for ideas on how I could have done this or that better... I just panic... I just think how many points is that going to cost me?"

Some students will argue vociferously for the sake of maintaining their grade rather than engage in a meaningful feedback dialogue toward learning how to improve their interpersonal communications skill set.

Over the years, we have utilized video instant replay to help reduce classroom consternation. While some students may experience additional anxiety when their performance is videotaped (Javie and Jones, 1996), a strong pedagogical benefit of instant replay is that students find it difficult to engage in an extended argument about any particular element of a role play performance when each selected behavior can be reviewed at will by the entire audience. Ideally, video replay frees interested parties to engage in a collaborative learning discussion rather than strain to listen to a pointed argument while simultaneously attempting to remember what exactly had been said and done during a role play. Furthermore, it becomes quickly apparent to the entire audience whether a recipient of constructive feedback is focused on learning how to improve performance versus engaging in a protracted argument centered on maintaining grading points.

However, in recent years, we noticed an increasing trend in which audience members either attempt to disengage from the performance feedback process...

"I don't have anything to say about it... That is between you and him"

... or, simply offer superficial positive input such as:

"I thought you did great... I liked your style and energy... I would buy something from you"
And, whenever we attempt to offset this participatory malaise by asking audience observers to fill in feedback sheets which require evaluations of specific selling role play behaviors and communications items, audience members often appear complicit in giving each other consistently high grades along with short, superficial affirmations of quality performance.

In sum, we have experienced pedagogical challenges with formal, front-of-the-class role playing. And, our students have become increasingly forthright in expressing their emotional discomforts and displeasures connected with role playing.

We felt it was time to try something different.

AN ALTERNATIVE APPROACH TO ROLE PLAY

We sought an alternative approach to role play that might help reduce the negative emotions felt by some students while also addressing some of the aforementioned dysfunctions of the role play performance feedback processes.

First, we heard their concerns about having to come to the front of the class to be placed on display and judged by their instructor and fellow audience members. So, we sought to develop role play learning modules that would allow students to remain in their seats.

In addition, we felt our students were asking for a more collaborative versus combative classroom environment. We believed their evaluations indicated they preferred to work together on a problem, rather than passively observe and comment on another person’s quest to perform. So, we sought to construct role plays that would invite audience members to participate as co-creators of a given role play. Furthermore, we would encourage all audience members to offer informal assistance to each performer by suggesting improvements "in the moment", as opposed to the traditional approach in which the audience waits for the completion of the performance to offer formal judgments, critiques and grading points. In other words, audience members would be invited to contribute in the role of collaborator and supporter rather than serve as a judge.

We also believed our students were seeking a more spontaneous, fun and informal approach to role play rather than the traditional stilted, rehearsed and formal performance. So, we sought to deemphasize long, pre-rehearsed simulations of selling dialogues that involved the preparation and memorization of questions, scripts and communications sequences. Instead, we endeavored to break large, complex selling role plays into smaller "chunks" of content. We felt that it would be advantageous to invite audience members to focus narrowly on selected aspects of a selling interaction.

Toward those ends, we created quick, simplistic role plays that audience members could perform informally while staying in their seats. We would encourage a more lively and extemporaneous style of role play that centers on short bursts of classroom activities where volunteers would co-create simplified selling situations. Sojka and Fish (2008) agree that
Generation Y students respond positively to "brief in-class role plays" (BIRPs) which involve short (to keep Gen Y attentions), realistic and minimally-detailed sales situations (so that students may more easily personalize and identify with the characters in the role play).

The following is an example classroom interaction that occurred within a short learning module that implements an informal, "stay-in-your-seat" approach to role play.

INFORMAL STAY-IN-SEAT ROLE PLAY

INTRODUCE CONTENT

Instructor first conducts short lecture introducing audience to following concepts:

• Adaptable-flexible selling approach versus canned-scripted approach
• Ability of each audience member to change their social style in different circumstances (Ask volunteers to describe)

How their behaviors / communications may change when dining with boss vs friends)
• Detail four styles of social interaction: driver, expressive, analytical, amiable (Ingrasci, 1981)
• Summarize by further detailing typical communicative behaviors / interaction goals of "drivers" versus "amiabies"

SELLING SCENARIO

Instructor states to audience:

Envision a first meeting between a salesperson and a prospective buyer. The salesperson has just been invited to the office of the prospective buyer. They are in the process of shaking hands. Now can we have a couple of volunteers to play the role of seller and buyer? We want you to enact the first few sentences of the seller-buyer conversation. (Instructor selects two volunteers... one seller and one buyer.)

For our first mini-role play, the seller will display a DRIVER style, and the buyer will play an AMIABLE style. Remember, the driver (seller) wants to immediately "get down to business" and doesn't want to waste any time. The amiable (buyer) wants to get to know the other person first, or wants to share elements of their own life before they discuss business. Please try to give an example to the class of how these two communicate styles may lead to some conflict in the opening moments of the conversation. (To facilitate realistic conversation, ask the role play volunteers to turn and face each other.)

SELLER (Driver):
Hi Mr. Johnson. Pleasure to meet you.

BUYER (Amiable):
Thanks, same to you. Did you have a nice trip to our city?
SELLER (Driver):
Yes I did. The ride over here was a bit long. But the scenery was great.
You have a beautiful office. Is that a picture of your kids?

INSTRUCTOR:
OK everyone.... stop for a minute... think about this...
Is the seller giving a realistic portrayal of the "driver" social style?

AUDIENCE OBSERVER 1:
No, I don't believe a driver would waste so much time with "small talk."

INSTRUCTOR: Well, what do you think the seller-driver would be saying in the opening sentences?

AUDIENCE OBSERVER 1:
Something more like this: "Mr. Johnson, thank you for meeting with me today. I am eager to share with you our new service that will provide the following benefits to your firm..."

INSTRUCTOR (Speaking to "seller-driver" role player):
What do you think of that suggestion? How do you think your portrayal was coming across to the audience?

SELLER (Driver):
I can see a difference... my first try probably sounded more like an AMIABLE... too much small talk and getting to know you stuff... a DRIVER would be more direct... get down to it.

INSTRUCTOR: OK, try it again.... (Asks both the seller and buyer to begin a fresh mini role play)

SELLER (Driver):
Hi Mr. Johnson. Pleasure to meet you. I am here today to present a new service that will bring you big benefits.

BUYER (Amiable):
Wow, are you already starting to sell me? We haven't even finished shaking hands yet. Can't we get to know each other a little bit first?

INSTRUCTOR:
OK... that is interesting... notice that in the first two sentences, these folks already have a bit of a clash of styles. (Notes to audience...) Novice salespeople often overlook the importance of
rapport building moments. Can you see how a relationship could be derailed quickly if you are not careful? What should be the next sentence coming from the seller-driver?

**AUDIENCE OBSERVER 2:**
I think they could say: "Mr. Johnson, my apologies for being so direct... I was just trying not to waste your time. I also want to get to know you too."

**AUDIENCE OBSERVER 3:**
I would not go so far as apologize... I would just say "Mr. Johnson, I agree... I was being a bit direct... I also would like to hear more about you and your business."

INSTRUCTOR (speaking to seller-driver role player):
OK... thanks for helping out... do you all think we have two good options here?... what would you do next?

OPTIONAL EXTENSION OF ROLE PLAY: After the group has competed its analysis of the initial role play pairing... the instructor should suggest the role play scenario be reversed. Have the seller portray the amiable style, and the buyer takes on the driver style. This will further illustrate other possible communicative conflicts that may occur within the initial "rapport building" stages of a relationship.

INSTRUCTOR summarizes (speaking to entire audience):
Can we all see the importance of being flexible and adaptable to the styles of prospective clients? Think about it... we don't want to spoil a relationship before we have a chance to get started. However, we also do not have to completely change who we are. We just need to be willing to meet the other person "half-way." After all, in this scenario, the seller is a guest in the prospective client's space. When you are a guest in another person's "house", don't you usually try to adjust to their ways?

**REFLECTIONS ON INFORMAL STAY-IN-SEAT ROLE PLAY**
The preceding example role play interaction illustrates how the classroom learning dialogue emerges in a spontaneous and extemporaneous manner. First, the instructor "sets the stage" for subsequent dialogue with a discussion of relevant concepts along with a simple, narrowly-focused selling scenario. But then, each student is free to volunteer to engage in the role play. The selected "actors" co-create selected moments of a simulated selling situation. Therefore, not only are the role players in this learning module thinking "in the moment" about ways that they would behave in a similar circumstance, they also are spontaneously translating their cognitive imaginings about abstract selling concepts into actual physical activities. Likewise, some audience members are motivated (either intrinsically or via prodding questions from the instructor) to help co-create the role play action. They freely offer suggestions based on their own beliefs and analysis about what they are hearing and observing. These extemporaneous co-creation activities require active listening skills. And, spontaneous enactments require
students to practice "thinking on their feet" (or in their seats) to reflect quickly, and then immediately act and react. So, participants are practicing valuable skills toward enacting effective face-to-face attempts to influence others.

The act of co-creation of a role play places the temporal framework (Martin, 1982) of the group's actions and reflections on an ever-present "now." What would you do now? What would you do next? This co-creation approach helps the classroom environment become alive and dynamic. We are always able to find students willing to serve as "actors" in the role play, while others display an eagerness to contribute to the feedback process. And, these voluntary participations are more consistently energized, sincere and genuine as opposed to the often stilted enactments and superficial feedback typically received in our formal, front-of-room role plays. For example, in the aforementioned example role play, notice how audience members freely provided actual, helpful feedback to their peers. They avoid vague, inhibited and superficial feedback such as: "I thought you did great." Instead, they offer actual advisements to peers regarding how to improve specific elements of the role play. And, the entire group is able to reflect on WHY the advisements may be useful. They begin to more deeply examine WHY selected sales behaviors may be more advantageous than others in certain situations. And, they appear to have fun doing so.

Our implementation of a collaborative approach toward role play co-creation, co-analysis, spontaneous feedback and quick alternations for reenactments has brought a positive change in our classroom learning environment. In comparison to our previous formal, front-of-the-room role plays, students no longer feel they are "on display" in the proverbial "fish bowl" for audience members to observe and judge. Admittedly, many of these same judgments are being shared with actors using the informal, stay-in-seat approach. However, students appear more willing to supply genuine, concrete criticisms. And, the actors appear to be more accepting of critical comments that are made within the context of a collaborative and assisting mode of group discussion. Furthermore, since no formal grades are at stake, there is little motivation for students to become overly defensive. Instead, the few arguments that may occur usually are limited to audience members who are endorsing their respective suggested improvements to a selected moment in a role play enactment. As one student stated:

"It feels more like we are working together to solve a puzzle instead of judging people."

So, the instructor no longer serves as the main purveyor of criticisms as is typically done within a formal, front-of-room role play pedagogy. Instead, he presents short, simple scenarios... supplies meaningful context and relevant concepts... and facilitates shared role play and reflective dialog. Audience members serve as collaborators. Role players no longer feel they are being judged, but rather, are working together to find a solution to an interesting problem. Furthermore, we consider this approach to be an excellent way to model relationship building as an important element of professional selling practice.
Still, the informal, stay-in-seat approach is not a panacea. There are drawbacks. For example, a short, narrowly focused role-play obviously does not facilitate a more comprehensive view of the entire selling process. So, instructors will recognize the need to spend time helping students consider each role play activity within the context of a larger view of professional selling. Also, not every audience member will participate. Some audience members will choose to refrain from engaging in the class learning dialogues. So, instructors should employ their usual strategies toward helping non-participating members maintain attention and not "tune out." Non-participation creates an additional problem for skills assessment. The informal, stay-in-seat approach does not allow an instructor to ascertain the applied skill level of non-participants. If an individual does not volunteer for role playing, nor openly participates in the group's shared critical reviews by supplying suggestions for improvements, then, there is no overt evidence of learning. So, instructors who are required to verify particular student skills will need to either have everyone "take a turn" at role playing, or else, augment the informal role play with an additional assessment exercise. In sum, it takes some effort and energy for an instructor not only to facilitate a spontaneous role play, but also to encourage audience members to assist the performers in co-creating and analyzing their enactments. On the other hand, the instructor also must remain vigilant against having a few overzealous audience members "hijack" the learning dialogue. Therefore, we offer the familiar advisement for instructors to include a wide variety of audience members in the shared learning activities.

To further assist interested readers in comparing the informal, stay-in-seat approach versus the classic formal, front-of-room approach to role playing, we have assembled a table (see Table 1 in the Appendix) which offers a convenient contrast of various benefits and drawbacks of the two approaches. The table provides a bullet point listing of salient decision factors for instructors considering employing either role play approach within their own learning environment.

CONCLUSION / IMPLICATIONS

This article outlines many of the reasons that participants are either uncomfortable or displeased with formal, front-of-room selling role plays. We have detailed an alternative approach to role play that addresses many of their concerns. We found pedagogy that centers on the design of short learning modules that employ an informal, stay-in-seat approach to role play has been received positively by many students in our academic introductory selling courses. We believe that many organizational trainees who possess anxieties similar to some of our students regarding the front-of-room approach to role play also would find some relief by using the alternative, informal stay-in-seat methodology.

However, let us be clear that we are not suggesting that instructors need to make a choice between the two approaches to role play. Instead, we suggest that the two role play pedagogies are complementary. The informal stay-in-seat approach can augment the formal front-of-room role plays. For example, whereas short informal role plays can be used to introduce students to selected selling topics and behaviors, the longer formal role plays can
help students integrate the smaller bits of selling concepts and behaviors into a more complex and comprehensive selling process.

We suggest that informal, stay-in-seat role plays are ideal for providing comfortable opportunities for participants to practice skill building BEFORE having their skills assessed formally by a required front-of-class performance. Short informal role plays allow students and audience members to freely co-create and co-critique each selling situation in a spontaneous way. The spontaneous dialogue is a good approximation of the speed at which an actual selling conversation would unfold. Together, the learning group collaborates to practice their selling behaviors and their cognitive reflections. By placing the role playing and feedback discussions in the context of co-creation and collaboration, actors can minimize their anxiety about having their performance put on display to be assessed and judged. So, short informal role plays can allow participants to build preliminary experience and confidence prior to engaging in more expansive formal role plays that require the actor to display advanced cognitive and behavioral integrations across a comprehensive selling scenario.

Again, while we are praising the positive aspects of the short, informal role play, we are not suggesting the abandonment of the long-form, formal sales role play. Just because students are uncomfortable with a particular pedagogy does not mean that they should avoid engaging in that valuable learning activity. In fact, it is obvious that novice salespeople and academic sales course participants should be exposed to the pressure and anxiety of being observed and judged by others. Social scrutiny is an innate element of professional selling. The long-form front-of-class role play which requires a paring of seller and buyer enact an entire simulated sales dialogue remains the "gold standard" pedagogy for having novice sales students practice integrating a plethora of complex social interactions within an extended selling scenario.

We will share an eloquent audience comment posted on Sharlyn Lauby's (2010) weblog for Human Resources professionals after she posted an entry in which she proclaimed "nobody likes role playing." The comment reminds us that while many students can successfully model selling behaviors in short targeted role plays; some of those same participants may have difficulty applying what they have learned in a more pressurized performance environment:

"Role plays are not popular with students, and because of that fact trainers often down play their importance. This is often to make the trainer feel better or feel better liked. Students can grasp concepts and ideas from discussions and case studies and can tell you what they SHOULD do. However, many people cannot make the jump of the concept to the ACTUAL performance of skill until they are asked to do it. One cannot build competencies like negotiation, communication, or interpersonal skills from case studies alone. Role playing forces the learner to articulate exactly what they would say to demonstrate the skill. This is hard for most people, but once they do the activity, however painful it is, they benefit from the experience."
In sum, long-form, front-of-room enactments of comprehensive selling scenarios are excellent for helping novices integrate what they have learnt from their short-form role plays into a more complex understanding of the entire selling process. On the other hand, short, stay-in-seat role plays that informally enact selected portions of a sales scenario are ideal for introducing novices to selected, narrowly targeted elements of the selling process. We have offered interested instructors an outline of various rewards and pitfalls of each respective role play approach, and our reflections on the positive audience response that may be received from implementing short, informal, stay-in-seat role plays within their course designs.

REFERENCES


APPENDIX
Table 1: Comparison of Two Approaches To Sales Role Play

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FORMAL (Front of Room)</th>
<th>BENEFITS:</th>
<th>INFORMAL (Remain in Seat)</th>
<th>BENEFITS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ More realistic representation of entire professional dialogue process</td>
<td>▪ Entire class is invited to create the dialogue (rather than just two performers in front of class with remainder of class in detached observance)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Requires forethought / planning / analysis</td>
<td>▪ Many students appear more willing to participate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ More complex, extended dialogues</td>
<td>▪ Less self-conscious to talk from their seat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Demands development of extended focus</td>
<td>▪ Less stilted... avoids pre-rehearsed dialogue</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Requires performer to rehearse a more comprehensive set of selling behaviors</td>
<td>▪ Practice thinking-on-their-feet (in their seat)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Video performance facilitates detailed review</td>
<td>▪ Spontaneous dialogue &quot;in-the-moment&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Video &quot;instant replay&quot; allows audience to examine specific moments in the simulated dialogue</td>
<td>▪ Avoids tedious video replay / extended reviews of complex, long-form performances</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Instructor can reflect deeply upon a multiple array of skills displayed by each performer</td>
<td>▪ Audience can focus on a selected aspect of sales</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Performers can receive video for self-review</td>
<td>▪ Sales questions and speaking points can be examined, changed and evolve in real time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Video can be utilized as part of digital resume to show prospective employers</td>
<td>▪ Collaborative judgment rather than &quot;singled-out&quot; and put on display as performer in the &quot;fish bowl&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Some appear more accepting of informal criticism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Students feel supported in their challenge rather than feel anxious as their performance is belittled</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Requires real-time listening skills to support immediate reflection and analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Students practice real-time listening skills that are needed in actual selling events</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRAWBACKS:</td>
<td>DRAWBACKS:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stilted, pre-rehearsed conversations</td>
<td>Does not facilitate comprehensive view of entire selling process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read or memorize scripts rather than spontaneous thinking-on-your-feet</td>
<td>Not everyone will participate...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students resist immediate criticism</td>
<td>many audience members choose to refrain from the class dialogue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peers reluctant to critique... because they are next</td>
<td>Non-participating audience members must maintain focus and not &quot;tune out&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peers may not yet be knowledgeable enough to offer valuable critique</td>
<td>Takes effort and energy from instructor to instigate and facilitate a selling dialogue and invite other audience members to assist the performers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructor required to do majority share of critiques</td>
<td>Instructor must ensure overzealous audience members do not &quot;hijack&quot; the learning dialogue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peers come to the rescue of their peer performer under &quot;attack&quot; by the critiquing instructor</td>
<td>Instructor cannot ascertain applied skill level of non-participants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consternation in the classroom environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performer argues to try to improve grade</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebuts to protect ego rather than listening to learn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE INTERPLAY BETWEEN COMPETITIVE DRIVERS, OUTSOURCING AND SUPPLY CHAIN PERFORMANCE: THE CASE OF MIDDLE EAST SUPPLY CHAINS

Mario Ferrer V., Ricardo Santa, and Sara Ahmed Almadani
Alfaisal University, Saudi Arabia

ABSTRACT

In order to survive and grow, Saudi Arabian supply chain operatives must be able to manage the dynamic market variables and meet their customers’ demand by performing more effectively than their competitors. Competitive advantage can be attained by excelling at cost management, quality, speed, flexibility, reliability, innovativeness (Boyer and Lewis, 2002) and skilled workforce. Skills and capabilities are being tested in Saudi Arabia by higher volumes of business operations and increased diversity from oil-based activities. It appears that there is a heavy reliance by supply chain operatives on DIY strategies, which not only goes against the international trend, but also appears to be negatively impacting on service levels, competitive advantage and profitability. Therefore, this study attempts to gain information about these factors through observable variables and examines the influence of differing competitive drivers and outsourcing capabilities on the ability of a supply chain to excel in performance.

Keywords: Supply Chain, Reliability, Quality, 3PL, Performance.

INTRODUCTION

Saudi Arabian supply chain operatives are facing escalating challenges from both local and international competitors. Saudi supply chain operatives have been prompted to manage the dynamic market variables and meet their customers’ demand by performing more effectively than their competitors (Al Falah, Zairi and Moneim, 2003). Current research looks at particular arrangements and practices to provide better advice on how these operatives should cope with marketplace challenges. Alternative ways to leverage supply chain operatives' ability to compete often include a capacity to develop relationship portfolios, a focus on core business, outsourcing non-core business activities to third party logistics service providers (3PL), and excelling in key competitive priorities to boost performance.
The concept of competitive priorities was initially studied by Skinner (1974) who posited that an organization cannot perform and excel in all dimensions and has to define priorities. Competitive advantage can be attained by excelling at cost management, quality, speed, flexibility, reliability, innovativeness (Boyer and Lewis, 2002) and skilled workforce. Skills and capabilities are being tested in Saudi Arabia by higher volumes of business operations and increased diversity from oil-based activities. A recent report suggests that a significant number of Saudi Arabian supply chain operatives have experienced low-levels of success when implementing their supply chain operations in-house, mainly due to limitations in relevant skills and capabilities of the workforce. It appears that there is a heavy reliance by supply chain operatives on DIY strategies, which not only goes against the international trend, but also appears to be negatively impacting on service levels, competitive advantage and profitability.

Several studies conducted in developed economies assert that economic, social and cultural variables of each economy impact on the relationship between supply chain drivers, practices and performance. Thus, empirical research in settings such as emerging economies (e.g. the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia) is needed to generalize the suggested relationship. The question, ‘Do competitive drivers and outsourcing 3PL positively impact the supply chain?’ will be answered.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

A firm’s emphasis on building key capabilities has been a common theme in the supply chain management literature. The term competitive drivers have been often used to describe companies’ choice of competitive capabilities (Boer and Gertesen, 2003). Other terms have been used to describe the same concept. For instance, manufacturing tasks (Skinner, 1969), external performance measures and dimensions of competition (Fitsimmons, Kouvelis and Malick, 1991). Despite the differences in terminology, there is a broad agreement that competitive drivers can be generally expressed as the strategic business objectives and goals of the manufacturing organization (Koufteros et al., 2002). Competitive drivers can be expressed in terms of low cost, flexibility, quality, delivery speed and reliability. These competitive drivers are closely related to the notion of generic strategies from the business strategy theory. A firm’s competitive drivers may lead to the development of a supporting set of competencies and capabilities (Koufteros et al., 2002). The focus of this study is to evaluate how reliability and quality influence the outsourcing decisions and how they impact on supply chain performance.

**Reliability**

Reliability is a fundamental attribute closely related to perfect order fulfillment. Reliable and efficient materials supply involves having the right items, in the right quantity available at the right place at the right time at the expected cost (Jonsson, 2008). Chou (2004) asserts that reliability encompasses consistency of performance over time and includes measures such as the mean time of first failure, then mean time between failures, and the failure rate per unit time. This definition is based on the comparison in three groups of dimensions with similar
characteristics for supply chain performance measurement in the retail industry: i) Customer services, ii) Operation efficiency, and iii) Cost/Assets. The reliability of a supply chain is very important for its effective operation. Supply chain, as an “expanded” enterprise, relies for its operation on each member’s reliable work. Supply chain reliability often focuses on delivery reliability of the supplier, and inventory reliability. Proper supplier selection and management can be important in reducing uncertainty in mitigating supply chain issues such as unexpected supply disruption, incorrect shipment quantity, and transportation delays which can lead to undesired stockout situations (Hendricks and Singhal, 2005). For example, in situations where there is scarce supply of products or capacity, a supplier’s allocation decision will affect his ability to meet an individual retailer’s order, which in turn contributes to the retailer’s uncertain supply. Understanding the adverse impact of unreliable supply on profitability helps a retailer select a more reliable supplier or provide proper incentives to the supplier in negotiating for an adequate allocation of scarce products. Reliable supply is especially important for products with a relatively short selling season such as fashion and high-tech products with short life-cycles and promotional products. For fashion goods, misplaced stock or late shipments that show up after the selling season are of little value due to the perishable nature of the goods. For promotional products, missing the promotional time window means that it will be harder to push these products to consumers. (Liard and Shah, 2007). Moreover, inventory reliability is an important factor in the management of inventory and warehouse systems. This knowledge provides the manager with a tool to estimate the efficiency of the information system and discover any defects. It can also be effectively used for the purposes of comparing different terms, units, or warehouses against each other. The manager can use the findings in order to analyze the proficiency of the system. Inventory reliability is critical in make-to-stock environments where the filling rate is used as the measure of the customer service.

Quality

Quality has always been one of the most important performance criteria, even with a conventional supplier management strategy. Dickson (2006) showed that the ability to meet quality is one of the three most critical determinants in choosing suppliers. Bessant et al. (2001) pointed out that buyer-supplier relationships that were once based on price have shifted to a number of non-price factors, with quality in first position. The goodness of both supplier’s and manufacturer’s quality systems can be determinant in order to deliver quality products/services to final customers. Indeed, an organization may have the best internal quality system but, without high-quality, defect-free raw materials, the process will be flawed. Recalls are costing businesses billions of dollars annually, and manufacturers can no longer afford to speculate with quality control. When manufacturers rely so heavily on the supply chain to deliver quality materials, measuring and controlling these products in real-time, before they are purchased and shipped, becomes imperative.

As the supply chain is playing an increasingly prominent role in business vitality, manufacturers have been incorporating supplier rating systems that provide greater transparency into their quality records. While some organizations rely strictly upon supplier certificates of analysis (COA’s) or some internal supplier rating score to manage their suppliers, there is often a
discrepancy with the actual findings at incoming inspection. While incoming inspections can usually detect problems before additional steps occur, they are time-consuming, costly, and performed after-the-fact. A much more efficient way of managing supplier quality is to do so while the products are being manufactured on the supplier’s plant floor. Using collaborative technology to facilitate the communication and share data in real-time, manufacturers and their suppliers can work together to ensure that the products meet specifications prior to being purchased and delivered. Additionally, when working with multiple suppliers of the same product, manufacturers who have access to supplier quality data can evaluate the various vendors and can scientifically determine the highest quality suppliers.

Outsourcing

Outsourcing the operations of an organization benefits the firm in performance objectives such as cost, quality, and service improvement. There are major benefits in outsourcing processes such as production, logistics, product design, and procurement processes. Initially firms tend to outsource non-core activities, nowadays it has changed and there are core operations that are outsourced. Lin et al (2010) propose a multi criteria method for vendor selection in order to deal with the complexity of diverse factors as quality, agility and cost. Their hybrid method is successfully evaluated in a case study of a Taiwan semiconductor company.

Third Party logistic (3PL) companies are recognized by their expertise and experience in handling operations with agility, high quality and efficiency. Quality is a critical variable in 3PL selection because they face companies’ main customers.

Kakabadse and Kakabadse (2003) discuss that outsourcing has increased its importance. This practice in the past was part of a tactical exercise but has evolved to become a strategic component of business strategy. The study identifies 5 outsourcing drivers that are related to firm competition priorities: cost, time, innovativeness, quality, and flexibility. Research concludes that supply chain performance will increase with outsourcing but there is higher performance if there is congruence between the firm’s competitive priorities and the drivers used during the service provider selection. A key implication is that though managers traditionally decide to hire service providers mainly based on costs they will be able to work with higher cost service providers if they are aligned with company competitive strategy.

Gotzamani et al. (2010) investigate the outsourcing of logistics services and the decision to select 3PL based on quality and financial performance. This research implemented a survey to a sample of 66 manufacturing and 3PL companies in Greece. It evaluated the managerial quality tools implemented by 3PLs during their operations and the study concludes that logistic service providers have better quality culture and levels in comparison with manufacturing companies. It also demonstrated a significant positive relation between financial performance and quality performance in 3PL providers.

Supply chain performance
Supply chain operatives measure performance of their business for a myriad of reasons such as reporting the health of the firm to stakeholders, starting improvement activities to outperform competitors, and understanding customers’ reading of the services and products offered by the firm. The literature acknowledged two decades ago that traditional financial measures such as return on investment (ROI) and return on assets (ROA) were not enough to inform continuous improvement and innovation efforts because of the past historical data focus and their inability to reflect contemporary value-creating actions (Kaplan and Norton, 1992). Researchers have since developed measurement systems that account for non-financial metrics, such as response time to customer query, capacity utilization, inventory carrying costs and transportation costs) and lead-time performance (Bhagwat and Sharma, 2007). Kroes (2012), maintain that outsourcing will increase the supply chain performance. However, Kroes (2012) also stressed that there is higher performance if congruence exists between the firm’s competitive priorities and the drivers used during the service provider selection. Some of the implications of this approach are that managers need to align the outsourcing with the company’s competitive strategy instead of deciding to hire services based mainly on cost. In this way organizations might work with higher cost service providers as long they are meeting competitive strategic standards.

Therefore, this study attempts to gain information about these factors through observable variables and examines the influence of differing competitive drivers and outsourcing capabilities on the ability of a supply chain to excel in performance. Consequently, three hypotheses are tested as follows:

H1: There is a direct impact of competitive drivers (reliability & quality) on supply chain performance
H2: There is a direct impact of competitive drivers (reliability & quality) on 3PL outsourcing decisions
H3: There is a direct impact of 3PL outsourcing on supply chain performance

METHODOLOGY

In order to test the proposed hypotheses in the selected research setting - Saudi Arabian supply chain operatives - a questionnaire was sent to a sample of 500 multi-sectoral firms, selected from the population of Saudi Arabian organizations. The sample represents supply chain operatives with more than 50 employees from mostly privately dominated branches in Saudi Arabia that were retrieved from the top 1,000 Saudi companies list. Of the supply chain operatives that took part in the survey, 322 responded, which makes the response rate 64.4 percent. The research aimed to identify the criticality of competitive priorities, the importance of inhibiting factors in outsourcing, and the supply chain and business achievements. The survey also investigated the awareness of relationship types and practices as essential for the firm function in supply chains at present. 

Returned surveys were coded and entered into the SPSS statistical software package (version 19) to organize and analyze the data. Analysis then progressed in two stages, firstly,
The Interplay Between Competitive Drivers, Outsourcing And Supply Chain Performance: The Case of Middle East Supply Chains

descriptive data using non-parametric techniques (including the chi-square test for relatedness) was undertaken to determine whether any of the categorical variables were related and to provide a profile of the respondents across the three firms. This included business longevity, annual turnover, and demographic considerations, such as age, gender, highest qualification, and employment industry. These tests enhance understanding of the sample through examination of the distributions of behavioural and demographic variables.

SPSS was also used to test the reliability of the scales. Cronbach’s (1951) Alpha values for the scales were higher than 0.7 which is the acceptable threshold (Hair et al., 2010). In addition, the scales were factor analyzed to examine unidimensionality. The scales’ items loaded onto one factor only. This suggested that the scales measures exhibit unidimensionality.

Second, Amos (version 18) was used to obtain the property of the measures. The fit indices for the scales’ regression model as indicated by the CFI, TLI and RMSEA were acceptable and confirmed unidimensionality of each scale. The standardized loadings and the R-square obtained for each item were examined to further test the reliability of the scale via CFA. The standardized loading values of most of the scales’ items were higher than 0.5. Similarly, and R-square values were higher than 0.2, demonstrating high reliability of the scales. With the scales refined and the measurement models well structured, further testing can be done. SEM was used to analyze if there is a predictive relationship between one independent variable and a criterion dependent variable (Ho, 2006). SEM is a multivariate statistical technique used to examine the relationship between a dependent variable and several predictors (Hair et al., 2010). Hair et al. (2010) stated that SME analysis provides a means of objectively assessing the magnitude and direction of each predictor’s relationship to its dependent variable. Three hypotheses put forward in the literature review section were tested using the SEM model which were generated at the p<0.05 level.

RESULTS DISCUSSION

As the main purpose of the study was to examine the relationship between competitive drivers (reliability and quality) and outsourcing and their influence on supply chain performance, the next step in the data analysis was to perform a confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). Confirmatory factor analysis was chosen instead of other classical validation techniques such as exploratory factor analysis (EFA) as EFA has a number of significant shortcomings. Among other issues, EFA can produce distorted factor loadings and incorrect conclusions regarding the number of factors. Also the solution obtained is only one of an infinite number of solutions (Segars and Grover, 1993).

Confirmatory factor analysis was used to study the relationships between the set of observed variables and the set of continuous latent variables. The overall fit of a measurement model is determined by a CFA (Cooksey, 2007; Hair et al., 2010). In the CFA, all factor loadings are freed (i.e. estimated), items are allowed to load on only one construct (i.e. no cross loading), and latent constructs are allowed to correlate (equivalent to oblique rotation in exploratory factor analysis). The input covariance matrix generated from the model’s 12 measurement
variables contains 45 sample moments. There are six regression weights, three covariances and 12 variances, for a total of 21 parameters to be estimated. The model therefore has 24 degrees of freedom. The chi-square goodness-of-fit test shows that the model did not fit the data well, $X^2 (N = 138, df = 24) = 80.29$, $p < .05$. Although the model did not fit well by the chi-square test, the baseline comparisons fit indices of the NFI, RFI, IFI, TLI and CFI are close to or exceed 0.90 (Table1). This suggests that the hypothesised model fits the observed variance-covariance matrix well relative to null or independence model. The only possible improvement in fit for these two models ranges from 0.053 to 0.109.

**Table 1: Baseline Comparison Indexes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>NFI Delta1</th>
<th>RFI rho1</th>
<th>IFI Delta2</th>
<th>TLI rho2</th>
<th>CFI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Default model</td>
<td>.937</td>
<td>.911</td>
<td>.958</td>
<td>.931</td>
<td>.957</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saturated model</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence model</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The estimates were analysed for the measurement model. The unstandardised regression weights were all significant by the critical ratio test ($> 1.96$, $p < .05$). The standardised regression weights range from 0.918 to 0.943. These values indicate that the nine measurement variables are significantly represented by their respective latent constructs. Explained variances (Squared Multiple Correlations) and residual variances for correlations ranged from 0.616 to 0.915. The residual (unexplained) variances were from 8.5% to 39.4%.

The study now turns to examining the hypothesised structure model. The chi-square value for the models (Figure 1) was $X^2 (N = 138, df = 24) = 80.29$, $p < .05$. The chi-square per degree of freedom was 3.34. The baseline comparisons fit indices of NFI, RFI, IFI, TLI and CFI for the model were close to the suggested cut off value 0.90. This suggests that the hypothesised model fit the observed variance-covariance matrix reasonably well relative to null or independence model.
Regression weights (Table 2), Standardised regression weights, and Squared Multiple Correlations: Of the coefficients associated with the paths linking the model’s exogenous and endogenous variables, four are significant by the critical ratio test (± 1.96, p < .05). Support was found for the three hypotheses. These significance levels show that there is a relationship between competitive priorities, 3PL outsourcing and supply chain performance. The significance levels support hypothesis 2, that an alignment between competitive drivers and 3PL outsourcing is necessary to improve supply chain performance. The impact of competitive drivers and 3PL outsourcing are related directly and significantly to the improved supply chain performance. The greater the perception on the increase of competitive drivers the greater the improved supply chain performance (b = 0.66). Likewise, the greater the perception on the increase need of outsourcing 3PL the greater the improved operational performance (b = 0.54).

Table 1: Regression Weights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>Label</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S.chain performance &lt;-- Competitive Drivers</td>
<td>.658</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.chain performance &lt;-- Outsourcing 3PL</td>
<td>.544</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I1 &lt;-- Outsourcing 3PL</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I2 &lt;-- Outsourcing 3PL</td>
<td>1.360</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I3 &lt;-- Outsourcing 3PL</td>
<td>1.426</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table</td>
<td>Estimate</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Label</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>.937</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3</td>
<td>.937</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IO2</td>
<td>1.169</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IO3</td>
<td>1.144</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>par_6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IO1</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The unidirectional arrows (without origin) pointing to the latent factor of improved supply chain performance represent unexplained (residual) variance for this factor. Thus, using the squared multiple correlation table, 21.2% of the variation in improved operational performance is unexplained. Alternatively, 79.8% of the variance is accounted for by the joint influence of the competitive drivers and 3PL outsourcing decisions. This finding confirms that it is not possible for the studied organisations to gain supply chain performance improvements without considering the competitive drivers obtained through 3PL outsourcing.

**CONCLUSIONS**

The research question ‘Does competitive drivers and outsourcing 3PL positively impact the supply chain?’ has been confirmed by this study. This research also found that the three drivers stemming from competitive drivers, quality, inventory reliability and supplier reliability, and the three dimensions stemming from outsourcing 3PL, lack of skilled workers, flexibility and costs, are important when trying to achieve improvements in supply chain performance. It is expected that giving priority to these dimensions in the outsourcing 3PL decision-making process will assist organizations to enhance supply chain performance.

The three competitive priorities - quality, inventory reliability and supplier reliability - identified in the CFA analysis of this study demonstrated that in the quest for improved supply chain performance through the outsourcing of 3PL, it is essential that these 3PL encourage the delivery of value-adding products or services of exceptional quality, with flexibility and at a competitive cost, as stated by Slack et al. (2009).

In testing hypothesis 1, this research has demonstrated that the linkages between competitive drivers and supply chain performance are strongly and significantly correlated. In our opinion, the high positive correlations of competitive drivers and supply chain performance are strongly and significantly correlated provide strong empirical support to include the stated competitive drivers dimensions in the measurement of improved supply chain performance. Furthermore, these specific dimensions will assist organizations to more accurately measure the impact of the 3PL outsourcing on the supply chain performance. Likewise, in testing hypothesis 2, the SEM results demonstrated that there is a predictive relationship between outsourcing 3PL and
supply chain performance. This predictive relationship will lead supply chain operatives to improve their performance and gain a competitive advantage. In addition, for academics this predictive relationship is important because the literature has not discussed it in a comprehensive way.

This research addressed issues that are currently problematic to many Saudi supply chain operatives. Similarly, the work addressed the links between key competitive drivers, outsourcing 3PL dimensions and supply chain management improvement. Therefore supply chain operatives must be more conscious about the practical implications of undertaking in-house logistics activities on the overall performance of their supply chain.

Our results confirmed that supply chain operatives that need to boost supply chain performance will outsource 3PL that are able to provide flexible services at the right costs with efficient value adding talented workers.

REFERENCES


Call for Article Submissions
International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership

The International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership (IJAISL) seeks submissions of original articles on current topics of special interest to practitioners and academics. Research or application oriented articles that describe accounting, leadership, business education, finance, general business, management, pedagogy, educational facilities issues, or professional/personal development will be considered for publication in the journal. Analyses relying on organizational size, statistical financial performance, and various operationalizations of leadership composition, will present evidence of methodical control structure and demonstrate consistency in results.

All articles are refereed by a rigorous evaluation process involving at least three blind reviews by qualified academic, industrial, or governmental professionals. Submissions will be judged not only on the suitability of the content, but also on the intellectual framework and significance to society in general. All papers are peer reviewed.

The Executive Editorial Board (EEB) of the International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership (IJAISL) strongly encourages authors to submit their article(s) to an IIC conference prior to Journal consideration. Author’s who submit their articles to an IIC conference receive the benefit of feedback from the IIC Reviewers’ Task Panel (RTP) and conference attendees. This feedback generally improves the quality of submissions to the International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership (IJAISL). Articles that are accepted for presentation at an IIC conference have a higher likelihood of being published in IJAISL.

IJAISL solicits only original contributions that have not been previously published or submitted elsewhere, with the exception of a submission to IIC refereed conference proceedings. Note! IIC refereed proceedings are a partial fulfillment of Intellectbase International Journals. Papers awaiting presentation or already presented at IIC conferences must be revised (ideally, taking advantage of feedback obtained at the conference) and have a slightly modified title to be considered for journal inclusion. All manuscripts selected for publication must maintain a high standard of content, style and value to the readership. An important criterion for acceptance of a manuscript for publication is the relevance of the work to the global accounting and leadership field and its potential usefulness for advancing the quality of accounting and leadership practices.

IJAISL REVIEW PROCESS
The author submits his/her paper electronically and the paper is sent to the Managing Editor. A confirmation of receipt will be e-mailed to the author(s), usually within 2 days of your submission. The Managing Editor assigns the paper an ID number, removes author(s) names and affiliations, and sends the paper to reviewers. Reviewers usually have 2 weeks to perform the review; however, on occasions the reviewer may take up to 4 weeks to complete a review. Once review comments are returned, the Managing Editor puts them together and provides the original paper and the reviews to the Editor-in-Chief. The Editor-in-Chief, based on the comments of the reviewers and his reading of the manuscript, forms an overall recommendation regarding publication. On occasion, the Editor-in-Chief will consult the Senior Advisory Board and if necessary, request that an additional review be performed. Once the Editor-in-Chief has formed an opinion on the acceptability of the paper, an email will be sent to the corresponding author of the outcome of the review process. The full review process currently takes anywhere from 1-4 weeks from receipt of manuscript.

SUBMISSION INSTRUCTIONS
IJAISL only accepts electronic submissions of manuscripts. To submit a manuscript for the review process, you should send an email with the paper as an attachment to ijaisl@intellectbase.org*. In the body of your email message include the author(s) name(s), contact information for the corresponding author, and the title of your submission. Your submission will be acknowledged via return email. All submissions must be in English and in Word format.
Intellectbase International Consortium prioritizes papers that are selected from Intellectbase conference proceedings for Journal publication. Papers that have been published in the conference proceedings, do not incur a fee for Journal publication. However, papers that are submitted directly to be considered for Journal publication will incur a $195 fee to help cover the cost of formatting, printing, processing, archiving, indexing & listing, postage & handling if accepted.

Page 1 of your submission should contain the title of the paper and should identify all authors, including authors’ names, mailing addresses, and email addresses. Authors’ names should not appear anywhere else in the manuscript, except possibly as part of the reference list. Author details should be followed by an Abstract of 200-500 words. Following the Abstract, Key Words should be identified and the Key Words are followed by the text of the paper.

The manuscript must be single-spaced, contain a single column, utilize 11 point Arial Narrow justified font, and contain 1” margins on all sides.

**TITLE**

Centered across the top of the first page, 16 point Arial Narrow bold font, all letters capitalized.

**MAJOR HEADINGS**

14 point Arial Narrow bold font, left aligned, all letters capitalized.

**First Level Sub-Headings**

13 point Arial Narrow bold font, left aligned, capitalize each word.

**Second level sub-headings**

12 point Arial Narrow bold italic font, left aligned, capitalize each word.

**Third level sub-headings**

12 point Arial Narrow italic font, left aligned, first word capitalized.

No blank line is to appear between a sub-heading and the text. Tables and figures should be included in the text, approximately where the author thinks that they should appear. Manuscripts must be edited for spelling and grammar.

Reference citation ordering and format must follow Harvard (or APA) Style referencing. Reference entries should be ordered alphabetically (in text and Reference section) according to authors’ or editors’ last names, or the title of the work for items with no author or editor listed. Any reference contained in the text must be included in the Reference section and vice versa.

References in the text should be of the format: (Harris et al., 1995; Johnson, 1996). Quotes from a source should include the page number (Johnson, 1996, pp. 223). References must be complete.

The paper should not normally exceed 15 single-spaced pages, including all sections, figures, tables, etc. However, the Editor-in-Chief reserves the right to consider longer articles of major significance.

Electronic submissions should be sent to IJAISSL@intellectbase.org*. Please visit the Intellectbase International Consortium website: www.intellectbase.org for further information.

* By submitting a paper, authors implicitly assign Intellectbase the copyright license to publish and agree that at least one (if more authors) will order a copy of the journal.
CALL FOR ACADEMIC PAPERS AND PARTICIPATION
Intellectbase International Consortium Academic Conferences

TEXAS – USA April
Nashville, TN – USA May
Atlanta, GA – USA October
Las Vegas, NV – USA December
International Locations Spring and Summer

Abstracts, Research-in-Progress, Full Papers, Workshops, Case Studies and Posters are invited!!

All Conceptual and Empirical Papers are very welcome.

Email all papers to: reviewers@intellectbase.org†

Intellectbase International Consortium provides an open discussion forum for Academics, Researchers, Engineers and Practitioners from a wide range of disciplines including, but not limited to the following: Business, Education, Science, Technology, Music, Arts, Political, Social - BESTMAPS.

† By submitting a paper, authors implicitly assign Intellectbase the copyright license to publish and agree that at least one (if more authors) will register, attend and participate at the conference to present the paper.

All submitted papers are peer reviewed by the Reviewers Task Panel (RTP) and accepted papers are published in a refereed conference proceeding. Articles that are recommended to the Executive Editorial Board (EEB) have a high chance of being published in one of the Intellectbase double-blind reviewed Journals. For Intellectbase Journals and publications, please visit: www.intellectbase.org/Journals.php

All submitted papers must include a cover page stating the following: location of the conference, date, each author(s) name, phone, e-mail, full affiliation, a 200 - 500 word Abstract and Keywords. Please send your submission in Microsoft Word format.

For more information concerning conferences and Journal publications, please visit the Intellectbase website at www.intellectbase.org. For any questions, please do not hesitate to contact the Conference Chair at chair@intellectbase.org
REGISTRATION GUIDELINES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Registration Type</th>
<th>Fee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early Registration</td>
<td>$395.00^</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normal Registration</td>
<td>$450.00^</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Registration</td>
<td>$250.00^</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional Papers (No More than 3 Articles per Conference)</td>
<td>$150.00^ ea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second &amp; Subsequent Author Attendance</td>
<td>$195.00^ ea.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

^ Prices subject to change

Cancellation Policy
A 22% processing fee will be applied to all refunds. Cancellations received at least two weeks prior to conference date will be refunded 100% of registration fee (minus processing fee). Cancellations received 2-3 weeks to conference commencement are eligible for a 50% refund of the registration fee (minus processing fee). No refunds will be made within two weeks to the conference commencement. All cancellations must be in writing, include Author’s Name and Paper Title and be mailed to: Intellectbase International Consortium, 1615 Seventh Avenue North, Nashville TN 37208. Attn: Dr. David King (chair@intellectbase.org).

INTELLECTBASE DOUBLE-BLIND REVIEWED JOURNALS

Intellectbase International Consortium promotes broader intellectual resources and publishes reviewed papers from all disciplines. To achieve this, Intellectbase hosts approximately 4-6 academic conferences per year and publishes the following Double-Blind Reviewed Journals (http://www.intellectbase.org/journals.php).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal Abbreviation</th>
<th>Journal Title</th>
<th>ISSN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JAGR</td>
<td>Journal of Applied Global Research</td>
<td>1940-1833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IJAISL</td>
<td>International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership</td>
<td>1940-9524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RHESL</td>
<td>Review of Higher Education and Self-Learning</td>
<td>1940-9494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IJSHIM</td>
<td>International Journal of Social Health Information Management</td>
<td>1942-9664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMIC</td>
<td>Review of Management Innovation and Creativity</td>
<td>1934-6727</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JGIP</td>
<td>Journal of Global Intelligence and Policy</td>
<td>1942-8189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JISTP</td>
<td>Journal of Information Systems Technology and Planning</td>
<td>1945-5240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JKHRM</td>
<td>Journal of Knowledge and Human Resource Management</td>
<td>1945-5275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JIBMR</td>
<td>Journal of International Business Management &amp; Research</td>
<td>1940-185X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The US Library of Congress has assigned ISSN numbers for all formats of Intellectbase Journals - Print, Online and CD-ROM. Intellectbase Blind-Review Journals are listed in major recognized directories: e.g. Cabell’s, Ulrich’s, JournalSeek and Ebsco Library Services and other publishing directories. Intellectbase International Consortium publications are in the process to be listed in the following renowned Journal databases e.g. ABI/INFORM, ABDC, Thomson SCIENCE and SOCIAL SCIENCE Citation Indexes, etc.

Note: Intellectbase International Consortium prioritizes papers that are selected from Intellectbase conference proceedings for Journal publication. Papers that have been published in the conference proceedings, do not incur a fee for Journal publication. However, papers that are submitted directly to be considered for Journal publication will incur a US$195 fee to help cover the cost of formatting, printing, processing, archiving, indexing & listing, postage & handling if accepted. Papers submitted direct to a Journal may be emailed to JournalAbbreviation@intellectbase.org* (e.g. IJAISL@intellectbase.org*, JAGR@intellectbase.org*, etc.).

* By submitting a paper, authors implicitly assign Intellectbase the copyright license to publish and agree that at least one (if more authors) will order a copy of the journal.
International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership

Individual Subscription Request

Please enter my subscription for the International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership

Name ____________________________________________________________

Title __________________________________ Telephone ( _____ ) ____________________

Mailing Address _________________________________________________________

City________________________________ State _____________ Zip Code ________________

Country ______________________________ Fax ( _____ ) ________________________

E-mail ________________________________________________________________

Please check the appropriate categories:

Within the United States       Outside the United States

☐ Annual Individual Subscription - US$150

☐ Annual Individual Subscription - US$150

Begin the annual subscription with the: ☐ Current Issue ☐ Next Issue

☐ Single Issue - US$79

☐ Single Issue - US$85

If you are requesting a single issue, which issue (Volume, and Issue) are you requesting? ______________

Payment by check in U.S. Dollars must be included.
Make check payable to: Intellectbase International Consortium

Send this Subscription Request and a check to:

IJAISL Subscription
Intellectbase International Consortium
1615 Seventh Avenue North
Nashville, TN, 37208, USA

All e-mail enquiries should be sent to: ijaisl@intellectbase.org
Dear __________________________ (Librarian's name)

I recommend that __________________________ (Library's name) subscribe to the following publication.

☐ International Journal of Accounting Information Science and Leadership (IJAISL) ISSN: 1940-9524 (US$225 /Year)

I have indicated the benefits of the above journal to our library:
(1=highest benefit; 2=moderate benefit; 3=little benefit)

1 2 3 REFERENCE: For research articles in the field of Accounting, Information Science and Leadership.
1 2 3 STUDENT READING: I plan to recommend articles from the above to my students.
1 2 3 PUBLICATION SOURCES: This journal is suitable to my current research agenda.
1 2 3 PEER EVALUATION: This journal is highly regarded by my peers around the world.

Name ____________________________________________________________
Title ___________________________________ Telephone (_____ ) ______________________
Mailing Address _______________________________________________________

City ___________________________ State ________________ Zip Code ______________

Library Subscriptions: Within the US - US$275
Outside the US (includes air mail postage) - US$295

Payment by check in U.S. Dollars must be included.
Make check payable to: Intellectbase International Consortium

Send this Subscription Request and a check to:
IJAISL Subscription
Intellectbase International Consortium
1615 Seventh Avenue North
Nashville, TN, 37208, USA

Tel: +1 (615) 944-3931; Fax: +1 (615) 739-5124
www.intellectbase.org

All e-mail enquiries should be sent to: ijaisl@intellectbase.org